

5-2019

Losing Faith: Emily Brontë's Revolutionized Religion

Emily Renee Holmes
University of Arkansas, Fayetteville

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.uark.edu/etd>



Part of the [Literature in English, British Isles Commons](#)

Citation

Holmes, E. R. (2019). Losing Faith: Emily Brontë's Revolutionized Religion. *Graduate Theses and Dissertations* Retrieved from <https://scholarworks.uark.edu/etd/3195>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by ScholarWorks@UARK. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks@UARK. For more information, please contact scholar@uark.edu.

Losing Faith: Emily Brontë's Revolutionized Religion

A thesis submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts in English

by

Emily Holmes
Hendrix College
Bachelor of Arts in English, 2017

May 2019
University of Arkansas

This thesis is approved for recommendation to the Graduate Council.

Sean Dempsey, Ph.D.
Thesis Director

Dorothy Stephens, Ph.D.
Committee Member

Mary Beth Long, Ph.D.
Committee Member

Abstract

“Losing Faith: Emily Brontë’s Revolutionized Religion” discusses the role of religion in her novel *Wuthering Heights* and her poems set in the mythical world of Gondal. Through close readings of both her prose and poetry, this paper seeks to understand the relationship between the dark, vindictive nature of Brontë’s characters and their hopeful ending. The first chapter, Here’s The Situation, discusses the situation as set up by the novel, focusing specifically on Catherine and Heathcliff. I discuss the violence and codependence of their relationship, their Gondal predecessors, their fascination with each other as well as their torment when apart, and the hell they create for themselves, and the characters themselves. Ultimately, this chapter answers the question: Who are Cathy and Heathcliff? And how do they effect the religion I describe? The second chapter, The Mediations, discusses the environment, both within the novel and without, which shaped these characters, looking at Haworth, England, as well as the churches, nature, and secondary characters in the novel. These things serve as mediators between the couple and their Higher Power. The third and final chapter, Another Way, discusses what we’re left with at the novel’s close, examining Catherine and Hareton in the wake of the first generation’s passing. Born into a strange new world where God has already fallen, the second generation learns to live in this new world and, thereby, thrive.

©2019 by Emily Holmes
All Rights Reserved

Acknowledgments

To my parents, thank you for all your love and support throughout my entire education. Without you, I am nothing.

To Gracie Bain, Meg Boyles, Bailey Williams, Julia Secor, Brooke Nelson, and Ellen Holmes, thank you for being the best friends and support group a woman could ask for. Without you, I am a blubbering mess.

To Dr. Dempsey, Dr. Stephens, and Dr. Long, thank you from the bottom of my heart for all your advice and support over the last two years. This process has been grueling, but the end result is worth the stress.

To Barbara, it's all for you and the yard you deserve.

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Chapter One: The Situation	13
Chapter Two: The Mediations	29
Chapter Three: Another Way	43
Conclusion	54
Works Cited	60
Appendix	63

Introduction

Upon its publication in 1847, critics described Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights* as a "disagreeable story" despite its "power and cleverness" (Chorley). It contained "all the faults of [Charlotte Brontë's] *Jane Eyre*...magnified a thousand fold," and the only consolation," according to critic James Lorimer, was that *Wuthering Heights* would "never be generally read." Another anonymous review in the *Examiner* called it a "strange book" that was "not without evidences of considerable power" but overall as a whole read as "wild, confused, disjointed, and improbable," and the characters were "savages ruder" than those "who lived before the days of Homer." Other contemporary nineteenth century critics greeted the book's publication with "shock and moral outrage" as it held within its pages what Victorian's feared most: "a disregard for social niceties, an obsession with violence, cruelty and vice, and a complete lack of that satisfying morality which doled out rewards to the innocent and good and punished those who had done wrong" (Barker 90). This blatant disregard for 'social niceties' is in fact what separates *Wuthering Heights* from contemporary works. Indeed, "no other Victorian novel contains such scenes of inhuman brutality" or "defines its characters [by] the violence of their wills," writes J. Hillis Miller (167). The ferocity of Heathcliff, the novel's protagonist, specifically marked him as "the epitome of brutality" and tossed Emily 'Ellis Bell' Brontë into the role of a "spendthrift of malice and profanity" according to a contemporarily published *North American Review* article (Barker 575).

Heathcliff, however, is not the only dark character Brontë created. Most of her characters in *Wuthering Heights* have predecessors in her juvenilia, a series of epic poems full of twisted characters that relate only to "one another destructively" inside the mythical world of Gondal

(Miller 164). In both *Wuthering Heights* and the Gondal poems, “all men are worthy of damnation, and there is no way to *choose* salvation” (Miller 185, original emphasis). Given this knowledge, it is no surprise that Brontë “rejected the God and church of her father” (Geerken 374). She “refused to teach at Sunday school and did not attend service regularly,” and this same refusal to engage in typical Christian activities can be seen in young Catherine and Heathcliff (374). Heathcliff exemplifies Brontë’s active decision to abstain from Christianity in his choice to find a different heaven in Catherine. Catherine, in turn, chooses to abstain from Evangelical religion as she places her soul in Heathcliff. The second generation of lovers also find themselves in a world where Evangelical religion is obsolete and no longer necessary. A core function of characters like Nelly and Joseph in the novel is to remind both the remaining characters and the readers what they are renouncing—orthodox, nineteenth century evangelical Christianity.

Brontë’s childhood, although imaginative, did not unfold without great pains, and the pain she experienced early on effected her writings just as much as her father’s religiosity; when Christianity could not “assuage her mourning,” Brontë turned to the novel for reparation (Geerken 374). Her mother, Maria, and older sisters Maria and Elizabeth died before Brontë turned seven. Her mother passed away from cancer on September 15, 1821, in a more pious age where her children were surrounded by the “comfort of knowing that she had gone to a better place and that her soul, if not her body, was immortal” (Barker 111). Her sister Maria passed away at age eleven in May 1825, and Elizabeth followed soon after on June 15 of the same year (Parsonage Museum). These deaths left the remaining Brontë children without a maternal figure. Even though their Aunt Elizabeth Branwell did move into the family home to help raise them,

the maternal love received from their mother and Maria never returned.¹ Indeed, orphans play another strong role in *Wuthering Heights*. Almost every character in the novel “loses at least one parent, usually the mother [as a child, and]...the relationship between the two cousins, Linton and Catherine [in the second generation], is essentially that of a mother surrogate and her child” (Barker 139). When reading Brontë, it is useful to take life events such as these into account as they influence her story as well as offer some explanation to the strangeness and violence of *Wuthering Heights*. The Brontë children were “self-sufficient” from a young age, and Brontë’s self-sufficiency lent itself to the independence of her novel (111).

Brontë’s father served as an Evangelical pastor all his life, and she grew up surrounded by religious texts and ideologies; the often sarcastic references in her novel are intentional and well-researched. It is believed that Brontë’s theological allusions stem from years of learning Scripture as not learning the Scripture would have been seen as a “moral danger” at its worst and a “shocking example of ignorance” with serious faults in education at its least (Wang 161). Patrick Brontë, in addition to teaching his children religious lessons, also encouraged them to play pretend. His “unusually liberal views” meant that the Brontë children received an “unconventional Victorian childhood” (Oxford’s xv). This upbringing inspired Charlotte, Branwell, Emily, and Anne to create mythical worlds as well as read and write to their heart’s

¹ Even though the surviving siblings were incredibly close, Brontë had “little sympathy” for her sisters and Branwell. It seems “curious” that she should ever have been classified as “the most sympathetic of the Brontës” especially when all arrows point to her being “so absorbed in herself and her literary creations that she had little time for the genuine suffering of her family” (Barker 455).

content.² This contradiction of Evangelical pastor and imaginative father fits with Juliet Barker's description of him as "a very earnest man, but a little peculiar in manner" (36).

Only two of his sermons survive today and both discuss baptism or conversion, an idea "central to Evangelical belief" (43).³ In these sermons, he urged his congregation "not to put too much reliance on the outward act of baptism as an act of regeneration" because it was the "inward, spiritual cleansing of the heart by the Holy Ghost that was the essence of baptism" (43). Brontë adopted her father's belief of the importance of an inward rather than outward cleansing and incorporated it into *Wuthering Heights*. She developed a type of spiritualism in her novel, emphasizing the individual's importance and connection to the Higher Power as opposed to connecting with a Higher Power through priests or other mediators.⁴ The traditional Catholic "reliance on the priesthood rather than on individual effort to read the Bible [specifically] was totally repugnant" for Evangelicals like her family (77).

² J. Hillis Miller calls *Wuthering Heights* a "brief but important interruption" of Brontë's Gondal "world of imaginative vision" that ultimately provides the "best glimpse of the quality of her visionary world" (161; 159).

³ Although there are no literal scenes of baptism in the novel, the concept of conversion or rebirth into a new religion or way of life seems implicit and unstated. For the first generation, perhaps the closest Heathcliff comes to baptism is when he lies in Cathy's exhumed grave with her, dipping into the earth and reaffirming his passion, obsession, love for Cathy. In the second generation, Catherine the second's baptism could be her initial entrance into the world with the birthing fluids acting as baptismal waters. This papers works within the idea that the second generation adheres to the religious precedent set forth by the first generation, and this analysis supports that thesis. If Catherine is baptized into the faith from the moment of her birth, she is committed to being with her one true love all her life whereas her mother and Heathcliff did not choose to be with each other until it was too late.

⁴ In this scenario, mediators include the *things* found at both *Wuthering Heights* and *Thurshcross Grange*, a nearby home, as well as the buildings and books described in the novel.

Brontë's first and only novel tells the story of two lovers torn apart by their own choice.⁵ Catherine 'Cathy' Earnshaw and Heathcliff are the protagonists of the novel. Cathy's father adopts Heathcliff into the family after finding him in a ditch. They are inseparable growing up, but Cathy ultimately falls victim to materialism and marries Edgar Linton of Thrushcross Grange. After returning to the neighborhood having sought and found his fortune, Heathcliff marries Linton's sister Isabella in retaliation. Both couples give birth to one child a piece: 'Catherine' to Cathy and Edgar and 'Linton' to Isabella and Heathcliff.⁶ Cathy dies giving birth to her daughter, and Heathcliff recreates the circumstances preventing his and Cathy's union with their children. He traps Catherine into marriage with his sickly son Linton thereby gaining ownership of Thrushcross Grange upon Edgar Linton's death. After Heathcliff's son Linton dies, Catherine, still trapped at the Heights, grows attached to Hareton, the mistreated orphan of the second generation, and eventually falls in love with him. They admit their feelings to one another shortly before Heathcliff's own willful death and walk off into the sunset while Cathy and Heathcliff's corpses merge together in the earth.

Brontë's novel adheres to the Shakespearean model of forbidden love and places the lovers in the midst of a world recognizable yet strange to contemporary English readers: the moors of rural England. Her novel builds a community around the darkness existing inside Wuthering Heights the house. In his essay "Wuthering Heights: The Heath and the Hearth," Elliot B. Gose Jr. paints Cathy as dependent on Heathcliff to bring out her "rougher, more

⁵ Critics believe Brontë was working on a second novel, a sequel to *Wuthering Heights* when she died and that Charlotte destroyed the draft as well as pieces of Brontë's poetry.

⁶ These two children, along with Cathy's nephew Hareton make up the second generation of characters in *Wuthering Heights*.

physical and active emotional side of her nature” (4). Thrushcross Grange is seen as a type of heaven-on-earth for Cathy because of the overwhelming wealth, warmth, and abundance there as compared to the stark brutality of the Heights under her brother Hindley’s care. Gose focuses on Cathy’s sins rather than her motivations *to* sin as well as Heathcliff’s role within the novel and as her replacement for religion and heaven. He credits the *things* at Thrushcross Grange with persuading Cathy to abandon her love for Heathcliff. By things, I mean the material objects—clothes, cushions, etc.—only available to Cathy at Thrushcross Grange. However, Gose doesn’t give Cathy’s decision enough weight as she not only chose luxury and comfort but to betray her heart and her spirituality. J. Hillis Miller calls Cathy’s marriage to Edgar an attempt to be truly virtuous by “obeying the communal law of prudence, responsibility, and maturity” instead of giving into the joy of life with Heathcliff (191). Communal law is the law of common sense, and Cathy adheres to the sensibility of marrying Edgar and his materiality rather than risking creature comforts to be with Heathcliff. Because the book does not endorse Cathy and Edgar’s relationship but the love between Cathy and Heathcliff, the story transgresses upon prevailing notions of common sense and heightens *Wuthering Heights*’s shock value.⁷

While dark and vindictive, the story is littered with scenes of hope and a sense of something larger at work. The novel ends:

“[Mr. Lockwood] lingered round [Catherine, Heathcliff, and Linton’s tombstones], under that benign sky: watched the moths fluttering among the heath and the harebells, listened to the soft wind breathing through the grass, and

⁷ Ingrid Geerken’s suggests that Brontë, through the use of ‘mortal and marital regret,’ allows her characters to be both constrained and expressive of their intense grief, thereby further subverting social norms. Authors dealing with mortal regret were “deeply interested in the act of putting together a narrative that both constrains and expresses intense grief,” and this juxtaposition can be seen in *Wuthering Heights* (374).

wondered how any one could ever imagine unquiet slumbers for the sleepers in that quiet earth” (326).

In this moment, the evidence of ‘something larger’ at play is undeniable. Is it the idea of “life out of death, [or the idea of] heavenly bliss out of earthly torment” where the darkness, the vindictiveness, and the overall violence of Heathcliff and Cathy does not deter their reunion in the ground or peaceful slumber (Miller 202)? I suggest that the ‘something larger’ is not traditional Christianity but a nature-based spiritualism built around the romance between Cathy and Heathcliff. Their relationship works as a conduit for a spiritual religion and as an avenue to reaching a romantic communion. Instead of reaching God or whatever Higher Power there may be in a church through a hierarchical series of priests, one can interact with the Higher Power in nature or through the simple act of loving. Instead of a subordinate relationship with the Higher Power, there is sideways mediation. Cathy and Heathcliff are on the same plane and render a Higher Power unnecessary.

J. Hillis Miller’s book *The Disappearance of God* focuses on the literal disappearance and secularization of God in Brontë’s novel. Looking at specific characters and events in Brontë’s life, Miller provides support for a swerve religion. Miller and I agree on many points, such as the notion that Cathy and Heathcliff are the ground beneath each other’s feet, making them dependent upon each other while “God is defined by His absolute self-sufficiency” (Miller 174). In creating a codependent couple also charged with pioneering a new form of religious sentiment, Brontë took a risk. The survival of Cathy and Heathcliff’s religion of romance depends upon their physical closeness, and when they are not together, everything falls apart. “What Heathcliff is for Cathy, Cathy is for Heathcliff,” Miller writes (174). But, the bonds of a

religion of romance are fragile, despite the vehemence they inspire. Though some critics call it a “defiant rejection of conventional organized religion,” the novel is also a “triumphant declaration of faith” (Barker 483). Neither I nor Brontë wish to dismantle or refute all that Christianity entails. Instead, we merely offer a swerve religion.⁸ By ‘swerve religion,’ I mean some sort of adaptation or evolution of typical Victorian England Christianity.

Colin Jager’s “Unquiet Things: Secularism in the Romantic Age” covers the move to secularization, tracing its beginnings in secular acts through the secularizing trends into a secularized world. His book follows the movement of power away from religious entities into the hands of non-religious groups, whether they be political or otherwise. He defines secularism as a “deliberate “worlding” for the formerly sacred,” and I believe Brontë’s novel captures this movement by suggesting that a religion of romance be a worlding of religious sentiment (7). Indeed, there is a religion in *Wuthering Heights*, and Emma Mason offers the term “enthusiasm” as a more encompassing description of my religion of romance. She defines “religious enthusiasm” as a “wild and burning form of poetic and religious feeling excited by a personal and heightened interaction with God” (263). Religious enthusiasm is “a state of profound divine inspiration wherein the individual was overcome by a spiritual feeling that provoked intense passion, fury, anger, and imaginative powers, each testifying to God’s dominion” (264).

Mason characterizes Cathy and Heathcliff as marked by an “unceasing desire” grounded in “religion rather than romantic passion.” Their “tortured orations,” she writes, are delivered in a

⁸ The characters, Cathy and Heathcliff especially, appear to ignore traditional Christian principles while adhering to some kind of doctrine, which this paper attempts to explore. The novel is sprinkled with religious references, most of which are usually done satirically or with the intent to harm others. The familiarity of those moments to readers, in addition to the landscape, is somewhat comforting, even if sarcastic in intent.

“language scorched by the hell-fire of revivalist rhetoric” (Mason 263-4). Such orations like Cathy’s confession of her love of Heathcliff to Nelly as well as Heathcliff’s soliloquy after Cathy’s death fit this model. Both, but especially Heathcliff’s, speeches feature the torture and ‘revivalist rhetoric’ Mason mentions. Enthusiasm served as a “validating” device for the passion found in a Victorian world that characterized Brontë’s work as “masculine, unnatural, and strange” (264). But Cathy and Heathcliff’s participation in such enthusiasm is a struggle as there is no scriptural procedures modeling a religion of romance to serve as mediator; the literal text of *Wuthering Heights* fulfills that role for the second generation and for the reader, but it is not available to Cathy and Heathcliff, hence their demise. Enthusiasm’s position as a “powerful medium” through which protestations of entrapment are often staged and lead to the characteristic violence of *Wuthering Heights* is not enough (268). The lack of a model leads, in part, to the failure of Cathy and Heathcliff to successfully commune within a religion of romance. Nevertheless, by narrating this failure to commune, the novel itself becomes the precedent that its own characters lacked.

Communion is another key element of this argument.⁹ Within *Wuthering Heights*, there is communion of souls. Cathy tells Nelly, “... Whatever our souls are made of, his and mine are the

⁹ In “The Holy Spirit in Emily Brontë’s *Wuthering Heights* and Poetry,” Lisa Wang describes the novel as one that emphasizes the “primal nature of religious experience over and above its doctrinal formulations,” but this neglects to mention the conscious decision of the characters to place their religious devotion in each other (162). In terms of agency, I suggest Cathy and Heathcliff are completely active in their fates. In addition to *choosing* to put their love in one another, Cathy chooses to marry Linton just as Heathcliff chooses to marry Isabella in retaliation. In fact, one could argue that agency lead to the disruption of the spiritual communion of Cathy and Heathcliff’s souls.

same...” (Brontë 80). She openly acknowledges the blending of their souls and goes on to further solidify the merging of their beings:

“My great miseries in this world have been Heathcliff’s miseries, and I watched and felt each from the beginning: my great thought in living is himself. If all else perished, and *he* remained, *I* should still continue to be; and if all else remained, and he were annihilated, the universe would turn to a mighty stranger. I should not seem part of it. . . Nelly, I *am* Heathcliff! He’s always in my mind: not as a pleasure any more than I am always a pleasure to myself, but as my own being.” (82)

Much in the way the Holy Spirit lives inside Christ’s followers, so, too, does Cathy live inside Heathcliff and vice versa in a form of radical sympathy mimicking Leviticus 19:18: “...thou shalt love thy neighbour as thyself.”¹⁰ The existence of one depends upon the existence of the other. Indeed, Heathcliff is the piece of Cathy that exists “outside herself” and is “her true self, her essence, more herself than she is. A created being entirely self-contained would have no use or meaning” (Miller 173). Swerving from Descartes’s cogito, Cathy would say, “I am Heathcliff, therefore, I exist” (175). This hyperbolic analogy is both the “climax and endpoint” of making love a “private religion” between God and a “single worshipper or devotee” (175). The entire novel struggles to reconcile “the need for a spiritual source outside oneself and the need to be self-sufficient,” and it is only in Hareton and young Catherine’s romance that readers finally see a successful version of this conundrum (158). For one, they witnessed the failures of the first generation and, taking those failures into account, complete the work of the novel and create a metaphorical text describing a successful religion of romance. Although the first generation’s

¹⁰ <http://www.topical-bible-studies.org/24-0003.htm>

attempt at reconciliation falls flat as Cathy and Heathcliff are too vicious and self-serving, the attempt itself is fascinating—an extended exposure to the sublime.¹¹

The communion between Cathy and Heathcliff serves as another hallmark of the novel itself. The most ardent romances in Brontë's works, both poetry and prose, occur outside the bonds of marriage—outside the church itself—and the marriages that do occur have little effect on the passion existing between the lovers (Frank 130, 219).¹² The first bodily communion of Cathy and Heathcliff are the hurried kisses shared on the eve of her death—a Sunday while her husband and household are at church—and the second occurs when Heathcliff exhumes Cathy's body after her burial (Brontë 155-6; 277-9). There is no consummation between our violent lovers, and it is only when their bodies mimicked their souls and dissolve into one another at the end of the novel, in a permanent and nonsexual way, that peace ensues. This paper seeks to understand the relationship between the darkness of the text with the hopeful and peaceful ending. In doing so, I hope to further readers' understanding of Emily Brontë's masterpiece as well as consider the power of books themselves. For readers of *Wuthering Heights*, the novel can function as a new, secular scripture by which to orient their lives.

¹¹ I use 'sublime' in this paper to refer to the titillating aspect of something terrifying and potentially harmful that is simultaneously beautiful but with a dangerous edge. I refer to an elevating and visceral experience that effects the reader.

¹² Marriage in Gondal is not marriage in the classic Evangelical understanding. There is no ceremony, no binding ties in front of a representative of God. Instead, couples are together when they agree to be. A divorce, a breakup, is as simple as an agreement to not be together. In that way, Augusta is both married and divorced multiple times without ever engaging in what the Church defines as marriage. Additionally, there are no consequences to such a divorce. When Augusta leaves one lover, as they are referred to, she is not punished, either by a higher power or by someone within the novel.

Since I believe Brontë's religious upbringing effected her writings and her imagination, I will attempt to reconcile the religiosity of her upbringing with the hellish and hopeless landscape and characters of *Wuthering Heights*. The first chapter, Here's The Situation, discusses the situation as set up by the novel, focusing specifically on Catherine and Heathcliff. I discuss the violence and codependence of their relationship, their Gondal predecessors, their fascination with each other as well as their torment when apart, and the hell they create for themselves, and the characters themselves. Ultimately, this chapter answers the question: Who are Cathy and Heathcliff? And how do they effect the religion I describe? The second chapter, The Mediations, discusses the environment, both within the novel and without, which shaped these characters, looking at Haworth, England, as well as the churches, nature, and secondary characters in the novel. These things serve as mediators between the couple and their Higher Power. The third and final chapter, Another Way, discusses what we're left with at the novel's close, examining Catherine and Hareton in the wake of the first generation's passing. The second generation learns to adhere to the first generation's religion of romance mainly through the use of literature and, thereby, thrive in this strange, new world where God has already fallen.

Chapter One: Here's The Situation

In order to fully grasp the concept of a religion of romance, I must first lay the foundation. This chapter focuses on Cathy and Heathcliff at its broadest and specifically examines Cathy and Heathcliff's predecessors in Brontë's Gondal juvenilia as well as the roles Cathy and Heathcliff play within this religion of romance. There are a multitude of parallels between Brontë's poems and her novel. I believe in the importance of recognizing such parallels as they further illustrate Brontë's relationship to religion as well as the intersection of her religion with her imagination. From an early age, Brontë wrote poems detailing the history of her and her siblings' imaginary world. These poems are incredibly important to any study of Brontë's works as many of the "themes and incidents" in *Wuthering Heights*, among other works by the Brontë sisters, have roots in their juvenile writings. Themes like "longing for the loved one and the native land" as well as "sinking [in]to despair at the separation [from a loved one] and mourning [their loss] when death intervenes" feature in both Brontë's poetry and prose (Barker 502, 275). Additionally, where the poems read as moments or snapshots of another world, *Wuthering Heights* adds a narrative structure and maturity. In combining her understanding of religion with her love for the fictive, Brontë offers readers a unique kind of spirituality. Her novel attracts readers to books in the way that Edgar Linton's materiality attracts Cathy, but the pragmatism behind Cathy's decision is not necessary to ours.

Brontë grew the imaginary world of Gondal between the ages of fourteen and thirty, devoting both time and scraps of paper to its cause (Ratchford 25). For Brontë, Gondal was an escape and a liberty vital to her very being in a way Charlotte and the other siblings never shared (Barker 237). Gondal preoccupied Brontë's thoughts almost consistently, it seems. Much like

Cathy with her copy of the Testament, Brontë “carefully inserted in minuscule script the names and brief details” of her Gondal characters in her copy of *A Grammar of General Geography* by Reverend J. Goldsmith (Barker 275). Indeed, Juliet Barker suggests Brontë’s “dependence” upon Gondal never faltered and, even when she found herself “released from the bondage of school life,” she “retreated into her imagination” where Gondal was a “necessary part of life” (436, 253). Brontë wrote poems about Gondal up until her early death in 1848, but they were never meant to be published (Ratchford 11). When Charlotte stumbled upon her sister’s scribbled poems in the fall of 1845, she convinced Brontë to publish them. Nothing came of it until C. W. Hatfield published *The Complete Poems of Emily Jane Brontë* in 1941 based off her manuscripts. From there, Gondal and all its nooks and crannies were exposed to the public (11). Hatfield’s work is heavily relied upon in Fannie E. Ratchford’s *Gondal’s Queen: A Novel in Verse by Emily Brontë* published in 1955. Both their analyses of Gondal reveal a “tightly knit epic of the free, wild, [and] grotesque world of imagination which nourished Emily’s creative genius and brought it to glorious fruitage” in the later published *Wuthering Heights* (12).

Before Gondal, the Brontë’s children shared an imaginary world called Glass Town, but their collaboration soon reached a crossroads. Charlotte and Branwell, their brother, stayed loyal to Glass Town while Anne and Emily created Gondal in order to escape both their heroes playing second fiddle to Charlotte’s and the “balmy African landscape” and “Verdopolitan nobility” of Glass Town (Oxford’s xxxiv).¹³ Gondal became a cold-climate world of “islands, the wild moorland scenery, a powerful princess,” inspired by Princess Victoria, and “the struggles of a

¹³ The sisters wrote of the events occurring in Gondal in present tense, giving no evidence of the stories’s fictive nature. The sisters wrote as “historians or poets, not novelists” (Miller 160).

predominantly royalist world” (xxxv). The Oxford’s World Classic’s Selected Writings on Gondal describes the place as follows: “the island of Gondal in the North Pacific, divided into four kingdoms and ruled by rival families,” existed in a “landscape of wild moorland, harsh winter winds and snows” where a “drama of rebellion and betrayal in love and war” played out (xxxvi). It was a cold-climated world of “wild moorland scenery [and] a powerful princess” full of “the struggles of a predominantly royalist world”—all of which existed under and withstood the “violent passions of the strong-willed heroine Augusta Geraldine Almeda (A.G.A.)” (xxxvi).¹⁴

Unlike Glass Town, Gondal’s plots featured warfare and politics as part of the backdrop and focused on the female characters within the world. As Juliet Barker writes, “this was not a man’s world in which women were simply the beautiful playthings of leisure time. Gondal women play a far greater and more active role than their counterparts” in *Glass Town* (273). There are no “passive beauties,” here, only black widows intent on killing their mates once they’re finished with them (Barker 273; Miller 193). Additionally, because Gondal was a world created and directed by women, the lovers “are more equal” than those in contemporary novels as well as “brave, passionate, and faithful unto death” (Baker 275). These qualities obviously parallel to Cathy and Heathcliff in *Wuthering Heights*, and the substance of the Gondal poetry seems to exist as a first draft of Brontë’s only novel. J. Hillis Miller calls the novel a transposition of the poems, turning into “fictional form the vision of this which her poems

¹⁴ Brontë’s poems mainly focused on Augusta Geraldine Almeda. Throughout the tale, Augusta takes lovers and disposes of them at will before being assassinated by her former step-daughter. The selfishness she displays is similar to Catherine’s selfishness regarding both Heathcliff and Linton (613).

express[ed]" (157). In the end, both works are "dominated" by "isolation, exile, revenge, and death" (Oxford xlii). The characters "lament their separation and imprisonment," which is usually brought about by the death of a lover. The loyalties between couples run strong and violent, their emotions a turbulent sea.

Much like life in Haworth, life in Gondal contained a "pervading sense of confinement," both physical and spiritual, where the narrator and reader are both "chained" to the world by "powerful emotions, memories, and consequences of action" (Oxford xlii). Jill Dix Ghnassia describes Brontë's poetry and prose as being "devoid of any hope for otherworldliness or of any form of hope" due to Brontë's bleak outlook on life and afterlife after the deaths of her mother and sisters in her early life (25). J. Hillis Miller argues that Brontë channeled that turmoil into the violent destructiveness and bleak outlook of her characters. Both of the *Wuthering Heights* narrators, Lockwood and Nelly, and the readers stay trapped within the story, held hostage by raw and violent emotions. Within Gondal, the reader stays trapped inside its "compact and well-integrated whole" (Ratchford 23). The only difference of the strength of entrapment lies in medium: the prose of *Wuthering Heights* tightens its noose more than the fragmented poems.¹⁵

Precursors to Catherine Earnshaw's character fill Brontë's Gondal poems, most obviously and consistently in the form of Augusta Geraldine Almeda (A.G.A.). Both are strong-willed heroines with lovers who seem to be completely enamored with them, fueling "divine"

¹⁵ Much of the prose written on Gondal has been destroyed or lost over the years, and it is almost impossible to truly recreate that world (Barker 272). However, Fannie B. Ratchford compiled and arranged what snippets are left in order (by educated guess) in her book *Gondal's Queen: A Novel in Verse by Emily Jane Brontë* (University of Texas Press, 1955). While one person's interpretation, Ratchford's book does an excellent job of giving readers a glimpse of the true glory of Gondal.

inspiration and “fervent passion[s] from which [they] cannot escape” (Mason 263).¹⁶ This is true of Heathcliff as the second half of the novel details his inability to escape his love for Cathy. Fernando De Samara, one of Heathcliff’s many predecessors is simply described as “one of the many victims of A.G.A’s cruelty.” For her smile, Fernando forsook his family and his home. “All he had of virtue died,” Ratchford writes, and when A.G.A.’s “brief interest had run its course,” she banished him to prison caves where “he had long months to repent his folly and sin, and to call down retribution upon his seductress” (134, 138). He soliloquizes his decision to end his life, a last vain effort to “free himself from his enslaving love for A.G.A.” in “F. De Samara to A.G.A. / E. November 1st 1838” (Oxford’s 400; see Appendix A; Ratchford 140).

It begins:

Light up thy halls! ’Tis closing day;
I’m drear and lone and far away—
Cold blows on my breast, the northwind’s bitter sigh
And Oh, my couch is bleak beneath the rainy sky!

and ends with his declaration of enduring love:

And yet, for all Her hate, each parting glance would tell
A stronger passion breathed, burned in this last farewell—
Unconquered in my soul the Tyrant rules me still
Life bows to my control, but, Love I cannot kill!

Despite the obvious signs of A.G.A.’s lack of affection for Fernando, he convinces himself that something burns beneath her facade of indifference.

Heathcliff mirrors the above language in two moments: once during his and Catherine’s reunion and once after her death (Appendices B and C, respectively). The first instance occurs

¹⁶ There are some discrepancies between Augusta and Cathy, though. Cathy tends to be more “passive” and “masochistic” than Augusta, aligning herself more with Fernando de Samara in certain instances (Miller 193).

during their last reunion. Edgar bars Heathcliff from their home once he sees the effect Heathcliff has on Catherine. Yet, in a desperate attempt to see her once more, Heathcliff enlists Nelly's assistance. She sneaks him into the house and in their stolen moment, Heathcliff laments her illness. "You loved me—then what *right* had you to leave me? What right—answer me—for the poor fancy you felt for Linton? Because misery and degradation, and death, and nothing that God or Satan could inflict would have parted us, *you*, of your own will, did it," he cries aloud (Brontë 159). Their love was foolproof—unless tampered with from the inside. But, Heathcliff doesn't stop there. He continues: "I have not broken your heart—*you* have broken it; and in breaking it, you have broken mine. So much the worse for me that I am strong. Do I want to live? What kind of living will it be when you—oh, God! would *you* like to live with your soul in the grave?"

These words echo Fernando's sentiment that "Life bows to [his] control, but, Love [he] cannot kill." Both men carried their love resolutely, not accepting the changes before them.

"Unconquered in my soul the Tyrant rules me still," Fernando exclaims, and Heathcliff undoubtedly understands that sentiment all too well. They both struggle to hold onto a love that their partner destroys. Augusta did so purposefully, but what about Catherine? Does her accidental destruction bring the reader onto her side? She didn't mean it, and she obviously feels horrible enough to die. Yet, she still left.

Unlike Fernando, who aims to leave Augusta alone in this world, Catherine leaves Heathcliff. At the time of this second soliloquy, Heathcliff has just learned of Catherine's passing from Nelly. He curses her, prays that she haunts him, and ends with, "Be with me always—take any form—drive me mad! only *do* not leave me in this abyss, where I cannot find you! Oh, God! it is unutterable! I *cannot* live without my life! I *cannot* live without my soul!" (Brontë 165).

Read so close together, Heathcliff's words almost seem to respond to Fernando's farewell. Yet, unfortunately for both of them, that is not their resolution to have. Augusta doesn't care about Fernando anymore, we are lead to believe, and Catherine—does anyone ever truly know Catherine's heart? A fickle woman, her heart is divided until her death. In the afterlife, Heathcliff would have us believe she chooses him as he sees her ghost until his death. He claims Catherine calls to him, that she can hear him. Fernando is under no such impression. The second to last stanza reads:

Vain words—wain, frenzied thoughts! No ear can hear me call—
 Lost in the vacant air my frantic curses fall—
 And could she see me now, perchance her lip would smile
 Would smile in careless pride and utter scorn the while!

His words fall on deaf ears. Perhaps his words remain unheard because Fernando is not Julius, just as Edgar is not Heathcliff.

To A.G.A., Julius Brenzaida, Prince of Angora and later King of Almedore as well as Emporor of Gondal and Gaaldine, stood as the “sun of her life, paling into invisibility all other loves and loyalties” (Ratchford 87). Julius Brenzaida was Augusta's Heathcliff, her one true love, the “last passion of her life” (41). Together, they defeated their rivals and claimed his emperorship. Unfortunately, they made many enemies along the way, and Julius was murdered at the behest of A.G.A.'s one-time stepdaughter Angelica and her foster brother Amedeus.¹⁷

Although Julius died, the true target of the attack was A.G.A (41). Without Julius, A.G.A. lived in torment:

¹⁷ Another precursor to Heathcliff, Amedeus is a “dark boy of sorrow whose full name and identity never become clear” (Ratchford 20). Heathcliff is described early on in the novel as a “dark skinned gypsy” and can be characterized as a boy of “dark and tragic aspect” whose is “doomed to sorrow” from birth (Brontë 5, Ratchford 71).

Sleep brings no joy to me,
 Remembrance never dies;
 My soul is given to misery
 And lives in sighs.

Sleep brings no rest to me;
 The shadows of the dead
 My waking eyes may never see
 Surround my bed.

...
 Sleep brings no wish to knit
 My harassed heart beneath;
 My only wish is to forget
 In sleep of death.

The above lines come from three fragments entitled “A.G.A.” whose heading suggest she is addressing Julius (Ratchford 51; see Appendix D). Her acknowledgement of the emptiness of life without Julius mirrors Heathcliff’s own lamentations previously discussed. Ratchford even goes so far as to suggest Julius’s death is a greater punishment for living a “self-willed and pleasure-loving life” (60). If this be so, there are now parallels between Julius and Cathy as well as Cathy and Agatha. For in choosing Edgar Linton and Thrushcross Grange over Heathcliff, Cathy chose a life of comfort, even if her relationship with Edgar was comparatively mediocre. In choosing Edgar anyways, she committed the ultimate sin in this new religion: interrupting love.

To fully grasp the roles these people play, it is useful to unpack their characters and their infamous love more fully. Catherine ‘Cathy’ Earnshaw is the second and youngest child of Mr. Earnshaw, her father. As previously mentioned, Cathy is prefigured by Gondal’s Augusta (A.G.A.), both women sharing a selfishness and totally-encompassing ability to love. In attempting to fulfill their own desires, they bring pain and suffering to those who love them. This is evident in the string of lovers and scorned children who murder Augusta’s Julius as well as

Cathy's marriage to Edgar. To the spoiled Cathy, it is unfathomable that anyone could dislike her. She thought that "though everybody hated and despised each other [at the Heights], they could not avoid loving" her (Brontë 120). Cathy and Augusta both use their charms to win others over, desiring to make their lovers "wholly conscious of [their] presence—[of their] beauty, [their] intelligence, [and their] charm" (Ratchford 51). The literal descriptions of Cathy engaging in blatant displays of selfishness are not explicit like the ones describing Augusta, but the nature of her decisions greatly implies the same selfish drive.

Even as a child, a darkness existed inside Cathy. Despite her appearance as the "bright-haired, willful darling of fortune," Cathy understands the consequences of her actions (Barker 501). In her last words to Heathcliff she says, "I'm not wishing you a greater torment than I have, Heathcliff. I only wish us never to be parted" (Brontë 158). Brontë writes of Augusta as a queen of such "compelling beauty and charm" as well as one of "such selfish cruelty as to bring tragedy to all who loved her" (Ratchford 22). Interestingly, at the beginning of *Wuthering Heights* when Mr. Earnshaw first journeys to town (the journey upon which he finds Heathcliff in the gutter) Cathy asks her father to bring her back a whip, echoing the strange brutality of Gondal's Augusta (Brontë 36-37). At the end of her life, she accepts her death as punishment for marrying Heathcliff. Of course, her trapped soul wanders the moors for the next eighteen years awaiting Heathcliff's, but her willful death—her self-willed decision to die—is a testament both to her stubbornness, her selfishness, and her completely-encompassing love for Heathcliff. Yes, this is unhealthy. Most of the traits exhibited by Cathy and Heathcliff are not written as examples to be followed. Indeed, they are a way to play pretend. To pretend you are Cathy is fine, but to *be* Cathy is not a wise decision. The fictive nature of the novel protects readers from the unhealthy

consequences of a real relationship like Cathy and Heathcliff's while also allowing readers to experience of religion of romance.

Heathcliff, on the other hand, is a more complex character, based on the classic “doomed Byronic character[s]” the Brontë siblings grew up reading (Barker 316). He is the “dark, brooding outlaw...whose origins are shrouded in mystery and who was doomed from birth to be blighted by fate”—but his one redeeming feature is his “passionate love” for Cathy (Barker 501). All the descriptions of Heathcliff in the novel focus on his darkness: both soulfully and literally. He is a “black villain” with eyes like “a couple of black fiends” (Brontë 111, 57). He appears at the Heights as a “dirty, ragged, black-haired child” tucked under Mr. Earnshaw's arm and is quickly recognized by his enemies as a “moral poison that would contaminate the most virtuous” (37, 114).¹⁸ Indeed, it is his “half-civilized ferocity” hidden beneath “depressed brows and eyes full of black fire” that concerned the household most even though “his manner was dignified; quiet divested of roughness, though too stern for grace” (95). Heathcliff's otherness, in addition to physically distancing him from the family, also allows him to operate outside the norm.¹⁹

Adding to the threatening nature of the novel as a whole, Cathy and Heathcliff were raised as siblings brought up together under the same roof. This familial upbringing complicates their relationship and shocked contemporary readers. In her article, ““The Dead Are Not

¹⁸ Heathcliff is accused by Hindley Earnshaw as corrupting the Heights and being a plague of sorts. But, the Heights and the Grange are already sealed off from the rest of the world and were corrupt before he arrived (Miller 208). The ensuing degradation of their world stems from the fact that “society in this region is cut off from God, living outside God's law and without His sustaining spirit” (208). In short, Heathcliff is not the *cause* of corruption at the Heights; he is a victim like everyone else.

¹⁹ In her essay on sexuality in Victorian literature, Sharon Marcus discusses the fact that Heathcliff's physical appearance and descriptions as ‘black’ or ‘dark’ mark him as a “racial and religious outsider” also marked with a threatening, sexual predation (425).

Annihilated’: Mortal Regret in ‘Wuthering Heights,’” Ingrid Geerken touches on this point. She says that is not a question of whether or not there is an incestuous relationship between Catherine and Heathcliff, but more a question of how this is made apparent to the reader. She credits the strength of the “bloodlines of the narrative” with creating a blood bond between the two (Geerken 395). Yet, such close marriages were not abnormal during the Victorian era. Marriages between cousins were prevalent in nineteenth century literature as these kept bloodlines similar, property within families, and reinforced classist social structures (Marcus 427). The similarity of the names between the first generation (Catherine Earnshaw, Heathcliff, and Edgar Linton) and the second generation (Catherine Linton, Hareton Earnshaw, and Linton Heathcliff) also contributes to the incestuous feel of the novel. Secondly, being as Catherine is Cathy’s daughter and Hareton is Cathy’s nephew, they both share blood with out deceased heroine. Brontë goes so far as to have them share Cathy’s eyes. Upon Heathcliff’s approaching the two reading, “they lifted their eyes together, to encounter Mr. Heathcliff...[and] their eyes [were] precisely similar, and they [were] those of Catherine Earnshaw” (Brontë 311). This moment probably effected readers, making them slightly uneasy as it reminds them of the fact that Catherine and Hareton are cousins. However, they were not raised together like Cathy and Heathcliff were, and the lack of physical proximity during their formative years seems to distance their bloodlines.

If a religion of romance stands solely on the romantic relationship between two lovers then anything that disrupts it is an immoral act. The worst of immoral acts, then, is not just an interruption of the relationship, but is one of the lovers *choosing* to disrupt the relationship. Indeed, Nelly speaks to the punishment awaiting Cathy in Heaven which would be a “land of exile to her” unless she cast away her moral character upon arrival (Brontë 157). Nelly goes so

far as to say Cathy would be “extremely miserable” in heaven because she is not fit to go there —“all sinners would be miserable in heaven” (80). Of course, Nelly here refers to the orthodox Christian notion of heaven but the sentiment still stands. Without Heathcliff, Cathy would lie in torment. Heathcliff, on the other hand, does lie in torment, as seen in Appendices B and C.

There is a violence in their immorality, much like the violent destructiveness J. Hillis Miller describes. Once Heathcliff and Isabella Linton return to the Heights after their honeymoon, Isabella secretly sends a letter to Nelly detailing the horrible turn their marriage took. Nelly rushes to the Heights where Heathcliff screams: “I have no pity! I have no pity! The more the worms writhe, the more I yearn to crush out their entrails! It is a moral teething; and I grind with greater energy in proportion to the increase of pain” (Brontë 151). Cathy and Heathcliff are now fully separated, each married to another and living in the same neighborhood. They are confronted with the reality of their immorality. The enormity of it presses down upon them, and both lash out at one another and as well as others. In her “feverish bewilderment,” Cathy tears pillows with her teeth (121). Heathcliff tells her, “I wish you joy of the milk-blooded coward,” referring to Edgar, and threatens to crush his ribs like a “rotten hazel-nut” (115-16). He ends: “If I don’t floor him now, I shall murder him some time” (116). Cathy also threatens Edgar: “I wish Heathcliff may flog you sick, for daring to think an evil thought of me!” (115).

Later, in one of Heathcliff’s most famous soliloquies, he discusses whether or not Cathy would suffer from Edgar’s loss. In an impressive show of devotion, madness, and violence, Heathcliff cries:

“The moment her regard ceased, I would have torn his heart out and drunk his blood! But, till then—if you don’t believe me, you don’t know me—till then, I would have died by inches before I touched a single hair of his head!” (147).

His language is vampiric, talking about tearing out hearts and drinking blood, but that is the violence of Brontë's world. In the midst of Cathy's confrontation with Heathcliff regarding his intentions to pursue and marry Isabella Linton, Heathcliff lashes out at his lover, the other half of his soul if not the whole piece. Cathy has treated him infernally, he cries, while also promising not to seek revenge against her. "You are welcome to torture me to death for your amusement only allow me to amuse myself a little in the same style," he cries. "If I imagined you really wished me to marry Isabel, I'd cut my throat!" (112). Cathy's reply to these accusations rings just as heartless: "Oh, the evil is that I am *not* jealous, is it? . . . Well, I won't repeat my offer of a wife: it is as bad as offering Satan a lost soul. Your bliss lies, like his, in inflicting misery" (112). Comparing one's lover to Satan is not generally suggested, but for Brontë's lovers, this is another example of the spite they needlessly inflict upon each other. All this misery brought about because Cathy choose comfort over love. Even Heathcliff questions Cathy. He says, "You teach me how cruel you've been—cruel and false. *Why* did you despise me? *Why* did you betray your own heart, Cathy? I have not one word of comfort. You deserve this" (159). Indeed, Cathy's choice to marry Linton and Heathcliff's to marry Isabella in retaliation cast them into a hell of their own design.²⁰

Their love cannot be disrupted by an external power, though, as there is not a recognizable Higher Power available to do so. Attempts by others at the Heights to separate Cathy and Heathcliff in the past never succeeded. When Cathy's father died and her brother, Hindley, father of Hareton, inherited the Heights and all within, he became tyrannical. He drove

²⁰ Separation of loved ones through death or existing on opposing sides of war is another trend seen in Brontë's earlier poetry (Barker 435).

Heathcliff to the servants' quarters, "deprived him of the instructions of the curate, and insisted that he should labour out of doors instead; compelling him to do so as hard as any other lad on the farm" (Brontë 46). But even that could not keep the two apart. Cathy taught Heathcliff in the fields and stayed there with him. They found the most pleasure, though, in avoiding punishments altogether and running off to the moors, staying there all day. No matter what the threat of punishment entailed, "they forgot everything the minute they were together" (46).

Yet, to be separated is hellish, and Nelly explicitly states that the "greatest punishment" invented for Cathy was to simply keep her separate from Heathcliff (Brontë 42). The fact that Cathy then *chooses* to separate herself from Heathcliff is ironic and heartbreaking. It is no surprise that she knows herself to be in torment before she dies. For one, she drives herself to death, much like her predecessor Augusta.²¹ In Cathy's willful death, she wills the irrevocable "consummation of her separation from Heathcliff" (Miller 192). If their separation is "inevitable," then there is only one way for Cathy to maintain "control of her own life: to choose the separation and be herself the cause of it" (192). Cathy cries: "Well, if I cannot keep Heathcliff for my friend—if Edgar will be mean and jealous, I'll try to break their hearts by breaking my own!" (Brontë 116-17). Even as she lay upon her deathbed, Cathy felt the atrocity of what she'd done. She lay there burning, and her "blood rushed into a hell of tumult" thinking of being young again (probably in hopes of righting her wrongs) (125). In her last moments with Heathcliff, Cathy swears never to rest until they are reunited: "I'll not lie there by myself: they

²¹ Suicide was seen by many religions as a shortcut to purgatory. In taking one's life, one would no longer be taken into heaven. This complicates the idea of both Cathy and Heathcliff choosing to die as they are willingly entering into Hell. But, if heaven lies simply in their reunification in the ground post-death, the issue of suicide is irrelevant except for its relation to contemporary readers.

may bury me twelve feet deep, and through the church down over me, but I won't rest till you are with me. I never will!" (125). She continues, "I shall not be at peace...I only wish us never to be parted: and should a word of mine distress you hereafter, think I feel the same distress underground" (158).

Heathcliff brings his own moments of tumult to the story. He threatens to "haunt the place" when denied access to a dying Cathy and has "no doubt she's in hell among" Edgar Linton and his family at the Grange (Brontë 151, 153). Heathcliff promises Cathy he shall "writhe in the torments of hell" when she's gone and not be "at peace," asking if her "infernal selfishness" is not appeased (158).²² Reflecting back upon his soliloquy after her death (see Appendix C), Heathcliff knows Cathy will not leave the earth for some kind of heaven—she's "not *there*—not in heaven—not perished—where?" (Brontë 165). Although one could say that she kills herself, Heathcliff appeals to her claims that *he* killed her, crying, "the murdered *do* haunt their murderers" (165).²³ Thus, when Catherine dies, Heathcliff's separation from her echoes the "theological notion that hell is the eternal deprivation of God's presence" (Wang 167).

²² Much like Cathy, A.G.A. dominated the world around her as well as the very poems themselves even when only spoken of (Mason 263). A.G.A is a "ruthless" and "ardent ruler, a powerful rhetorician, the murderer of her newly-born daughter and direct cause of the deaths and exile of several of her lovers" (263). Upon her deathbed, Cathy displays a similar ruthlessness in the form of selfishness. Speaking to Heathcliff she cries, "I wish I could hold you...till we were both dead! I shouldn't care what you suffered. I care nothing for your sufferings. Why shouldn't *you* suffer? I do!" (Brontë 157).

²³ Does willing oneself to death count as suicide? I'm not sure. Suicide at the time of the novel's publication was viewed as a shortcut to purgatory, however, so in taking one's life you would no longer be allowed into heaven. If 'willing' counts as suicide, then Cathy and Heathcliff's deaths are complicated as hell would have been their destination. But, if their heaven is reunification, and they are reunited in the ground upon their deaths and subsequent burials, then the classification of their deaths as suicide is irrelevant except for its relation to contemporary readers.

Heathcliff echoes this idea continually throughout the novel: “Two words comprehend my future—*death* and *hell*: existence, after losing her, would be hell” he cries (Brontë 148). Without her, Heathcliff devotes his life to the “suffering caused by his loss” and the “violence of his desire to get her back” (Miller 194). For at the end of the day, Cathy is his soul, and “without her, he grovels in an abyss of nothingness” (194).

This contrasts sharply with Edgar’s behavior after Cathy’s death. Nelly describes him as “too good to be thoroughly unhappy for long. *He* didn’t pray for Catherine’s soul to haunt him. Time brought resignation, and a melancholy sweeter than common joy. He recalled her memory with ardent, tender love, and hopeful aspiring to the better world; where he doubted not she was gone” (Brontë 180). In addition to simple personality differences, Edgar’s behavior also supports the idea that he is not part of this all-consuming religion-love. Instead of focusing his energies on regaining Cathy’s companionship, he sits resigned and waits for death, something Heathcliff would never do. In fact, the second half of the novel centers around Heathcliff’s active attempts *to* reunite with Cathy. Their existences are dependent on each other to an extreme. Wang describes a sort of “inter-existential relationship” in which one party is dependent upon the existence of the other. To equate Catherine and Heathcliff’s devotion to each other with the dedication Christians have to Christ, their love becomes a thing that “convicts, converts, sanctifies, teaches, directs, comforts, inspires, and empowers” the lovers—much like the Holy Spirit (Wang 162). “In this sense,” Wang continues, “[Brontë] is less interested in the heart of the gospel, the forgiveness of sins, than in its fruit, access into the divine presence” (162). For Heathcliff, Catherine’s presence is divine, and he spends the latter half of his life trying to find his way back to her.

Chapter Two: The Mediations

The events of both *Wuthering Heights* and Emily Brontë's life did not happen within a vacuum. This chapter details the environment surrounding both timelines in terms of Haworth, England, Brontë's hometown, as well as the world of *Wuthering Heights* in terms of ecology, buildings, and other characters.²⁴ In her biography of the Brontës, Juliet Barker describes life in Haworth as "nasty, brutish, and short" (91). Brontë's father faced "an immense task in Haworth" (Baker 101). Despite Haworth being one-eighth the size of Thornton, Patrick singlehandedly performed "more than double the number of burials and marriages and nearly seven times as many baptisms" (101). Death, love, and life seemed to happen quickly in Haworth. Naturally, the apparent prevalence of limited time affected Brontë as there are no records of her ever "having befriended anyone outside the family" (181). Indeed, she seldom left the family home, and when she did, nothing went well. When she joined Charlotte at the Roe Head school, which Charlotte later used as the model for the school Jane Eyre attends, Brontë was a great "cause for concern" to her family (235). Being at the school, away from her home and her freedom to write, made her physically ill. Patrick brought her home, and Brontë once again became the "cheerful" housekeeper and focused on her own "fulfillment" writing both Gondal poetry and *Wuthering Heights* (435). She remained at the family home as its caretaker until her death by consumption in 1848.

As previously outlined, Brontë's religious background supports the idea of a swerve religion. In her essay on spirituality in Victorian literature, Elisabeth Jay confronts pre-existing

²⁴ The Brontë family lived in a few towns before Haworth, but the majority of the important events and influences as they pertain to *Wuthering Heights* occur in Haworth. So it is there our focus shall remain.

ideas of religion and how literature from this time period affected the public's perception of religion. When Victoria ascended the throne, Evangelicalism existed in its third generation of preaching humanity's inability to follow the teachings of Christianity, inability to reach the moral standards held up by Christians, and inability to reach salvation unless they followed Christ's sacrificial route to Heaven (Jay 361). Nineteenth century Christians preached practical piety. They emphasized that earthly joy was temporary and fleeting, sinful, and necessitated a saving relation to God (Miller 181). A man's religion was an integral part of his life and was "intimately bound up with his social existence and behavior" (Jay 2). The Evangelicals—under whose influence young Brontë grew up—stressed "habitual self-examination, a sense of one's own sinfulness and an awareness of the imminence of the Day of Judgement" all of which combined "to ensure that a life once dedicated to God remained positively and actively employed in His service" (Barker 5). Living under such an umbrella can be bleak. Joyful and pleasurable acts achieved on earth were often considered sinful and thus avoided.

Yet, it was in nature that Brontë found her peace, known to wander about the moors surrounding the family home with her dogs as Patrick encouraged his children to "roam freely on the moors" from an early age (Oxford's xv). Patrick Brontë also saw the "beauties of the natural world" as the "manifestation of God," and in *Wuthering Heights*, there seems to be a manifestation of some kind of higher power in the moors surrounding the Heights and Thrushcross Grange (Barker 59). Much like the prisoners in her poetry, Brontë was consoled by "not just the natural world" but by her imagination: the "great comforter" (Barker 275). In both her poetry and prose, Brontë focuses on a "longing for death that rejected conventional views of Heaven in favour of a Paradise that was as like earth as possible" (364). Brontë's very language

describing Heathcliff and Hareton, specifically, and the Heights itself illustrates the importance of nature in her life. In regards to the house, *Wuthering Heights* endured “atmospheric tumult,” the north wind pummeling the house if the “excessive slant of a few stunted firs... [and] a range of gaunt thorns all stretching their limbs one way, as if craving alms of the sun” were any indication (Brontë 4). Lockwood describes its situation on a “bleak hill-top” with hard “black frost” on the ground with an air that made him “shiver through every limb” upon arriving at the Heights (9).

The only church mentioned in the novel, Gimmerton Kirk, exists in disrepair. “Many a window showed black gaps deprived of glass,” Mr. Lockwood reports, “and slates juttied off, here and there, beyond the right line of the roof, to be gradually worked off in coming autumn storms” (Brontë 326). The kirk as a place of worship is no longer necessary in Brontë’s religion of romance (Miller 211). God has been “transformed” into a new God of “amiable power who can, through human love, be possessed here and now” (211). Additionally, the statement that the “kirk has no minister” at the end of the novel indicates that there are no services held near the Heights (Brontë 284). The physical distance between traditional, Evangelical religion and the Heights echoes the metaphorical distance of Brontë’s religion of romance.

The only other kirk in the novel appears in a dream. During his first night at the Heights, Mr. Lockwood stays in Cathy’s old bedroom. In this fever dream, he attends a sermon where “either Joseph, the preacher, or [he] had committed the ‘First of the Seventy-First,’ [sins] and were to be publicly exposed and excommunicated” (Brontë 23). The dream kirk sits in a hollow “between two hills; an elevated hollow near a swamp whose peaty moisture is said to answer all the purposes of embalming on the few corpses deposited there. The roof had been kept whole

hitherto” but as the assigned clergyman’s salary wasn’t enough to afford repairs, no one took it upon themselves to help him as the “flock would rather let him starve than increase the living by one penny from their own pockets” (24). The parishioners ignore the Christian ethos of helping their neighbors in favor of supporting themselves. The selfishness ascribed to the church-goers signposts the hypocrisy of some devout Christians and, as they are described so early in the novel, readers understand that devout characters like Joseph should be read sarcastically.

More than a dream, the events at Gimmerdon Sough, the church of Lockwood’s dream, read like a nightmare both in content and execution. While the subject of the sermon is divisive (and “divided into *four hundred and ninety* parts, each fully equal to an ordinary address from the pulpit, and each discussing a separate sin!”), so, too, is the pastor’s execution of the message (Brontë 24, original emphasis). Lockwood’s exasperation in the moment of the sermon is almost palpable through the text. The descriptions in this dream emphasize the hypocrisy too often found in Evangelicalism and the absurdity of some over-eager clergymen. At the height of the dream, Mr. Lockwood rises and cries, “Fellow martyrs, have at [the pastor]! Drag him down, and crush him to atoms, that the place which knows him may know him no more” (Brontë 24). Mr. Lockwood addresses the congregation as ‘fellow martyrs’ suggesting that he and the others gathered are being persecuted for their religious beliefs, but the persecution they survive is the sermon of a pious individual. In response to Mr. Lockwood’s words, the pastor cries, “Lo, this is human weakness: this also may be absolved! The First of the Seventy-First is come. Bretheren, execute upon him the judgement written. Such honour have all His saints!” (Brontë 24). In a “body,” the “whole assembly, exalting their pilgrim’s staves” rushes upon Mr. Lockwood, using these staves and rods as weapons. Joseph is among Mr. Lockwood’s assailants and the “nearest

and most ferocious” of them (Brontë 25). Mr. Lockwood says, “presently, the whole chapel resounded with rappings and counter rappings: every man’s hand was against his neighbor” (Brontë 25). Perhaps it is the last line that most accurately captures the atmosphere of *Wuthering Heights* in Brontë’s own words: “every man’s hand was raised against his neighbour” (25). Her story pits neighbor against neighbor with little regard for the other’s wellbeing. This is the kind of Christianity Brontë’s story portrays and submits: a world of Evangelical absolutes and people who refuse to accept them. In this world, people don’t store their hopes and faiths in a man long dead. Instead, they are led by their desires.

Additionally, several key plot developments occur while everyone but Catherine and Heathcliff are attending services at the Kirk, such as the final reunion between the lovers. On a Sunday morning, with the church bells ringing and the household worshipping, Heathcliff returns to Catherine. The couple is alone at Thrushcross Grange, except for Nelly, in their first meeting since Edgar barred him from visiting. Traditionally, church bells call worshippers to the place of worship, and while Heathcliff is not journeying to the kirk, he is journeying to his place of worship: at Cathy’s side. In remaining home, the couple forgoes the community of worship in favor of their intimate and personal relationship. When Heathcliff enters the room, he and Catherine collapse into one another. This is the first and last embrace they share and arguably one of the novel’s most moving moments. In this moment, it becomes clear that the church is no longer necessary to our heroes as a building just as Christianity is no longer necessary as a religion. Catherine and Heathcliff’s romance offers the same intense, deep-seated connection found when worshipping Christ but in a novel way.

The Testament specifically is rendered unnecessary as the religious doctrine Cathy and Heathcliff follow is not written. Mr. Lockwood finds Catherine's journals written in the margins of her copy of the Testament when he stays in her room. "It was a Testament in lean type," Mr. Lockwood says, "and smelling dreadfully musty: a fly-leaf bore the inscription—'Catherine Earnshaw, her book,' and a date some quarter of a century back" (Brontë 20). He notes that "scarcely one chapter had escaped, a pen-and-ink commentary—at least the appearance of one—covering every morsel of blank that the printer had left" (20). Victorian readers considered marginalia to be proof that reading was a "strenuous production" as opposed to an "idle consumption" (Price 37). Furthering the desecration of the text, Catherine caricatures Joseph—the epitome of Evangelical religion in the text—in the corner of her Testament. Her caricature of Joseph highlights Catherine's irritation with Evangelicalism from an early age. Because her marginalia consist of journal entries and caricatures, she acts against the grain of society at large. Her blatant disregard for the Testament as a religious symbol shows her commitment to a different kind of religion—one written in the margins of traditional religion.

Because this moment occurs early in the novel before Nelly's recounting of the core story has begun, the reader enters into Catherine and Heathcliff's world with an understanding of how unnecessary Evangelical religion is to the hero and heroine.²⁵ Brontë was able to include specific

²⁵ The novel opens with a first-person narration by Mr. Lockwood who is leasing Thrushcross Grange from Heathcliff. He arrives at the Heights, introduces us to Joseph, the second Catherine, Heathcliff, and Hareton before being confronted with the ghost of the first Catherine. When he arrives at the Grange the next day, he meets Nelly and inquires into the relationships of the strange people at the Heights. Nelly, ever the gentle soul, sits down to explain the story of everything and everyone to Mr. Lockwood. The story then shifts to a first-person narration by Nelly with occasional reprieves into Mr. Lockwood's consciousness followed by a swift return to Nelly.

references to the Testament through Patrick's emphasis on the "importance of reading the Bible" to know it "inside and out" (Barker 146). In the midst of Isabella's confession to Nelly regarding the horrid nature of being Mrs. Heathcliff, she uses Biblical language:

"Oh, I owe him so much. On only one condition can I hope to forgive him, It is, if I may take an eye for an eye, a tooth for a tooth, for wrench of agony return a wrench: reduce him to my level As he was the first to injure, make him the first to implore pardon" (177).

Joseph, the most devout and hypocritical character of them all, repeatedly misquotes scripture; Brontë's writing of Joseph seems deliberate and emphasizes just how unnecessary organized religion is to this new religion.

Now, let us examine the naturalness of Cathy and Heathcliff's relationship in terms of both nature imagery and language. Cathy makes several declarations regarding the strength of her love for Heathcliff paralleling nature's strength. "Whatever our souls are made of," she says, "his and mine are the same; and Linton's is as different as a moonbeam from lightening, or front from fire" (Brontë 80).²⁶ A few pages later she says:

My love for Linton is like the foliage in the woods: time will chance it, I'm well aware, as winter changes the trees (82).

The use of nature imagery reinforces the earthly connection between Catherine and Heathcliff. If their religion is accepted as natural as trees or lightening and part of the self, then Edgar and the Church are artificial. To emphasize this, Catherine likens Edgar Linton to a 'moonbeam' and 'frost'—two cold things that slightly touch the earth, as if in passing, whereas Heathcliff is

²⁶ In the poem "From a Dungeon Wall in the Southern College. J. B. Sept., 1825," 'lightening' appears. Julius soliloquizes aloud to A.G.A. from his solitary confinement in the dungeon of the Southern College's Palace of Instruction, questioning the strength of her attachment (Ratchford 53). Her eyes "they flash, they burn with lightening shine, / But not with such fond fire as mine."

‘lightning’ and ‘fire.’²⁷ Heathcliff burns the earth in this analogy, leaving his mark. Not only does he touch it, fire-Heathcliff consumes the earth like their love consumes them both. Indeed, Cathy says “every Linton on the face of the earth might melt into nothing before I could ever choose to forsake Heathcliff,” once again emphasizing the consuming nature of their love and its ability to burn those around them, as well as Edgar’s fading nature (81). Heathcliff also speaks of their love, and Cathy’s for Linton, in natural terms:

And Catherine has a heart as deep as I have: the sea could be as readily contained in that horse-trough as her whole affection be monopolized by him [Linton].

Tush! (148)

...

[Linton] might as well plant an oak in a flower-pot, and expect it to thrive, as imagine he can restore her to vigour in the soil of his shallow cares! (152).

Perhaps Katherine Frank sums it up best: their love is some “immutable force of nature—a hurricane of an earthquake—that can’t be questioned or resisted or escaped” (220). Only physical reconciliation can appease their sins and give their souls peace, but, as we know, eighteen years of torment must pass before they achieve physical communion.

Remember Cathy’s statement that she would not rest buried in the ground without Heathcliff? (“I’ll not lie there by myself; they may bury me twelve feet deep, and throw the church down over me, but I won’t rest till you are with me. I never will!” (Brontë 125).) That moment continues, and she orders they bury her “on a green slope in the corner of the kirkyard, where the wall is so low that *heath* and bilberry-plants have climbed over it from the moor; and the peat-mould almost buries it” (166, emphasis added). Because the heath is mentioned at this

²⁷ Nelly described interactions between Cathy and the Lintons as follows: “it was not the thorn bending to the honeysuckles but the honeysuckles embracing the thorn. There were no mutual concession: one stood erect, and the others yielded, and who *can* be ill-natured and bad-tempered when they encounter neither opposition nor indifference” (Brontë 91).

moment, it reinforces the notion of the naturalness of Heathcliff. I don't mean in terms of his natural being but in terms of his being Cathy's natural choice and the only choice that truly adhered to the truth within her breast. It is not a slip of the tongue—or the pen—that she lands in the 'heath' upon her return. Heathcliff's name connects him to the Earth and reaffirms the belief in an earthly heaven with an earthly soulmate. Where 'heath' is an obvious earthly connection, so is 'cliff,' converting Heathcliff "into an image of underlying support," both in his name and as a person (Gose 9). As she confesses her love for Heathcliff, Catherine says, "My love for Heathcliff resembles the eternal rocks beneath: a source of little visible delight, but necessary" (Brontë 82). Her use of 'eternal' gives Heathcliff the same everlasting quality as the Penistone Crag near which Brontë lived.

Where Heathcliff is connected to nature, Edgar is tied to the materiality of life. When Cathy returns to the Heights from her stay at the Grange, she "lighted from a handsome black pony a very dignified person, with brown ringlets falling from the cover of a feathered beaver, and a long cloth habit, which she was obliged to hold up with both hands so that she might sail in" (Brontë 52). Before this moment, no real attention is paid to anyone's dress, least of all Cathy's, as Nelly continually describes Cathy's hellish attitude and dirty appearance. It is only after seeing Thrushcross Grange, and Edgar, in all its materiality that Cathy begins to care about things. Catherine admits that Heathcliff is a source of 'little visible delight' but still 'necessary' which conveys her knowledge that, while Heathcliff isn't the "proper" choice, her existence still depends upon his. Even in heaven, where she dreams she is an out-of-place, miserable sinner, the "angels were so angry that they flung [her] out into the middle of the heath on the top of Wuthering Heights; where [she] work sobbing for joy" (80). Emma Mason writes of Cathy's

“powerful to return to nature as invocative of a greater spirituality than orthodox religion is informed by enthusiasm” (267). This power is also threatened by its religious roots and only discoverable to Cathy as a ghost (267).

Even the second generation, born into this explosive and vindictive world, is connected to nature. Heathcliff wants to make Hareton like himself saying, “we’ll see if one tree won’t grow as crooked as another, with the same wind to twist it!” (Brontë 183).²⁸ F.H. Chorley wrote in 1847:

“The brutal master of the lonely house on “Wuthering Heights”—a prison which might be pictured from life—has doubtless has his prototype in those ungenial and remote districts where human beings, like the trees, grow gnarled and dwarfed and distorted by inclement climate.”

And young Catherine? She grew up like a “larch,” a “tree with tough, durable wood” (185). She was “soft and mild as a dove,” unlike her mother (185). But, perhaps the most descriptive natural images for the second generation concern animals.²⁹ J. Hillis Miller writes that the nature of human life within the Heights is defined by the animals seen there and this is one of the main ways the “spiritual strength of the characters is measured” (166; 167). Everything is natural and rugged and unafraid to fight; man is no different from the animals. People go on living only if

²⁸ One might also think of Cathy and Heathcliff’s relationship in terms of trees—they are “inseparably joined as trunk and root of the living tree” (Miller 174). Their self-inflicted separation forced the trunk to “persist in a universe from which it has been dissevered” (175). Without either trunk or tree, the other will not last long. This kind of disconnection is a death sentence as nature is “engaged in a constant act of suicide, tearing itself to pieces in attempt to prolong its life” (164).

The idea of Heathcliff twisting Hareton is later confirmed, Nelly saying, Heathcliff “bent his malevolence” on Hareton by “making him a brute” (Brontë 193). Heathcliff never taught Hareton to read or write and never “rebuked” a bad habit.

²⁹ Julius describes Agatha’s eyes as “falcon eyes” in “From a Dungeon Wall in the Southern College. J. B. Sept., 1825.”

their wills “remain powerful and direct, capable of action so immediate and unthinking that it can hardly be called the result of choice, but is a permanent and unceasing attitude of aggression” (167). This animality is caused by “the loss of an earlier state of civilized restraint” (168). “There are no laws for an animal to break, and there is nothing immoral in the slaughter of one animal by another,” and the characters in *Wuthering Heights* have returned to their animalistic state by sinning against human law, by twisting “moral” so it describes the most inhuman acts of cruelty (168). Heathcliff, when Cathy faints in his arms,

flung himself into the nearest seat, and on [Nelly’s] approaching hurriedly to ascertain if [Cathy] had fainted, he gnashed at [her], and foamed like a mad dog, and gathered her to him with greedy jealousy (159).

And later when Cathy is dead?

[Heathcliff] dashed his head against the knotted trunk: and, lifting up his eyes, howled, not like a man, but like a savage beast being goaded to death with knives and spears (165).

Heathcliff’s feelings, so overwhelmingly and violently felt, can only be expressed through the basest, most animalistic ways. Even young Catherine is left “heaving like a sea after a high wind” post dog-fight at the beginning of the novel. And the others? Linton “is scarcely a degree dearer to [Cathy] than her dog, or her horse. It is not him to be loved like me: how can she love in him what he has not? (Brontë 148). Catherine is a “stray lamb,” a “young greyhound,” and Hareton is “an obstinate as a mule” (189, 208, 301). Hareton is “just like a dog...or a cart-horse...he does his work, eats his food, and sleeps eternally!” (300). Heathcliff even calls the poor boy an “infernal calf!” (204). But Hareton, raised by Nelly before she and Cathy move to Thrushcross Grange, is remarked upon like a lost thing. She describes him as follows:

Good things lost amid a wilderness of weeds, to be sure, whose rankness far overtopped their neglected growth; yet, notwithstanding, evidence of a wealthy soil, that might yield luxurious crops under other and favorable circumstances (193).

Nelly never counts Hareton out, blaming Heathcliff for the twisted nature of her past charge.

Another moment of parallelism and nature imagery between Brontë's novel and poems concerns flowers.³⁰ Nelly says to young Catherine, "Winter is not here yet. There's a little flower up yonder, the last bud from the multitude of bluebells that clouded those turf steps in July with a lilac mist" (Brontë 224). Similarly in Gondal, A.G.A. laments the murder of her child, seeing the bluebell as a reminder of her lost child:

Bluebell, even as all divine
I have seen my darling shine—
Bluebell, even as wan and frail,
I have seen my darling fail—
Thou hast found a voice for me,
And soothing words are breathed by thee

They murmur, 'Summer's sun
Warms me till my life is done.
Would I choose to die
Under winter's ruthless sky?...' (Ratchford 127).

In *Wuthering Heights*, the bluebell that survived winter's chill is young Catherine whereas the bluebell appearing in Gondal is the child Agatha left to die in the mountains. The symbolism of a flower, dainty and innocent, surviving something as cold and desolate as winter falls in line with Brontë's use of nature in her works. For young Catherine, she is the humility of her mother, a leftover form of innocence not carried into the afterlife. Also associated with everlasting love and constancy, children in literature are generally regarded as the product of true love and serve as

³⁰ Again, these parallelisms function as ties between the 'first draft' of the novel in Brontë's poems and illustrate her ongoing fascination with spiritual and romantic religion.

pleasant reminders to the surviving lover of the deceased. Not so in Brontë's world. Children are unpleasant baggage to be murdered and tortured, in Agatha and Heathcliff's worlds, respectively.

But, nature prevails. The second generation gardens together against Heathcliff's and Joseph's wishes, solidifying the naturalness of their relationship and their growth as individuals and a couple. The moment where the growth of the garden is discussed displays several different but key aspects of the novel. Catherine admits to Heathcliff who is roaring at Joseph that she and Hareton "wanted to plant some flowers there" (Brontë 308). She claims Heathcliff stole all her land, her money as well as Hareton's land and money. At Heathcliff's claim that she never had any land or money to lose, she reveals that she and Hareton "are friends now" and that she "will tell him all about [Heathcliff]" (309). Heathcliff rises to strike her, an "expression of mortal hate" on his face (309). Catherine antagonizes by saying, "If you strike me, Hareton will strike you... so you may as well sit down" (309). This statement, while not as moving as Heathcliff's cries after Cathy's death, illustrates a shift in the paradigm of *Wuthering Heights*. Hareton, traditionally loyal to Heathcliff based upon his serving as Hareton's foster father, however horrible a father he was, seems to shift. Does his love and thus loyalty to Catherine outweigh Heathcliff's hold on him? When Heathcliff grabs a handful of Catherine's hair in attempts to silence her, Hareton attempts to free her. As this occurs so close to Heathcliff's death, he releases them both with a suddenly assumed calmness (310). Nelly comments on the growth of Hareton and Catherine saying:

His honest, warm, and intelligent nature shook off rapidly the clouds of ignorance and degradation in which it had been bred; and Catherine's sincere commendations acted as a spur to his industry. His brightening mind brightened his features, and added spirit and nobility to their aspect (311).

This moment illustrates not only the literal growth of feelings, but also the violent physical abuses of Heathcliff and the efforts of Hareton to protect Catherine in a way Heathcliff never attempted to protect Cathy. In short, nature plays a key role in the characters' mediation of a religion of romance and in their relationships, and gardening serves as one of the two major movements Catherine and Hareton make on their journey to independence.³¹

³¹ I will discuss the other major movement, Catherine teaching Hareton to read, in the next chapter.

Chapter Three: Another Way

In the second half of the novel after Cathy's death, Nelly raises Cathy's daughter Catherine at Thrushcross Grange, and Heathcliff returns to the Heights where he lives alone for twelve to thirteen years. At that time, Isabella Linton Heathcliff dies, and Edgar fetches her son Linton from the city. When Heathcliff hears of these developments, he sends Joseph to bring the boy to the Heights. Joseph arrives on their doorstep that very night, dressed in his "Sunday garments" and with a "most sanctimonious and sourest face" (Brontë 198). Edgar acquiesces to Heathcliff's demands, and Linton is escorted to the Height to next morning. Close to three years pass before Heathcliff's plan to gain control of the Grange is put into action. He tricks Catherine into coming to the Heights with him, and, on a different occasion, locks her in a room until she consents to marry Linton. In marrying Linton, ownership of the Grange passes to Heathcliff's son, thereby making Catherine entirely dependent upon Heathcliff, much like everyone else at the Heights, and taking Edgar Linton's daughter away from him. Both Lintons die soon after the marriage is complete, but Catherine remains trapped at the Heights. Eventually, she and Hareton overcome their initial discontent towards each other and fall in love. Heathcliff, on seeing the love he and Cathy should have had in the Catherine and Hareton's relationship, wills himself to death, and the novel ends peacefully.

But, this second generation finds themselves thrust into the middle of their parents' new form of religion. Keep in mind that a religion of romance dictates that one must be with their true love specifically physically although not always consummately. The relationship between Hareton and Catherine occurs slowly over a period of time, possibly years, but the dates are vague. In many ways, their love signifies the consolidation of Cathy and Heathcliff's romance.

For one, it appears possible only because Heathcliff and Cathy “liberated energies from the region of boundless sympathy into his world” via their deaths (Miller 209). The contagion that is true love, or love improperly handled, does not effect the second generation in the same way. Instead of suffering unto death, they successfully navigate the aftermath of Cathy and Heathcliff. For another, “a religious myth, to be valid, must become the form of a collective belief, and permeate the culture of a group” (Miller 157). A guiding text is necessary to a successful religion of romance.

Hareton and Catherine’s relationship “brings about the re-establishment of civilization” through Catherine teaching him to read, the first, true moment of connection between the two, and in cultivating a garden together (Miller 206). Their love solidifies and perpetuates the religion of romance. In organizing the second generation into the same situation he, Cathy, and Edgar found themselves in, Heathcliff unintentionally aids the perpetuation of the religion of romance, ultimately helping Catherine and Hareton unite. He speaks to Nelly of his pleasure with Hareton’s position in life and in relation to Catherine—almost identical to Heathcliff’s with Cathy.

He has satisfied my expectations. If he were born a fool I should not enjoy it half so much. But he’s no fool; and I can sympathise with his feelings, having felt them myself. I know what he suffers now, for instance, exactly: it is merely a beginning of what he shall suffer, though. And he’ll never be able to emerge from his bathos of coarseness and ignorance. (Brontë 214).

Heathcliff knows full well what he’s doing and exhibits no qualms concerning belittling Hareton.

That being said, before they walk off into the sunset, Catherine and Hareton endure the hellish world of living with Heathcliff at the Heights post-Cathy’s death, and the effects of living under such depression and violence shows in their physical appearances. When Lockwood first

sees Catherine and introduces her at the beginning of the novel, she is “scarcely past girlhood” (Brontë 11). She had small and very fair features and either flaxen or golden ringlets, but it was her eyes that caught Lockwood’s attention (11). If her eyes had been “agreeable in expression,” he says,

“[they] would have been irresistible: fortunately for [his] susceptible heart, the only sentiment they evinced hovered between scorn and a kind of desperation, singularly unnatural to be detected there” (11).

Catherine’s eyes convey the torment Heathcliff inflicts living in a post-Cathy world for his “sadistic treatment of others is the only kind of revenge against Cathy he can take” (Miller 195).

The effect of living in Heathcliff’s hell is evidenced in her physical appearance and her personality. As a child, Catherine was “the most winning thing” and brought “sunshine into a desolate house” with her high spirit and sensitive heart (185). While the “capacity for intense attachments” reminded Nelly of Cathy, Catherine did not otherwise resemble her mother (185).³² She was a gentle soul; “her anger was never furious” and “her love never fierce” as it was “deep and tender” (185).

Living there, Hareton emulates Heathcliff’s violence, if only because he doesn’t know any better. Heathcliff’s attempts to grow Hareton as twisted as himself proved true, as well. At least until Catherine’s love untwists him. As a child, Hareton is seen “hanging a litter of puppies from a chair-back” (Brontë 179). His physical features mirror Heathcliff’s, as well, his face

³² While Nelly does not cite the following characteristics as being like Cathy, I believe that, given out discussion so far, they do. To foil the sweetness outlined above, Nelly describes Catherine’s “propensity to be saucy” and the “perverse will” of “indulged children” (Brontë 185).

Catherine rules over her father’s feelings. Nelly saying, “ere the tiny thing could stammer a word or totter a step it wielded a despot’s scepter in [her father’s] heart” (Brontë 180).

turning “black as a thunder-cloud” when Cathy angers him at their first meeting (191).³³

Heathcliff and Joseph’s determination to stunt Hareton’s growth leave him dumb and in a “state of complete dependence on his father’s inveterate enemy” (184). The true horror lies in Hareton’s inability to “right himself” because of his lack of friends but most importantly his “ignorance that he has been wronged” (184)! Hareton should have been “the first gentleman in the neighbourhood,” according to Nelly, as he was truly a “well-made, athletic youth, good-looking in features, and stout and healthy,” but Heathcliff’s degradation prevented his ascension (193). Additionally, where Heathcliff’s appearance, as dark and other, served as a detriment to his standing, Hareton’s did not. And the opposite is true of their intellects. Either way, Heathcliff made sure Hareton lived in the same depraved manner as himself.

Young Linton is also affected by the dark, vindictive nature of his father, the sin of his father’s union with his mother, and the general, lack of “ruddy health” not found in the Linton bloodline (Brontë 187). He is described as a “pale, delicate, effeminate boy, who might have been taken for [Edgar Linton’s] younger brother, so strong was the resemblance: but there was a sickly peevishness in his aspect that Edgar Linton never had” (196). His personification as a weakling is reinforced multiple times over. Nelly notes with nervousness the way his “white complexion and slim frame” as well as his “large languid eyes—his mother’s eyes” that lacked her “sparkling spirit” looked on their way to move him into the Heights (202). Heathcliff, upon seeing his son, says to Nelly, “God? what a beauty! what a lovely, charming thing!...Hav’n’t they reared it on snails and sour milk, Nelly? Oh, damn my soul! but that’s worse than I expected

³³ Interestingly and somewhat unsettling is the fact that Hareton is eighteen at this time and Catherine is only thirteen. Linton is six months younger than Catherine, so his age at this first introduction is vague; he’s either twelve or thirteen.

—and the devil knows I'm not sanguine!" (203). He also refers to Linton as his 'property,' an 'it', and a 'puling chicken' (203). Linton's weakness stems from the weakness of affection between his parents. Because Heathcliff only married and impregnated Isabella to spite Cathy and Edgar, there is no affection to feed their child. And, in a world built around the mystical, obsessive love Heathcliff has for Cathy, any offspring with anyone else cannot exist.

But it is Heathcliff's statement "I despise him for himself, and hate him for the memories he revives!" that betrays the still-present torment Heathcliff carries (Brontë 204). His personal hell without Cathy continues and somehow justifies his actions. Well, not truly justifies them, but the reader can understand the depth of his personal torment without her and the need to inflict unhappiness on those around him. While not a member of this solidifying second generation, Heathcliff is perhaps the best example of the hell that is *Wuthering Heights* without Cathy. Even his physical body is effected. The forehead Nelly once thought "so manly" turned "diabolical [and] was shaded with a heavy cloud" (176). In the weeks following Cathy's death, his "basilisk eyes" looked "nearly quenched by sleeplessness, and weeping," she presumed, "for the lashes were wet," and his trademark "ferocious sneer" found itself replaced by lips "sealed in an expression of unspeakable sadness" (176). His entrapment in this earthly hell causes him to physically lash out at the second generation and those around them. We are aware of the abuses Hareton and young Linton suffer at Heathcliff's hand from Nelly's summations, but none are detailed within the narrative save for Catherine's. In one such instance, Catherine, in a show of bravery, screams she is not afraid of Heathcliff to his face. Heathcliff "seized her with the liberated hand, and, pulling her on his knee, administered with the other a shower of terrific slaps on both sides of the head" (261). Catherine "trembled like a reed" and couldn't seem to

determine if her ears were “off or on” (262). The increased violence towards Catherine indicates Heathcliff’s unresolved anger towards Cathy.

But, perhaps the most telling moment of Heathcliff’s continued obsession—and one of the most memorable—is his decision to dig up Cathy’s grave—not once, but twice. On the day Cathy was buried, Heathcliff went to the churchyard. As he was alone, knowing no one else would brace the snowstorm to visit her grave and “conscious of [only] two yards of loose earth” acting as the “sole barrier” between them, Heathcliff exhumes her corpse, crying:

I’ll have her in my arms again! If she be cold, I’ll think it is the north wind that chills *me*; and if she be motionless it is sleep (278).

He breaks apart the coffin with his hands, cracking the wood near the screws. As he feverishly digs, a “sigh from some one above, close at the edge of the grave” sounded near him (278). He continued digging only to hear another sigh, this one close to his ear. He felt the “warm breath of it displacing the sleet-laden wind” (278-9). Knowing no other living body stood near, Heathcliff assumes it to be Cathy’s ghost.

I felt that Cathy was there: not under me, but on earth. A sudden sense of relief flowed from my heart through every limb...Her presence was with me (279).

Does Cathy’s ghost appear to Heathcliff on that night? He seems to think so, going on to describe all the ways in which her ghost stays with him, haunting him just like he begged.

The second exhumation occurs in the night of Edgar’s burial. Heathcliff convinces the sexton to remove the lid of Cathy’s coffin. The face he saw there, buried some 18 years, was the exact same face he last kissed before she died (which we know to be a scientific impossibility).³⁴

³⁴ The scientific impossibility of Cathy’s corpse not disintegrating could be reference to Catholicism’s rich history of unearthing saints in the same fashion and finding their bodies in tact, but this is not something this paper addresses.

He removed the side of her coffin farthest from Linton and paid the sexton to remove that matching side from Heathcliff's coffin when he died so that they might dissolve into each other. The nature ties here are hard to miss. If we take one large part of their love to be its naturalness, then the idea of them dissolving into each other as part of the natural decomposition process fits. Their bodies will decompose into mulch and merge together and they will fertilize the earth. Their romance is, as we've discussed, an earthly one that emphasizes one's heaven on earth or just in the presence of your true love. For Cathy and Heathcliff, lying in the dirt and decomposing is a heaven. Their bodies are no longer their own but something more natural and earthly. Even when she dies, Heathcliff cries

...what does not recall her [Cathy]? I cannot look down at this floor, but her features are shaped in the flags! In ever cloud, in every tree-filling the air at night, and caught by glimpses in every object by day—I am surrounded with her image! (Brontë 312-13)

Cathy never leaves the earth. Instead, she remains as a spiritual presence around Heathcliff. The communion both sought so adamantly is achieved. The novel does not leave room for Cathy and Heathcliff to consummate their love physical before her death, no matter what Hollywood says, and it is this planned reunion that facilitates their coming together.

One of Catherine's biggest issues with Hareton is his illiteracy. Neither Heathcliff nor Joseph taught him to read, intent on resigning him to a station below his birthright. In order to impress her, Hareton brings Catherine's attention to the words inscribed above a door in the stables. He manages to read his own name there, Hareton Earnshaw, but cannot make out the figures. Catherine calls him a "dunce" and mocks the fact that he "conned his A B C to please" her (Brontë 241-42). As the novel progresses and Heathcliff, realizing the futility of his plans and

the growth of his need to be with Cathy and becoming absent more and more, the young couple uses literature and learning as a way to flirt. In Hareton's first attempt to reconcile with Catherine, he whispers to Zillah, an inconsequential housemaid at the Heights,

Will you ask her to read to us, Zillah? I'm stalled of doing naught, and I do like—
I could like to hear her! Dunnot say I wanted it, but ask of yourseln (286).

When she passes his request along to Catherine, cruelly mentioning that it *is* Hareton's request, Catherine refuses crying that she "reject[s] any pretense at kindness" the inmates of the Heights offer (286). Given the state of her life at the Heights, terrorized by Heathcliff and treated as a prisoner, it is no wonder she rejects friendship with Hareton who loves Heathcliff and seems to align himself with the monster. Of Hareton reading her books she says,

Those books, both prose and verse, are consecrated to me by other associations; and I hate to have them debased and profaned in his mouth! Besides, of all, he has selected my favorite pieces that I love the most to repeat, as if out of deliberate malice (291)

Catherine obtusely misses the point of Hareton's attempts to read her favorite pieces—he is not malicious but striving to please her. At these words, though, he throws the books into the fire. Nelly mentions the anguish clear on his countenance to burn them, but a "physical argument" was unfortunately his only means of responding eloquently (291).

One major flaw in Cathy and Heathcliff's relationship, outside of the obvious, is their lack of self-improvement. Yes, Heathcliff goes off to seek his fortune and improvement of his station but only as a retaliation to Cathy's marriage, and she never changes. Catherine and Hareton, however, use the teaching and learning of literature, respectively, as a method of growth. Nelly describes them best: "both their minds [tended] towards the same point—one loving and desiring to esteem, and the other loving and desiring to be esteemed" (Brontë 305).

Her description comes on the heels of the moment of reconciliation between the two. Catherine attempts to speak with Hareton, who flings her away and begs her to leave him alone. He cries, “she hates me, and does not think me fit to wipe her shoon!”³⁵ Catherine replies, “It is not I who hate you, it is you who hate me!... You hate me as much as Mr. Heathcliff does, and more” (305). At this point, Heathcliff’s goal of keeping Hareton beneath and in conflict with Catherine seems assuredly attained. Yet, Hareton’s next words alter that paradigm: “You’re a damned liar... why have I made him angry, by taking your part, then, a hundred times?” (303). Hareton’s repeated attempts to intercede with Heathcliff on Catherine’s behalf redeem his Heathcliff-inflicted faults and endears readers to him. He is chivalrous in a book sorely lacking any kind of moral compass.

Catherine is flummoxed by this revelation, and in a move showing herself a better person than her mother, she replies, “I didn’t know you took my part... and I was miserable and bitter at everybody; but now I thank you, and beg you to forgive me” (Brontë 303). She kisses Hareton on the cheek as means of apology and wraps a book in white paper addressed to ‘Mr. Hareton Earnshaw.’ Nelly delivers it across the room with Catherine’s message that, should he accept the gift, Catherine would teach him to read. The slight rustle of paper announces his acceptance of her offer, and Catherine steals away to sit quietly beside him (304). And although Nelly could not hear all of their exchange, she did observe “two such radiant countenances bent over the page of the accepted book, that [she] did not doubt that the treaty had been ratified on both sides; and the enemies were thenceforth sworn allies” (304). This singular moment illustrates the differences between the first and second generation as well as why the second generation is allowed a peaceful life. Under a religion built upon interpersonal relationships and a dedication to one

³⁵ Shoes

person, Catherine and Hareton move in the direction of true, reciprocal affection through improvement where Cathy and Heathcliff destroyed each other. In that sense, a religion of romance necessitates books to spread the good news and for the second generation to successfully survive adhering to a religion of romance.

Indeed at the end of our story's timeline, Mr. Lockwood sees Catherine and Hareton reading together through a window. As Hareton reads, Catherine offers kisses as rewards, the two continuing to use books as facilitators. Does this importance placed on books attempt to impart to readers the importance of the very text in their hand? Is Emily Brontë suggesting that education is the only way to truly improve oneself and one's relations? There is not enough room in this paper to fully discuss such ideas, but the importance of this moment and the evolution of Catherine and Hareton's relationship via books is unmistakably important. In short, the love between Catherine and Hareton serves the true purpose of love: to better oneself. Their relationship flourishes because they adhere to the religion as set out by their predecessors.

So, where does this leave us? In a post-Cathy and romance-as-religion hell on earth, what do we have left? Are we left with an as-of-yet unidentified bridge between the hell of Heathcliff and the peace at the end of the novel? As previously mentioned throughout this paper, that bridge is the successful relationship of Hareton and Catherine. While their relationship is essentially the same as their predecessors in that they inhabit the same class spaces as their counterparts and seem to emulate key characteristics as well, the second generation's romance reads differently.³⁶ Where Heathcliff and Cathy's love is given to readers through their actions and narration, the

³⁶ Catherine's journey moves from separation to union, unlike her mother's which moved from union to separation (Miller 206).

romance between Hareton and Catherine grows before our eyes. Perhaps it is the fact that they are not children. Perhaps it is the that fact they weren't raised as siblings. For whatever reason, Catherine and Hareton work together to reach the illustrious point of romantic communion through two very distinct avenues: reading and gardening.³⁷

³⁷ See the end of Chapter Two for a discussion of gardening in relation to the second generation.

Conclusion

Due to the inordinate amount of grief Emily Brontë experienced early in life, it is no wonder that both her masterpieces, *Wuthering Heights* and the Gondal poems, focus on a dark, tormented life animated with the promise of a peaceful heaven. Set in a world where God has already fallen, all that remains is a devotion to something bigger than oneself. If that higher power is love, then so be it. A religion of romance cannot be discounted simply because it is not canonized, ritualized, or structured. Catherine and Hareton's navigation of these ideas offers an achievable model for readers to emulate. The world of the novel is a terrifying place for someone unable to navigate its spiritual-but-not-Christian religiosity. Contemporary readers—and even readers today—find something captivating in the novel. Is it the characters' blatant disregard for Victorian sensibilities? Is it the mysticism of the moors and the ghosts who haunt them? Or is it the idea of a world where love rules so supremely? Whatever the cause, *Wuthering Heights* has and will stand the test of time as a novel of “inhuman brutality” as well as a validation of an “existence of yours beyond you” (Miller 167; Brontë 81).

Wuthering Heights, despite being a “defiant rejection of conventional organized religion,” is also a “triumphant declaration of faith” in something outside oneself (483). This idea of something larger is not traditional Christianity's idea of God or heaven, but a more nature-based spiritualism mediated through your love and devotion to one person. In equating the love and devotion Cathy and Heathcliff have for one another to that of Christians to Christ, love becomes a thing that “convicts, converts, sanctifies, teaches, directs, comforts, inspires, and empowers” them, much like the Holy Spirit (Wang 162). The story is dangerous in that behaving as Cathy

and Heathcliff do is madness, but, in terms of play-acting the role of obsessed, passion-consumed lover, the novel succeeds.

From the beginning of the novel, ghosts play an important role. Lockwood awakens from his church nightmare to a fir bough scratching the window of Cathy's old oak-box bed. He goes to move the branch, and his "fingers closed on the fingers of a little, ice-cold hand" (Brontë 25)! "Let me in—let me in," the ghost of Catherine Linton sobbed in a "most melancholy voice" (25). She claims she's been a "waif for twenty years" as "just punishment for her mortal transgressions" (26). This moment alerts readers to the existence of the supernatural in this world, but Cathy's plea also speaks to Lockwood and the reader at large. Lockwood, whose name highlights his locked-tight life, needs to open himself up to the story Nelly tells, and the reader should follow suit. *Wuthering Heights* is a sublime novel, but if one is not open to the ideas within, the story will not have as strong an effect. The fact that Cathy Linton urges us to let her in supports the idea that the author understands the importance of literacy and books to a religion of romance. However, Lockwood and the novel's readers must not make the same mistakes as Cathy. Her appearance as a ghost, trapped and punished for her mortal transgressions, simultaneously warns readers away from behaving as she did and entices them.

At the end of the novel, upon leaving Heathcliff's newly-made grave, Nelly encounters a young boy scared to move from the spot in which he stood, citing "Heathcliff and a woman yonder, under t' nab" as the reason (325). In this moment, the "otherness of nature is replaced by the more frightening otherness of a ghost, and the stormy moors are established as the expressions of a supernatural as well as a natural violence" (Miller 169-170). The idea that remnants of Cathy and Heathcliff's ghosts could wander the moors is somewhat terrifying. What

does the existence of ghosts do to Brontë's narrative? For one, I believe ghosts reaffirm the earth-bound nature and naturalness of Cathy and Heathcliff's relationship. For another, their earthly communion offers resolution to the novel's interruptions.

And where does this leave us? What becomes of Heathcliff? After eighteen years of suffering and inflicting pain on those around him, he, much like Cathy, wills himself to death. His entire existence post-Cathy drives towards one goal: to make everyone else as miserable as he. J. Hillis Miller argues that Heathcliff's sadism ultimately fails as all "things or people [around him] are annihilated" and he is "left with nothing;" instead, Heathcliff "reaches only an exacerbated sense of the absence of the longed-for intimacy rather than the intimacy itself" (Miller 196-7). Does this failure of his ultimate goal categorize Heathcliff himself as a failure? I say no. Heathcliff's purpose in the novel is to serve as the face of all-consuming passions. His death, despite the passions ruling his life, is peaceful, much like Cathy's. Both characters will themselves to death upon realizing the path they wished to follow is unattainable.³⁸

A few days before he dies, Heathcliff says, "Last night I was on the threshold of hell. Today, I am within sight of my heaven" (317). He tells Nelly:

I appreciate you worrying over me, only you and Hareton need accompany me to the cemetery. No minister need come; nor need anything be said over me.—I tell you I have nearly attained my heaven; and that of others is altogether unvalued and uncoveted by me" (322)

³⁸ Cathy desired a world in which she could eat her cake and have it, too, be marrying Edgar and enjoying the luxury of Thrushcross Grange while also maintaining her relationship with Heathcliff. And Heathcliff desired a world where everyone suffered as he did without Cathy.

Heathcliff's focus centers solely on the heavenly world created by his communion with Cathy. There is no other heaven for him save the one found by her side. Heathcliff's death occurs after violently pacing in his room. He argues with Cathy's ghost and begs her to appear, wandering upstairs at night, refusing to eat during the day, moaning for Catherine in a voice "low and earnest, and wrung from the depth of his soul" (321). It is only after disappearing into Cathy's old room and lying in her bed which is described as an enclosed box with a roof, walls, and a door—a coffin of sorts—that he dies with his eyes open (324). Hareton's torment at Heathcliff's death signals another aspect of his growth beyond the bounds Heathcliff ascribed to him as a child.

But poor Hareton, the most wronged, was the only one who really suffered much. he sat by the corpse all night, weeping in bitter earnest. He pressed its hand, and kissed the sarcastic, savage face that every one else shrank from contemplating; and bemoaned him with that strong grief which springs naturally from a generous heart, though it be tough as tempered steel (324).

Nelly's description of Hareton's grief strengthens the character of Hareton, highlighting a major difference between the two men's reactions to the death of loved ones as well as the presence of empathy in Hareton as evident by his "steaming face" at Heathcliff's burial (325). But, this grief fits into the new Hareton's character as his relationship with Catherine, as mediated through reading, betters him, even if the shadow of Heathcliff follows him.

The novel ends with Lockwood watching Catherine and Hareton leave the Heights moving to Thrushcross Grange, looking like "together, they would brave Satan and all his legions" (Brontë 326). He wanders out onto the moors, past the crumbling kirk, until he reached three headstones: Cathy's, Edgar's, and Heathcliff's. After the turmoil of the novel—even the

turmoil specific to Lockwood's experiences at the Heights and the Grange—the peace he describes is haunting in its purity and simplicity:

I lingered round them, under that benign sky: watched the moths fluttering among the heath and the harebells, listened to the soft wind breathing through the grass, and wondered how any one could ever imagine unquiet slumbers for the sleepers in that quiet earth (326).

The atrocities committed by Heathcliff and Cathy unto themselves and others seem to bear no weight upon their fate in the ground. It seems they have passed through the pearly gates into heaven—a heaven on their own making and dependent solely on their love for one another. Even *Wuthering Heights* itself is peaceful. The weather was “sweet and warm, the grass as green as showers and the sun could make it” (315). There was a “spring fragrance around” and a “beautiful soft blue overhead.” Even the buildings (aside from the crumbling church) present a peaceful facade.

Just like the peace given to Cathy and Heathcliff at the end of the novel, A.G.A finds peace. In the end, her faithful captain of the guard, Lord Eldred is the only one left to mourn her. And, much like Mr. Lockwood in *Wuthering Heights*, he stands above her grave and laments her passing. He mentions the “linnet in the rocky dells” and the “moor-lark in the air” and the “bee among the heather-bells” hiding his lady (Ratchford 159). Lord Eldred gives her the same peace Cathy, Heathcliff, and Linton find at the end saying,

Blow, west wind, by the lonely mound,
And murmur, summer streams,
There is no need of other sound
To soothe my Lady's dream (160)

Although the sentiment expressed here is not nearly as peaceful as the ending words of *Wuthering Heights*, traces are there. Despite the pain and heartache she's caused, Augusta Geraldine Almeda (AGA) is given the same peaceful sleep as Cathy and Heathcliff, their communion finally achieved.

Works Cited

- Anonymous. Review of *Wuthering Heights*. Examiner. 8 January 1848. <https://www.wuthering-heights.co.uk/wh/reviews.php>
- Barker, Juliet. "The Brontës." New York. St. Martin's Press, 1994. Print.
- Brontë, Emily. "Wuthering Heights." New York. Barnes and Noble Classics, 2004. Print.
- Brontë's, The. "Tales of Glass Town, Angria, and Gondal: Selected Writings." Ed. Christine Alexander. Oxford University Press. Oxford, UK. 2010.
- Brontë Parsonage Museum. "The Brontë's & Haworth: Family History." Accessed Dec. 27, 2018. <https://www.bronte.org.uk/the-brontes-and-haworth/family-history>
- Chorley, F.H. Review of *Wuthering Heights*. Athenaeum, 25 December 1847. <https://www.wuthering-heights.co.uk/wh/reviews.php>
- Frank, Katherine. "A Chainless Soul: A Life of Emily Brontë." Boston. Houghton Mifflin Company, 1990. Print.
- Geerken, Ingrid. "'The Dead Are Not Annihilated': Mortal Regret in 'Wuthering Heights.'" *Journal of Narrative Theory*. Vol. 34. 3. (Fall 2004). 373-406.
- Ghnassia, Jill Dix. "Metaphysical Rebellion in the Works of Emily Brontë: A Reinterpretation." New York. St. Martin's Press, 1994. Print.
- Gose, Elliot B. Jr. "Wuthering Heights: The Heath and the Hearth." *Nineteenth Century Fiction*. Vol 21. 1. (June 1966). 1-19.
- Gould, G. L. (1974). *Emily Bronte's Relation To Gondal As Subject Of "Wuthering Heights."* (Order No. 7420658). Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global.

(302717488). Retrieved from <http://0-search.proquest.com.library.uark.edu/docview/302717488?accountid=8361>

Jay, Elisabeth. "Spirituality." *The Cambridge History of Victorian Literature*, edited by Kate Flint, Cambridge UP, 2012, 350-369.

Jay, Elisabeth. "The Religion of the Heart: Anglican Evangelicalism in the Nineteenth-Century Novel." Oxford. Clarendon Press, 1979. Print.

Jager, Colin. "Unquiet Things: Secularism in the Romantic Age." University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia. 2015.

Kluchin, Abigail. "Religious Affects: Animality, Evolution, and Power." *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, vol. 84, no. 2, June 2016, pp. 578–580. EBSCOhost, doi:10.1093/jaarel/lfw039

Lorimer, James. Review of *Wuthering Heights*. *North British Review*, ~1847. <https://www.wuthering-heights.co.uk/wh/reviews.php>

Mason, Emma. "'Some God of Wild Enthusiast's Dreams': Emily Brontë's Religious Enthusiasm." *Victorian Literature and Culture*, vol. 31, no. 1, 2003, pp. 263–277. *JSTOR*, JSTOR, www.jstor.org/stable/25058623.

Marcus, Sharon. "Sexuality." *The Cambridge History of Victorian Literature*, edited by Kate Flint, Cambridge UP, 2012, 422-443. Print.

Miller, J. Hillis. "The Disappearance of God: Five Nineteenth Century Writers." Cambridge, MA. Belknap Press of Harvard University, 1963. Print.

Price, Leah. "Victorian Reading." *The Cambridge History of Victorian Literature*, edited by Kate Flint, Cambridge UP, 2012, 34-55.

Ratchford, Fannie E. *Gondal's Queen: A Novel in Verse by Emily Brontë*. University of Texas Press. Austin, 1955.

Reardon, M. G. Bernard. "Religion in the Age of Romanticism." Cambridge. Cambridge University Press, 1985. Print.

Reardon, M. G. Bernard. "Religious Thought in the Nineteenth Century: Illustrated from Writers of the Period." Cambridge. Cambridge University Press, 1966. Print.

Ward, Maryanne C. "Romancing the Ending: Adaptations in Nineteenth-Century Closure." *The Journal of the Midwest Modern Language Association*, Vol. 29, No. 1 (Spring, 1996), pp. 15-31 <http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/1315255.pdf?refreqid=excelsior%3A4282e0a20b5dee68e124756b714ed03b>

Wang, Lisa. "The Holy Spirit in Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights* and Poetry." *Literature and Theology*. Vol. 14. 2. (June 2000). 160-173.

Appendix A

F. De Samara to A.G.A.

E. November 1st 1838

Light up thy halls! 'Tis closing day;
 I'm drear and lone and far away—
 Cold blows on my breast, the northwind's bitter sigh
 And Oh, my couch is bleak beneath the rainy sky!

Light up thy halls—and think not of me;
 That face is absent now, thou has hated so to see—
 Bright be thine eyes, undimmed their dazzling shine,
 For never, never more shall they encounter mine!

The desert moor is dark; there is tempest in the air;
 I have breathed my only wish in one last, one burning prayer—
 A prayer that would come forth although it lingered long;
 That set on fire my heart, but froze upon my tongue—

And now, it shall be done before the morning rise;
 I will not watch the sun ascend in yonder skies.
 One task alone remains—they pictured face to view
 And then I go to prove if God, at least, be true!

Do I not see thee now? They black resplendant hair;
 Thy glory-beaming brow, and smile how heavenly fair!
 Thine eyes are turned away—those eyes I would not see;
 Their dark, their deadly ray would more than madden me

There, go, Deciever, go! My hand is streaming wet,
 My heart's blood flows to buy the blessing—To forget!
 Oh could that lost heart give back, back again to thine
 One tenth part of the pain that clouds my dark decline!

Oh could I see they lids weighted down in cheerless woe;
 Too full to hide their tears, too stern to overflow;
 Oh could I know thy soul with equal greif was torn—
 This fate might be endured—this anguish might be born!

How gloomy grows the Night! 'Tis Gondal's wind that blows
 I shall not tread again the deep glens where it rose—
 I feel it on my face—where, wild Blast, dost thou roam?
 What do we, wanderer, here? So far away from home?

I do not need thy breath to cool my death-cold brow
 But go to that far land where She is shining now;
 Tell Her my latest wish, tell Her my dreary doom;
 Say that my pangs are past, but Hers are yet to come—

Vain words—wain, frenzied thoughts! No ear can hear me call—
 Lost in the vacant air my frantic curses fall—
 And could she see me now, perchance her lip would smile
 Would smile in careless pride and utter scorn the while!

And yet, for all Her hate, each parting glance would tell
 A stronger passion breathed, burned in this last farewell—
 Unconquered in my soul the Tyrant rules me still
Life bows to my control, but, Love I cannot kill!
 (Brontës 400-401)

Appendix B

‘You teach my how how cruel you’ve been—cruel and false. *Why* did you despise me? *Why* did you betray your own heart, Cathy? I have not one word of comfort. You deserve this. You have killed yourself. Yes, you may kiss me, and cry; and wring out my kisses and tears: they’ll blight you—they’ll damn you. You loved me—then what *right* had you to leave me? What right—answer me—for the poor fancy you felt for Linton? Because misery and degradation, and death, and nothing that God or Satan could inflict would have parted us, *you*, of your own will, did it. I have not broken your heart—*you* have broken it; and in breaking it, you have broken mine. So much the worse for me that I am strong. Do I want to live? What kind of living will it be when you—oh, God! would *you* like to live with your soul in the grave?’ (Brontë 159)

Appendix C

‘May she wake in torment!’ he cried, with frightful vehemence, stamping his foot, and groaning in a sudden paroxysm of ungovernable passion. ‘Why she’s a liar to the end! Where is she? Not *there*—not in heaven—not perished—where? Oh! you said you cared nothing for my sufferings! And I pray one prayer—I repeat it till my tongue stiffens—Catherine Earnshaw, may you not rest so long as I am living; you said I killed you—haunt me then! Then murdered *do* haunt their murderers, I believe. I know that ghosts *have* wandered on earth. Be with me always—take any form—drive me mad! only *do* not leave me in this abyss, where I cannot find you! Oh, God! it is unutterable! I *cannot* live without my life! I *cannot* life without my soul!’ (Brontë 165)

Appendix D

A.G.A

October 1838

Sleep brings no joy to me,
Remembrance never dies;
My soul is given to misery
And lives in sighs.

Sleep brings no rest to me;
The shadows of the dead
My waking eyes may never see
Surround my bed.

Sleep brings no hope to me;
In soundest sleep they come,
And with their doleful imagery
Deepen the gloom.

Sleep brings no strength to me,
No power renewed to brave,
I sail a wilder sea,
A darker wave.

Sleep brings no friend to me
To soothe and aid to bear;
They all gaze, oh, how scornfully,
And I despair.

Sleep brings no wish to knit
My harassed heart beneath;
My only wish is to forget
In sleep of death.
(Ratchford 31-32)