FOREWORD

Welcome to Volume 14 of the Inquiry Undergraduate Research Journal. The Inquiry journal was developed by the Teaching Academy of the University of Arkansas and is supported financially and conceptually by the offices of the Provost and the Vice Provost for Research and Economic Development. Inquiry provides a forum for sharing the research and creative endeavors of undergraduate students and their faculty mentors at the University of Arkansas. While the journal has traditionally been published once per year, given the increase in the number of outstanding submissions to the journal for possible publication, we have decided to publish two online volumes each year.

Volume 14 of the Inquiry Undergraduate Research Journal features the unique contributions of seven undergraduate student authors and their faculty mentors. Their research and creative endeavors span diverse fields at the University of Arkansas, including Architecture, History, Anthropology, Political Science, Curriculum and Instruction, and Nursing. For example, Chelsea Hodge examines the role of the invitation song among Christian revivals in northwest Arkansas. Turning to Political Science, Marisol McNair examines the deracialized leadership style of Newark, NJ mayor Cory Booker and his cutting edge use of Twitter to promote African American political engagement. Kelly Toner evaluates an international orientation program that is designed to train and prepare midwife volunteers in Haiti. The remaining articles highlight the exceptional efforts of undergraduate students and their faculty mentors at the University of Arkansas.

I would like to extend a special thank you to the faculty members who volunteered their time and expertise to provide comprehensive reviews of student manuscripts. While we are unable to publish all of the submitted manuscripts, we want to thank the students and faculty mentors for their diligent efforts. Please join me in congratulating our authors; I hope that you enjoy this edition of the journal as much as we have. We plan to publish Volume 15 of the Inquiry journal in September 2013. I encourage undergraduate students and faculty mentors to consider the Inquiry Undergraduate Research Journal for future publication.

Marcia A. Shobe, Editor
CONTENTS

INQUIRY
The Undergraduate Research Journal of the University of Arkansas

Volume 14          Spring 2013

2  Editor’s Foreword

Table of Contents

4  ARCHITECTURE:  Arkel, A. J. Drawing as Architecture:  Representational Space Architecturally Transformed

19  NURSING:  Compere Yopp, L. The Relationships Between Nursing Staff Knowledge of Personhood and Resident Cognitive Status

27  HISTORY:  Hodge, C. Invitation through Song:  Evangelism and Divine Discourse in Arkansas Revivals

44  POLITICAL SCIENCE:  McNair, M. Deracialized Leadership and Promotion of African American Political Engagement: Cory Booker’s Use of Twitter

63  ANTHROPOLOGY:  Newby, L. Representations of Argentine National Identity via El Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes

75  CURRICULUM INSTRUCTION:  Roy, J. Elementary Teacher Perceptions of Teaching Practices that Foster Creative Thinking in Students

95  NURSING:  Toner, K. Orientation for Increased Volunteer Effectiveness with Midwives for Haiti

Cover image by Rob Byrd Designs

Published by ScholarWorks@UARK, 2013
Abstract

This project was motivated by the premise that a drawing could take on architectural meaning beyond its initial performance as a re-presentation of an architectural idea; in other words, the motivation was to create a drawing that was architecture. When the drawing is the research, however, the conclusions found are necessarily different from the earliest goals pursued. There comes an understanding that a drawing may never be literal architecture; although, the means by which the drawing is created might be architectural or, at the very least, speak to ideals which are fundamental to the creation, to the process, of architecture.

“Poets make poems, painters paintings, and musicians music. Architects, however, do not make architecture; they make drawings and models of it – representations meant to direct the development of something conceived into something constructed.”


I. Introduction

Abstract drawings created in a summer Mexico study abroad program meant any notion of the drawn artifact, the precious art piece, or the perfect line was discarded. Instead, drawings were informed through nonlinear processes and, while graphical intentions were erased from the face of the paper and drawn over multiple times, the end result was never fully realized from the beginning. Preconceived notions suggesting that a drawing could be considered finished were replaced with others that considered a ‘finished’ drawing merely as a layer of graphite meant to be erased and continually reworked. Drawing, introduced as a process of artifact production for the majority of many architectural educations, reintroduced itself as a creative tool for both spatial manipulation and creation; in other words, space was defined by the lines, tones, and textures created with graphite and conté on paper. The act of drawing no longer presented itself simply as a means of displaying a final architectural work, as ‘re-presentation’, but rather drawing was emphasized as an origin point in architectural creation, a means of ‘representation’ in which drawing and architecture were inseparable.

While in Mexico, discussions with artist Thom Mills suggest that the drawn world creates itself through observations of real world relationships (Mills). Furthermore, as these relationships are visibly rendered, one can continue to graphically build upon them, making decisions within the reality of drawing that might ultimately affect the built world. Architecturally speaking, decisions about a building are formed through the transformative processes of drawing, erasing, and redrawing, meaning that while a built work resides in the real world, its origin exists in the
world of lines, tones, and texture—the “drawn world.” A fascination with this universe and its relationship to architectural creation has engendered this research project, in order to understand how this space, created through the act of drawing, transforms itself into architectural space, and subsequently, into an architectural work.

This research project examines how the intentions behind the drawing process are assimilated into the creation of space and architecture, emphasizing that drawing may serve not only as a tool of visualization, but also as a tool of conception. In particular, the goal of this research was to understand and define how an architectural idea might stem from the act of drawing, rather than a drawing being created for the purpose of an idea; that is, there was a search for an architecture formed from the relationships found within a drawing without those relationships already having been architecturally defined.

Drawing, whether by hand or via computer, is a known form of architectural representation. Specifically, drawing is most commonly used as a means for communicating an idea, allowing an architect to provide visual cues of one’s thinking, and enabling one to provide visual representation of the proposed architectural work. When considering drawing in this utility, it is not necessarily the manner of creation, but rather a means of re-presentation. However, when questioning the idea of drawing as a method of purely representational means, there remains the notion that perhaps the act of drawing is of more benefit to architecture than mere visual re-presentation.

In order to determine the connection between drawing and architecture, this research project considers that both lie in a separate reality, but are somehow metaphysically linked through the process of drawing itself. Drawing and architecture are both visual mediums, and it is through drawing that one may understand an architectural work before it is ever built. As a result, it may be understood that drawing plays more than a visual role in architectural creation, allowing for discovery and transformation of the concept before the construction process, as referenced in the writings of David Leatherbarrow (Leatherbarrow 50-55). Delving further into this idea, there is an effort to understand the methods of the drawing process, and to recognize how certain techniques might create spatial relationships that are subsequently transformed into an architectural work, all while remaining in the theoretical world of representation, or drawing. Although drawing and architecture exist within separate realities, there is an effort to understand how the foundations of a built architectural reality rely upon, and are ultimately conceived within, the reality of representation. Furthermore, there is the question of how this relationship asserts the validity of theoretical architecture as an essential component for understanding the realities of the built world.

Within the realm of drawing and architecture, the overarching aim of this research is to gain insight into architecture as a drawing, and to comprehend what architecture created through means of transformed spatial drawings necessarily implies. The value of such knowledge lies in the discovery that perhaps drawing may be founded upon theories meant to reveal truths about spatial creation that built architecture does not directly address. Discussions of space, light, void, and mass are inherent when speaking of architecture, yet as revealed through the drawing process introduced by Thom Mills, these attributes were implicit in a drawing’s various marks and tones (Mills). There is a space within the page; an exploration of that space through this research project will inevitably lead to a better understanding of how a manipulation and transformation of the ‘spatial page’ will serve as a transitional tool between idea and building, drawing and architecture.
Creating a Drawing, Creating an Architecture

This research initially focuses upon the creation of a drawing formed through the use of surrealist techniques; it then centers around a transformation of that drawing into an architectural work. The drawing itself serves as an exploration of the spatial page, a study in conté, watercolor, and graphite primarily concerned with the spatial relationships between the various marks and tones on the page, derived from the spatial characteristics of a studied object, with no initial regard for the resultant architectural work. There is, however, a certain regard for how the drawing is developed, with great intention towards discovering, and defining, the process by which the final drawing will construct itself.

It is from the idea in which the drawing is both product and creator, working in tandem with the architect in the reality of representation wherein all space is, perhaps, initially created, that this research then warrants as its contribution to current discourses and practices on drawing as architecture. Specifically, the project primarily concerns itself with building a method, which, at the conclusion of the project, might be critiqued and situate itself within discussions about drawing’s role in architectural creation. The final drawing will stand as a testimony to the validity of the method built, and display the evident success and failure that might be achieved when architecture is created from an origin point within a different reality from which physical buildings, architecture, are not initially thought to derive.

Finally, there is, upon completion of the project, potential for an architectural work that is not merely the result of a transformative drawing process, but is inevitably the drawing process itself, a theoretical work clearly blurring the boundary between the reality of representation and the reality of the built world, between art and architecture. Thus, there is knowledge to be gleaned from this project, if one is to fully understand the importance of the relationships between drawing, architecture, and the creation of architectural space. Writing from a perspective of intentionality, this research is designed to undermine contemporary notions of the drawing as architectural re-presentation, and to solidify a particular drawing process, or method, as architectural representation, architectural creation, and, ultimately, as architecture itself. Such solidification, an assertion that all architecture begins on the page and exists within the page, then begins to have ramifications on the whole of the architectural field. One is left to consider, given the findings of the project, what a symbiotic relationship between architecture and drawing, process and product, might mean to the future development of architectural space.

Furthermore, this research project leads to further speculation as to the origins of space, and in its transformation, how it is different from space that is architecturally defined. Consequently, drawing as a contributing factor to this transformation must be considered as well, including establishing this project’s importance in understanding how this contribution, how drawing, is ultimately responsible for the creation of architecture.

Drawing Motivation

While drawing serves architects as a transitional tool from idea to building, the very process of drawing allows one to explore spatial experience and transformation without leaving the theoretical world of representation for the reality of the built world. Leatherbarrow stated, “Poets make poems, painters paintings, and musicians music. Architects, however, do not make architecture; they make drawings and models of it – representations meant to direct the development of something conceived into something constructed” (Leatherbarrow 51). While still general in its terminology of process, Leatherbarrow alluded to the actions taken when drawing. He also questioned the reliance on rather typical architectural drawings (plans, sections, and paraline projections) as the best means of architectural representation, alluding to the
possibilities of greater spatial relationships, and developments, in the creation or discovery of new marks made while drawing.

From a different standpoint, Filiz Öngüç identified several purposes of drawing, specifically its use as a representational method of perception, emphasizing the human place. In its encapsulation of perception, drawing must capture the individualistic experiences of place, suggesting that representation is not a flat idea, but a spatial one. Considering Öngüç’s statement, “the belief that drawing is architectural thinking releases us from the otherwise constricting grip of perceiving it as nothing more than a tool of visual representation” (Öngüç 31), it becomes apparent that the purpose of drawing extends beyond the visual explanation of form. However, neither Leatherbarrow nor Öngüç fully considered the role representational reality may or may not have in relation to the reality of the built world. That is, both suggested the dormant potential of drawing as a powerful architectural descriptor and exploratory tool, but gave little thought to the idea that, perhaps, drawing occurs at the inception of an architectural work, assisting in its creation as well as its representation.

Robin Evans (156), however, interpreted drawing as the intervening medium in architecture, allowing one to work on an architectural project directly. Yet, the mystery of the transformation of drawing to building eluded Evans, which caused him to question this relationship and the role drawing plays within the physical and representational realities of architecture and the world. Evans’ work helps to define the thesis further, serving as an explanatory link between architecture and drawing and their subsequent realities, and giving cause to the purpose of architectural drawing aside from purely aesthetic functions. Reading his essay provides justification to search for the link between drawing and architecture, to discover how intertwined both truly are. Evans implied that the built world is constructed through the world of representation, an implication that gives this thesis momentum to find answers to its questions about the relationship between drawing and architecture. His chapter “Translations from Building to Drawing”, in particular, allowed for the theoretical consideration that perhaps space does not only exist in the physical sense, but also in the representational sense. In short, Evans depicted scenarios in which the architect never truly touched his work at all, implying that architecture is only ever really worked on within the space of the drawing, the space given to representation:

“Bringing with me the conviction that architecture and the visual arts were closely allied, I was soon struck by what seemed at the time the peculiar disadvantage under which architects labour, never working directly with the object of their thought, always working at it through some intervening medium, almost always the drawing, while painters and sculptors…all ended up working on the thing itself which, naturally, absorbed most of their attention and effort” (Evans 156).

Inevitably, such explanations lend great importance to the idea of drawing as a conceptual tool in the creation of architecture. Contrary to Evans’ statements, however, this research intends for the architectural thought to occur after a drawing has been made, in order that the final work may originate and be produced purely from within this representational space.

**Searching for a Method**

Creating an architecture within the reality of representation assumes an understanding of drawing as a conceptual tool by which architectural space is made and manipulated. Such creation is a process which aligns itself most closely with the paradigm of deconstructivism, defined as a point of view that seeks to reveal hidden assumptions. Specific to this research, there is an effort to understand how an exploration in drawing can manifest itself into architectural
creation, and to possibly reveal that the relationship between architecture and drawing is not merely a matter of representation. In other words, there is the idea that drawings have a significant role in the creation of architecture, aside from drawing serving as the primary tool by which one reveals un-built architecture.

This research inevitably attempts to reveal that it is through drawing and its transformation that architecture is created, and that perhaps architectural space resides more permanently within the representational reality than it does in the ‘real world.’ Given that architects spend much of their time working on their architectural works through drawing, it is also reasonable to assume that perhaps all architecture, drawn or built, is real. Perhaps the only delineation between theoretical and real lies in the physical tangibility of a built work, but then even this may be a matter of representation. Still, these questions seek to reveal the truths behind representational reality and the reality of the built world, with the deconstructivist view serving as the door through which assumptions about architecture and drawing will be challenged.

Researching these architectural statements requires a methodology that is less intent on gathering specific facts and data and more focused upon the unexpected result, especially those results that arise from the very act of drawing itself. Surrealist techniques involve freedom from aesthetic and moral self-censorship, a removal of conscious decision-making, and a basis in the unconscious. Surrealist techniques are the most efficient methodology to use given research that intends to discover how architecture is created when its origin is not architecturally defined. Specifically, the surrealist technique is a design strategy that allows freedom of exploration in which direction is nonlinear and the results are unknown and unpredictable, meaning that the drawings will be directed by each move of the hand, with no ‘final image’ set as the end goal. Knowing this, one must understand that the end of this research begins with the creation of a drawing, and that the drawing’s spatial implications will only be realized after a transformation into architecture. That is, while the discoveries made in the execution of this thesis cannot necessarily be determined presently, there is an idea that what knowledge reveals itself lies in the transformative drawing processes. The research is made as the drawings are made, for the drawings are the research.

Drawing with watercolor, conté, graphite, and sandpaper will be the primary tactic by which this research project produces drawn work. The chosen medium will be applied to the same paper, one 22” x 30” sheet of 140lb Fabriano Hot Press Watercolor Paper, over the course of four months, reinforcing the idea of graphic layering, or pentimenti. This term refers to a technique involving a layering of images so that previous drawings might have a relationship with and even inform decisions being made in new drawings. Such a technique is synonymous with the strengths of the surrealist technique, as the unexpected juxtapositions are fully realized as new drawings are made upon the old. This technique is important to the idea of representational space, as the layering of images implies the application of depth to the page, a 3-dimensional characteristic of space that is important in the transition to architectural space. As the 2-dimensional medium creates tones, lines, and textures, the layering of the pentimenti allows for the creation of drawn space, which gives direction for transformation into architectural space and form.

The rules for drawing construction presently consist of the following:
- Each drawing will only use watercolor, conté, and graphite as a medium, as well as the void, which may be achieved through cutting, excessive erasing, or sanding of the paper. Of the watercolor colors, only sepia and Payne’s gray will be used.
- Sandpaper is an acceptable erasing tool.
- Photo-documentation will occur at least every time the paper is cut, and whenever a significant amount of medium has been applied to the paper (the latter to be defined within the context of each drawing).
- Cuts and additions will be determined by their contribution to the overall spatial composition of the work. As each drawing has not been started, it is difficult to determine the exact number of cuts and additions to be made, as development of the space on the page is necessary to evaluate this determination.
- Any additional paper added will have edges and cuts perpendicular to the original edges of the paper, although the size and amount of paper added is on the basis of each individual drawing and its compositional needs.

Each drawing will have a different subject. The chosen objects were selected for their inherent ‘architectural’ orders and for their geometrical complexities that were manipulated by time. Thus, similar to the drawing’s expression of chronology in the implementation of layering through the *pentimenti*, each object signifies the chronology of time through elemental manipulation. The objects drawn are: 1) log, 2) (wasp) nest, 3) rock, and 4) bone (armadillo skull) (Figures 1-4).

**Figure 1: Log.** The black background is not part of the drawing. Horizontal orientation (with right side of the page treated as the bottom).

**Figure 2: Nest.** The black background is not part of the drawing. Vertical orientation.

**Figure 3: Rock.** The black background is not part of the drawing. Vertical orientation.

**Figure 4: Bone.** The black background is not part of the drawing. Vertical orientation.
II. Research Appendix 1:  

The Spatial Composition

The final composition will start on the same size sheet of one 22” x 30” sheet of 140lb Fabriano Hot Press Watercolor Paper, and this same sheet will be used for the entire semester; additions and subtractions will be made to the paper following the same guidelines established in the development of this project. There remains the notion that the drawing will inform itself throughout its development, although the spatial logic (spatial language) identified through the diagramming of the four drawings will certainly be held as the initial rules by which spaces are made, and by which the relationships between spaces, in regards to the larger composition, might be established.

The underlying idea remains that, as the drawing develops, as paper is added and subtracted, the piece might start to grow past the relatively small borders present in the initial four drawings (all approximately within a 2’x3’ area), and begin to define space that is of a size relatable to human occupation of the body as opposed to the hand—perhaps, then, more characteristic of architectural space. One could assume, for instance, that if the drawing grew to a large enough size, it, were someone to face the drawing from six inches away, might then fill that person’s peripheral vision and become spatially occupied, as it were, despite the medium’s 2-dimensional limitations. Of course, the final size cannot be predicted, nor can the image of the final composition. One may assume, however, that given the findings and conclusions established within and at the end of this project, the thesis is heading towards a future that is, on the one hand, of a more determinable, analytical, and architectural character, and on the other, of a less predictable, but more exciting nature given its intuitive origins.

The Final Drawing

Although it may be hard to dictate what the final drawing will look like, the intentions behind the creation of the drawing, the process by which it is created, become increasingly concretized. The drawing will begin on the same size sheet of paper of the original four, but the addition of paper and the scalar change in drawing strokes will aid in the understanding of architectural space and its creation, as the space drawn is then more architecturally characteristic in its relation to the body. As a drawing, then, the final work seeks to be a 2-dimensional drawing that might be occupied in 3-dimensions, if only visually, but through this visual occupation begins to address assumptions that visual occupation is no less valuable than physical occupation, and that both forms of occupancy are valid means of experiencing space, of experiencing architecture; in doing so, as stated in the original proposal, the final drawing might then stand as a valid architectural work despite its apparent intangibility, again emphasizing differences between re-presentation and representation.

As a work, the drawing will be an architectural transformation of spaces initially similar to those drawn in a previous study, but, using the analytical processes derived from the diagramming, it will be inevitably different due to its application of light, shadow, mass, void, and surface being grounded more in the realm of architecture than ‘general space.’ The subject of the drawing is indeterminable; it may be an architectural landscape with a single construct, such as a column, or the drawing might be in the image of a threshold, a drawn ‘doorway’ that is spatially defined yet also alludes to the spaces beyond. Regardless of subject, the term ‘architecture’ is kept vague so as to prevent allusions to the construction of a building; the goal of the research project is not to create an architectural work that might then be programmatically defined, but rather to result in a drawing that is defined by the spatial languages discovered within the drawing process. The final drawing will most likely have an abstract character, yet it...
will stand as a testament to the process and serve as a physical work that might then be evaluated for its architectural space in contrast to the original drawings and analyses used in its creation. The resultant image may not look like a familiar building typology, the drawing might not even resemble a building, yet the spaces, or space, to be viewed will hopefully spark a discussion that drives at the meaning of architecture that is created through drawing as opposed to architecture that is merely represented; in the end, a drawing that is architecture.

III. Research Appendix 2:

Post Research: 5 Ideals of Architecture

This research project was motivated by the premise that a drawing could take on architectural meaning beyond its initial performance as a re-presentation of an architectural idea. Initially, there existed the goal to create a drawing that was architecture. In the creation of a process wherein the drawing is the research, however, there comes an understanding that a drawing may never be literal architecture; although, the means by which the drawing is created might be architectural, or at the very least, represent ideals that are fundamental to the creation, to the process, of architecture itself.

While initially enamored with the idea of a large-scale spatial drawing, the process developed over the course of this research project transformed into a working method that has more to say about core architectural values and less about the finality of a product. The act of drawing no longer presents itself simply as a means of displaying a final architectural work, a re-presentation, but rather is emphasized as an origin point, an evolution of process which may then be used in the formation of architecture and architectural space.

While the final drawing is, in itself, not architecture, the processes by which drawings are, and this drawing was, constructed reinforces lessons which are more deeply connected to the design and spirit of architecture than one might initially perceive.

Process > Product

The ‘drawing as product’ has always been forfeit to the ‘drawing as process’ and, despite allusions to this fact in the writings preceding the making of the drawing, the end product was initially thought necessary to establish deeper connections between drawing and architecture. However, such connections were already establishing themselves through the evolution of making—the transformation of process. The end continued to describe itself as indefinable, unknown, and, in many cases, a concept never to be reached; the final work, conceived through the process of drawing, erasing, and redrawing, has existed in many ‘states of finishing’ but never in a ‘finished state’. In the case of the perspectives drawn from within the original four objects, and considered ‘finished’, they were deconstructed and used in the construction of the final drawing (Figures 5-8).
There comes the realization that, in regards to this project, process was equitable to product, and, in the end, the process is perhaps more important than the product; or, rather, a product is only as genuine as the process that informs its creation. Considering the relationship between drawing and architecture, the means by which the former is created is fundamental to the conception of the latter—the process of drawing reveals, more than any other factor, the means by which the architect might construct the architecture which is initially born on, in, and of the page.

**Drawing Process = Creation of Architecture**

As has been the case over the course of this research project, much of the making was intuitive. Yet, it was through making, through drawing, that the intuitive process was more efficiently structured with ordered principles. The rules set up within the original prospectus provided the basic framework for the construction of a drawing. While developing the work, an adherence to, and a questioning of, the rules established allowed for a flexible drawing system that proved helpful in the decision-making later in the process. For example, maintaining perpendicular edges when adding paper facilitated the making of the larger drawing, as the pieces available already comprised a geometry whereby the individual pieces might be perpendicular to one another (Figure 9).

---

**Figure 5:** Log Perspective. Perspective as imagined within the object of the log. Vertical orientation.

**Figure 6:** Nest Perspective. Perspective as imagined within the object of the nest. Vertical orientation.

**Figure 7:** Rock Perspective. Perspective as imagined within the object of the rock. Vertical orientation.

**Figure 8:** Bone Perspective. Perspective as imagined within the object of the bone. Vertical orientation.

---

http://scholarworks.uark.edu/inquiry/vol14/iss1/1
Figure 9: Final Drawing Diagrams. Diagram of drawing mid-development. An analysis of the pieces of paper, their joints, and the joints’ relationship to the drawn space.
An existing rule thus proved a solution rather than a detriment, yet in the end, it allowed for larger questions to address the work; in particular, speculation about the frame of the drawing, and its erratic nature in contrast to the ‘regular’ frames used in the presentation of the work, brought about discussions regarding drawing the spatial implications associated with the edge condition. Such a discussion might never have come about without pursuit of this research topic, and while a ‘right’ answer was not chosen, the drawing elicits responses that might prove more beneficial to the field of architecture than this thesis alone. That is, while the thesis, in its pursuit of drawing as a critical component of architectural creation, seeks to contribute its findings to the architectural field, the questions it asks are far more important than the answers it produces.

More specifically, a method was created through which drawing might be used as a tool of conception in the creation of space and architecture; the latter two ideas are not physically rendered, but the drawing process created around this thesis enables one to ask critical questions of each in regards to their relationship with each other and to their relationship with their means of creation. ‘Drawing as architecture’ might be less valuable a phrase than ‘process as architecture’, where the former still retains its connection to product while the latter speaks to drawing and its true value to architectural creation. Nevertheless, where methodology is concerned, this research has demonstrated a solid foundation, spatial drawing, on which to stand in search of architectural questions; answers are not necessarily the goal, however, as it is the beauty of the search, pursuit of the unknown, that causes one to ask more questions. Ultimately, one must decide what it is about architecture, what ideals, are important to its creation as discovered through drawing.

**Architectural Ideals**

Implicit in these conclusions on process are architectural ideals that, once identified, are thought to both apply to the reality of representation as well as the reality of the built world—thus, one might use a similar process in the conceptualization of architecture, as these ideals are fundamental to both drawing and building. They are:

1. **The Importance of the Hand:** Drawing by hand brings the architect, the creator, closer to the ideas and marks transcribed on the page. Rather than work by means of a computer, crafting the drawing necessitates a more methodical work-flow, as every piece of paper, every mark is thought about before it is incorporated into the larger whole, before it becomes a member of the structure that is the larger composition. The hand is the conduit through which the mind engages work, true in both the drawing and construction of form and space; the sense of craft imbues itself into the work, as one becomes conscious of the consequences of necessary decision-making.

2. **Necessity of Decision Making:** Given that the final drawing was constructed within the latter half of the project, the work, much like a building, was dependent upon a process of quick decision making. The removal of error is embedded within the drawing method developed, given that any mark may be erased, sanded, or cut away entirely. Thus, a multitude of decisions ended as dust rather than components of the final drawing, yet they were necessarily made so that the ‘right’ marks might be discovered; in architecture, the first idea is not always the best solution to a problem, where time and iterative studies are necessary to reveal a viable path to a fruitful search. Drawing is the tool of conceptualization that allows for the active pursuit of iteration while, as discovered
within this process, understanding how time is a factor in the evolution of an idea, in the evolution of architecture and space.

3. **Embedded Sense of Time:** Architecture is forever linked to time; materials degrade, colors fade, light penetrates while shadows recede, and every building takes shape through an evolution of stages known as construction—all bow to time. Not only has this project, through photo documentation of the work, demonstrated a change in form over time, but also it has revealed the importance of time as it applies to spatial experience (Figure 10). As seen in the photos the space changes over time and, with it, so too does one’s perception of that space. This is a factor often overlooked within the built reality, as many buildings exist as static re-presentations of an initial idea. The beauty of the process found in this thesis stems from the fact that ideas change, time changes, and space might change. Architects need to be aware, need to ask questions, of how their buildings might change, or at the very least, how their buildings might become as active and alive as the shadows that dance across their surfaces.

4. **Malleability of Architectural Ideas (Open System):** The process discovered over the course of the semester provided an open system of drawing as well as an open system of thinking not only about drawing, but about architecture. The malleability of architectural ideas is often lost to the built reality, a world given to rules and regulations that, for the most part, never existed until they were created. A rule of architecture is no more a creation of the mind than a drawing is a creation of the hand, yet the latter is perceived as a more liberal pursuit than the former. However, as has been demonstrated within this drawing process, one might use the rules within a found system to the benefit of the project—rather than see sanding as purely a destructive, erasing process, it was transformed into the giver of light, used as a tool to *add* to the space just as easily as it might *subtract* from the space. The same mindset might be applied to architecture, wherein the rules of building might be rethought, reconfigured (much like the drawings were cut up and rearranged), to the service of a better architectural solution; within a process of liberation, there are no problems, only answers.

5. **Part to Whole:** A drawing, like a building, is a composition, a collection of parts brought together through organization, whether ordered or disordered. The construction of the drawing surface from the pieces of former drawings only furthered this point, calling into question the usual practice of building construction. All of the marks on and all of the joints of the paper work in unison to give presence to the space created; each piece might stand on its own as an individual work or space, yet its incorporation into the final drawing betters the larger space to be experienced when moving towards and around the drawing. As a discussion about architecture, then, one must consider the building as a composition, and see every component as serving the whole, and see every element as a contributor to not only the form of the building but the experience of the space (Figure 11).

This research has not reached an ultimatum, a final decision, about the relationship between drawing and architecture. Stated differently, this project has identified drawing, and the development of a drawing process, as a useful tool in conceptualizing architecture, yet it does not assume that the process set out in the prospectus and utilized over the course of the semester as the only means of addressing this relationship. Furthermore, although existing as a spatial composition, the final drawing has become more of a means to think about architecture in terms other than space, rather than specifically serving as the sole answer to architectural creation. In
fact, this research project asks many more questions, and relishes the search as a means of discovering how the drawing and architecture might be related; the researcher may question how creating a drawing process might enhance the critical eye of the architect, might enable the architect to actively re-engage with *making*, and might ask the architect to re-assume the role of skeptical decision-maker—to make the unknown known through action.

Figure 10: Final Drawing Photo Sequence. Drawing as it developed over the course of the semester, beginning with the cutting and reassembling of the drawings in figures 5-8.
Figure 11: Final Drawing. Final drawing phase. Horizontal orientation (with bottom recognized as the right side of the page). Original size: 6’ x 12.5’.
Works Cited


THE RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN NURSING STAFF KNOWLEDGE OF PERSONHOOD AND RESIDENT COGNITIVE STATUS

By Leeanne Compere Yopp
Eleanor Mann School of Nursing

Faculty Mentor: Dr. Nan Smith-Blair
Eleanor Mann School of Nursing

Abstract

The purpose of this pilot study was to explore the relationships between nursing staff knowledge of extended care resident personhood and resident cognitive status. Eighty nursing staff from two similar extended care facilities in Arkansas completed a self-administered questionnaire to assess their knowledge of 21 residents, including information related to residents’ past jobs/careers; likes/dislikes/interests; family members; other non-specific knowledge; and total knowledge. The Brief Interview for Mental Status (BIMS) was used to evaluate resident cognitive impairment. Results of a Pearson correlation demonstrate a positive correlation between (1) staff knowledge of residents’ families, and (2) total knowledge of residents with resident cognitive status. Findings suggest that nursing staff utilize creative interventions and exert intentional efforts to obtain resident information to preserve personhood and provide PCDC.

Introduction

Respect for personhood is essential to the progressive movement of Person-Centered Dementia Care (PCDC) (Dewing, 2008). Personhood is a state of being a person encompasses and includes characteristics, such as values, spirituality, history, and personal strengths that have been amassed through life experiences and years of living (Coker, 1998). Nursing home resident memory loss and communication deficits significantly challenge caregivers who strive to provide and maintain PCDC (Buron, 2008, 2010). In addition, extended care facility institutionalization can threaten all aspects of personhood (2008), including cognitive status, when their identity, which is developed through years of living with close, nurturing social contacts, is suddenly dependent upon staff members who may or may not make efforts to know and relate to residents living with dementia (RLWD).

Review of Literature

Respect for personhood is the basis for personal, patient-centered care (Dewing, 2008). We extend this conceptualization to suggest that a focus on personhood is necessary for quality PCDC in extended care facilities. According to Kitwood (1997), personhood is defined as the “standing or status that is bestowed upon one human being by others in the context of relationship and social being”; personhood “implies recognition, respect, and trust” (p. 8) between a caregiver and resident. We further hypothesize that in the extended care facility setting, staff knowledge of a resident may contribute to preserving the resident’s personhood.

Residents living with progressive dementia can often no longer provide historical personal information for their caregivers. As a result, the burden is placed on the nursing staff to provide PCDC and to see and relate to the client as an individual person without adequate life history information (Buron, 2010). According to Long (2009), “if caregivers do not actively pursue and assure a holistic approach” for the client with dementia, the client can be robbed of...
their personhood (p. 21). Goyder (2009) suggests that a progressive loss of personhood also creates a power differential between healthcare staff and clients living with dementia. Thus, in order to provide quality dementia care, it is incumbent upon healthcare staff to develop strategies to preserve personhood status (Buron, 2008; Goyder 2009; Long, 2009). Accordingly, quality person-centered care depends on staff knowing, respecting, and preserving the “life” of the resident, not just his or her basic human needs (Buron, 2008). In addition to improved direct resident care, increased staff knowledge of clients can improve the overall milieu of care. For example, some researchers suggest that increased attention to preserving resident personhood has the potential to improve the living/working environment through a decrease in disruptive resident behaviors, and in the rate of staff turnover (Buron, 2008; 2010; Long, 2009). In addition, when personhood is not valued, residents may experience depersonalization, depression, and/or social isolation (Cecchin, 2001; Coker, 1998). Since knowledge of a client may have an effect on the nursing staffs’ ability to maintain a client’s personhood, it is reasonable to suggest that knowledge of a client could also positively impact Person-Centered Dementia Care (PCDC). Unfortunately, dementia progression and caregiver knowledge about residents living with dementia (RLWD) are unknown. A better understanding of these connections may lead to the implementation of specific person-centered strategies and the identification of ideal caregiver qualities to best preserve future resident personhood for individuals with a progressive dementia disease. The purpose of this pilot study is to explore relationships between nursing staff knowledge of the resident and resident cognitive status.

Methodology

Resident Sample. This research study involved two similar extended care facilities in the state of Arkansas. To determine the eligibility of residents for inclusion in the study, The Brief Interview for Mental Status (BIMS), a section on the Minimum Data Set 3.0, was used to screen extended care residents and to detect levels of cognitive impairment. The results of this screening are readily available through patient chart review. The tool is used to numerically categorize cognitive status on a scale from 0-7 (severe impairment), 8-12 (moderate impairment), and 13-15 (cognitively intact) (Keane Care, Inc., 2010). The principal investigator (PI) requested that a nursing facility administrator select four residents from at least one of each category to participate in this study. The PI desired to have an even distribution of residents from the three categories to bring about more reliable results. Residents were required to verbalize their willingness to participate in order to be included in the study.

To ensure privacy and protection for the resident, facility administrators first contacted potential resident legal guardians to explain the study; they then referred them to the PI for questions regarding potential participation in the study. Legal guardians were also required to provide consent on behalf of the resident for his/her participation in the study. Consent forms were sent via United States mail for guardians of residents who lived out of town. Residents without a legal guardian, and who were able to provide their own informed consent, were first approached by the administrator, or designee, and then the PI to inquire if he/she was interested in participating in the study. The PI requested an initial consent from the guardian before asking for the resident’s consent to be included in the research study.

The MacArthur Competence Assessment Tool for Clinical Research (MacCAT-CR) was used as part of the consent process to evaluate decisional capacity among residents, comprehension of information, and the ability to express a clear choice (Appelbaum & Grisso, 2001). This assessment allowed residents even in the severe impairment cognitive status to voice
their desire to either participate in or to not participate in the study. All residents included in the study voiced a desire to participate in the study. Any resident who did not wish to participate was not included in the study. Resident recruitment continued until four residents from each cognitive status category and from each of the two facilities agreed to participate in the study. Residents with other mental illness diagnoses, including but not limited to schizophrenia, delusions, and auditory hallucinations, were excluded from the study.

Twenty-four residents were recruited from two extended care facilities to participate in this study. However one resident died before the questionnaire was administered to nursing staff; in addition, while the legal guardian for two residents provided initial verbal consent for the resident to participate in the study, they did not submit the final consent form before the questionnaire administration deadline. Thus, 21 residents from two extended care facilities participated in the study; all residents represent various cognitive statuses based on BIMS (eight severely impaired, four moderately impaired, nine cognitively intact) (Keane Care, Inc., 2010). Twenty female residents and one male resident, all of whom were sixty years of age and older, participated in the study.

Staff Sample. Following the selection of residents for the pilot study, potential nursing staff participants consisting of registered nurses (RNs), licensed practical nurses (LPNs) and certified nursing assistants (CNAs) who had cared for at least one of the resident participants were identified. All nursing staff participants had engaged with at least one resident participant a minimum of three times per week for the past two months or more. Nursing staff were notified that participation or refusal to participate in the pilot study would have no negative or positive impact on their job status and that identifying information would not be shared with nursing facility administrators. Eighty nursing staff participants (RN, LPN, and CNA) from the two extended care facilities completed 100 questionnaires to assess their knowledge of residents in their care.

Data Collection Methods. Data collection occurred at one point in time either as part of a staff meeting or during scheduled pay days at the facilities. Staff participants were supplied with the questionnaire in a group setting; researchers requested that they complete it and not share information about residents with other staff participants completing the questionnaire. The PI maintained a quiet environment for participants to complete the questionnaire. If participants had any questions concerning the questionnaire, they silently raised their hand and the PI addressed their concerns without disturbing any of the other participants.

Participant identities were kept confidential throughout the study and all questionnaires and consent forms were stored in a locked file at the university which only the PI and faculty project mentor could access to ensure privacy and confidentiality. There was little to no risk for participants in this study. Each resident and nursing staff participant was compensated with a $10 gift card for their time. Legal guardians managed gift cards for residents living with dementia.

Measures. Buron’s (2010) Know Me Now form (see the Appendix) was used to assess knowledge of residents in three specific areas: resident’s family, past jobs/careers, and past and current dislikes/likes/interests, along with a section for any other non-specific pieces of knowledge. Total knowledge included data from all four specific areas. Nursing staff completed one form for each resident participant who was consistently under their care (a minimum of three times per week for the last two months or more). Nursing staff could complete multiple forms if they fulfilled the care requirements for more than one resident in the study.
In terms of scoring the instrument, one point was allocated for each piece of correct information within each type of knowledge, with a maximum score of ten points for any one type of knowledge. Responses were verified either by the client or the client guardian. No reliability or validity data are available for this instrument.

Results

Results were analyzed by computing a Pearson correlation coefficient. This analysis revealed a significant positive correlation between the cognitive level of the residents and the staff’s knowledge about the family, $r=.40$, $p<.001$ and the total knowledge about the resident $r=.24$, $p=.02$. When the other types of knowledge were examined in relation to resident cognitive level, staff’s (a) knowledge about resident likes, dislikes and interests, (b) knowledge about resident past job or career, and (c) other knowledge about the resident were not significant. The correlation analysis of the types of knowledge of the staff to the resident’s cognitive level is found in Table 1.

Table 1. Correlation Analysis between Cognitive Level of Resident and Staff Knowledge

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowledge of Family</th>
<th>Knowledge of Likes/Dislikes/Interests</th>
<th>Knowledge of Past Job/Career</th>
<th>Other Knowledge</th>
<th>Total Knowledge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive Level</td>
<td>Pearson Correlation</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>N</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.40*</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>24*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.05</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>.17</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>.02</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

Figure 1 denotes a scatter plot that describes the cognitive level of the staff’s total knowledge about the resident; the scatter plot demonstrates a positive correlation.

![Figure 1. Total Knowledge versus Resident Cognitive Level](image)

Data were analyzed using a one-way Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) procedure, between groups design, to examine differences between level of staff training (RN/ LPN and CNA) and staff total knowledge about the residents. This analysis failed to reveal a significant effect for staff levels, $F(2.89) = 2.64$, $p=.08$. The three groups’ mean scores on total knowledge are displayed in Figure 2. Although the RN mean scores on total knowledge were higher than the mean scores for either LPNs or CNAs, the difference in scores was not statistically significant.
Limitations

Limitations. This pilot study was intended to explore the possible relationships between nursing staff knowledge of residents (i.e. personhood) and resident cognitive status. It is important to note several limitations to the study, including the small sample size of study participants (e.g. residents and nursing staff). An increase in the number of residents in each cognitive category and an increase in the number of nursing staff participating in the study is warranted to further evaluate the study aims.

A second limitation is that nursing staff members were unwilling to complete more than one questionnaire despite being in contact with and meeting the requirements to complete questionnaires for multiple residents in the study. This could be due to a possible limitation of time, fatigue, or potential embarrassment at not being able to recall more facts about certain residents. Thus, the data received may reflect best case scenarios in terms of patient-centered care.

A third limitation is related to the use of BIMS scores to establish resident level of cognition. Since different individuals at each facility administered the BIMS to their residents, it may have resulted in inconsistent test results. In other words, variation in administration techniques may result in different cognitive status categories between recruitment and administration of the questionnaire.

Fourth, the limited access to residents’ legal guardians made the consent process and verification of facts a challenging and lengthy process that caused delays in the study’s anticipated timeline. Finally, since questionnaires were administered during a nursing staff meeting and pay check pick up time, nursing staff members were given the questionnaire in a group setting. This may have led to sharing of answers or collaborative efforts to recall facts about residents despite the administrator’s instructions for completing the questionnaire singularly and without conversation with other participants. While the PI administered the questionnaire to help avoid this problem, a more controlled environment may be beneficial in future studies.
Discussion and Implications

In this study, we hypothesize that personhood is essential for person-centered care. In other words, nursing staff must deliver care that goes beyond merely meeting physical needs to encompassing personhood into the care process. Thus, in order to provide holistic care to a specific resident, nursing staff must have knowledge about the resident’s personhood. Dementia threatens a resident’s personhood and when a resident living with dementia (RLWD) can no longer preserve their own personhood, it is the responsibility of the nursing staff to provide person-centered care. Nursing staff may preserve personhood with a RLWD by obtaining knowledge about the resident including their likes, dislikes, and interests, their previous role in their family, and past jobs and/or careers. This knowledge of the resident as a person is the conduit of person-centered dementia care (PCDC), thereby enabling nursing staff to preserve personhood and properly implement PCDC by tailoring care specifically to each resident.

Findings from this study suggest a statistically significant positive correlation between nursing staff knowledge of residents and resident cognitive status. In other words, nursing staff appear to have more knowledge of residents who have higher cognitive functioning. As the resident’s cognitive status deteriorates, staff seem to have less familiarity with the important knowledge that makes up their personhood.

There was no statistically significant correlation between the and types of knowledge nursing staff had regarding resident family, jobs, likes, dislikes, interests, and specific and non-specific pieces of information and resident cognitive status. However, this study demonstrated that nursing staff knowledge of a resident’s family is significantly associated with a resident’s cognitive status. In other words, the higher the level of resident dementia, the less knowledge the staff has about the individual.

These findings generate concern as healthcare providers at all levels are expected to advocate for and provide patient-centered care. In order for these expectations to become a reality, nursing staff must gain knowledge of resident’s personhood. Since dementia causes memory loss and communication deficits that often result in a resident’s inability to provide information about themselves to nursing staff, creative interventions and intentional efforts must be developed by nursing staff to obtain this necessary information to preserve personhood and provide PCDC.
References


Appendix
Know Me Now Form

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resident #:</th>
<th>Nursing Staff #:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Please list everything you know about ______’s family.</th>
<th>Please list everything you know about ______’s likes, dislikes, and interests.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>4.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>5.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>6.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>7.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>8.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>9.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>10.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Please list everything you know about ______’s past job/career.</th>
<th>What are some things that you know about ______ that are not included on this form?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>3.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>4.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>5.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>6.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>7.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>8.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>9.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>10.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

About you:

1. Occupational role in Nursing Home:
2. Education Level/degree:
3. Estimated hours spent daily with resident:
4. Length of employment at Nursing Home:
5. Total number of past employments at Nursing Home Facilities:
INVITATION THROUGH SONG:
EVANGELISM AND DIVINE DISCOURSE IN ARKANSAS REVIVALS

By Chelsea Hodge
Department of History

Faculty Mentor: Dr. Elizabeth Markham
Department of History

Abstract

For over a century, Protestant evangelists have held revivals to spread their beliefs. The invitation song is the culmination of these meetings; a sermon ends with an invitation to the unsaved to come forward and publicly accept the faith of the revivalists during the “invitation song.” This hymn is not just a traditional means to allow converts to declare their faith; Christians view this time of congregational singing as an intensely personal declaration of their own conviction, a discourse between themselves and the divine. The singers believe their music can be a powerful instrument of change because of a fundamental belief that the divine is present in their singing. Through archival research and field study of modern Arkansan revivals, this paper examines the evangelical Christian’s perception of the invitation song as both a means of spiritual discourse between laity and divine and as a vital persuasive device.

I. INTRODUCTION

For over a century, revivals have been a significant factor in Protestant evangelism in the American south. The primary purpose of these evangelical meetings, held typically in the spring or fall, is to spread the beliefs of those hosting the revival by converting the nonbelievers in attendance to Christianity. Music, especially the singing of hymns, plays an integral role in these revivals. Over the years, many revivalists have believed that the music is just as effective as the actual preaching in the overall atmosphere and purpose of the event. The resulting emphasis on the musical portion has made revivals well known for their music. Thus, revivalists are careful to ensure that the music is well done and to the level the participants expect, often bringing in special guest song leaders.

The musical format in revivals has remained largely the same over the last century, a reflection of the revival’s unwavering purpose. Revivalists have crafted music into a format that harnesses its full persuasive capabilities, thus giving them no reason to make alterations. Like the revival itself, the music is intended to help lead nonbelievers to conversion, working both as a vehicle for doctrine and as a persuasive device. Based on the intensity to which the music serves this purpose, revival music can be divided into two categories: general music and the invitation song.

Occurring before the sermon, the general music allows audience members to recognize important text-music relationships that enhance what they are being taught. The invitation song, which occurs immediately following the sermon, is both the musical and spiritual pinnacle of the revival. During this time, nonbelievers who are choosing to convert make their conversion known, a convention that is more fully explained in the second half of this paper. Invitation songs are a vital part of the conversion process in a revival and thus must accurately represent
the revivalists’ theology. Though the format in which they are used remains the same, the specific hymn used as the invitation song can often denote amendments to salvation doctrine. Though music is an ideal medium to instill doctrine into nonbelievers, it is hypothesized that its persuasive power is the reason it remains largely unchanged from one century to the next, particularly through the use of the invitation song (Downey 124). While music is generally recognized as a crucial component of the overall revival structure, the actual role of the music needs to be addressed. By combining research of documented past musical practices with an ethnographic study of modern Arkansan revivals, the goal of this paper is to explore the role of the invitation song in revivals, past and present, as both revealing church’ approaches to evangelical theology and aiding in the conversion experience of those attending the revival.

II. PRIMARY SOURCES AND FIELD WORK

Music used and reused in revivals can offer a wide range of evangelical strategies and their outcomes. Several analyses of commonly used hymns demonstrate such points within this paper. Much of the research centers on an early 20th century handbook entitled How to Promote and Conduct a Successful Revival, published in 1901 and compiled and edited by R.A. Torrey. Each chapter of the book is written by a different preacher or evangelist and is intended to educate revivalists of any Protestant denomination. The chapter on music clearly demonstrates various aspects of structuring in early 20th century revivals through the selection of music, the use of soloists and choirs, and the teaching of new songs. This step-by-step guide allows for a comparison of the modern day revival with its predecessor, a comparison that indicates a surprising degree of constancy.

This research includes an archival study of Mary Hudgins’ “Gospel music research files and song books” collection (July 1992). The collection is a rare and valuable resource that focuses on revivals in Arkansas. What Torrey’s text (1901) explains regarding the progress of revivals, Hudgins’s collection explains regarding the development of gospel music in Arkansas over the last century. Hudgins carried out her own personal research of Arkansan shape-note singing and gospel music between 1937 and 1974. Her collection includes hymnals printed in Arkansas between 1891 and 1973, interviews with Arkansan choir members, composers, church musicians, and research on singing schools and camp meetings over a 40-year span. Hudgins’ work allows for direct correlations between the hymns used in Arkansas throughout the mid-1900s and those used (a) earlier at the beginning of the 20th century, and (b) today in Arkansas.

Using both Torrey and Hudgins as guides, field work was conducted to examine more extensively the current use of revival music in Arkansas. I attended four revivals in the late summer and fall of 2010 and one revival in August of 2011. Four of the five revivals were in the northwest corner of Arkansas, and one took place further south in Arkansas. Hymns and copies of the music and service were recorded whenever possible. Attending revivals allowed the researcher to note the use of instruments, soloists, choirs, the involvement of the congregation in the music, and the transmission of music via books, memory, and/or screen projectors. Careful notes of the choice of music in relation to the sermon were made, including an examination of whether the music content was similar and projected a distinct theme.

By attending several different revivals, I became familiar with the general layout of a revival service and was able to identify differences from or alterations to what might be considered the norm. However, for the purposes of this paper I largely focus on one specific revival. The size of the congregation and the methods of worship and organization in this

INQUIRY, Volume 14
particular revival emerged from the fieldwork as best representing what is now regarded as a typical Arkansan revival.

Figure 1, color-coded to delineate service elements, depicts a generalized structure of a revival service, formulated on the basis of my knowledge and experience with revivals. In the center of each section is the average number of minutes spent on each element. The service begins with congregational singing followed by announcements and an opening prayer. More singing precedes the sermon. This section is comprised of a combination of communal singing and a “choir special” – a more difficult song that only the choir sings; additionally, a soloist may be featured. The preacher, usually a special guest speaker, presents a sermon, challenging both believers and nonbelievers to follow more closely the teachings of Christ – most importantly to accept the salvation offered through His death on the cross. The sermon ends with the preacher extending an invitation to the unsaved to publicly accept the invitation by walking to the front of assembly. Occasionally, a pianist will heighten this spoken invitation by playing softly in the background. The “invitation song,” usually a hymn sung by the entire congregation, follows the preacher’s invitation. Congregational singing follows the special invitation song, and a prayer signifies the end of the service.

![Figure 1. A typical revival service.](image)

I attended a specific revival for two subsequent years, August 22 – 25, 2010, and August 14 – 17, 2011. During both years the revival took place over several days, with services held during the evening Sunday through Wednesday.

III. THE INVITATION SONG

The first 25 minutes of singing prepares the congregation for the sermon; the singing and the sermon prepare for the invitation song. The invitation song is arguably the most significant use of music in a revival: the culmination of the revival’s evangelical goal is to convert nonbelievers (Downey 116). The concept and practice of the invitation song are quite simple; the evangelist finishes his sermon and, in his own words, invites the unsaved to move to the front of the gathering to accept salvation as the congregation sings an invitation hymn (Figure 2). By then doing so the unsaved are signaling their decision to accept the salvation being offered. Though neither audibly nor in any other way explicitly expressing this, by moving to the front of a gathering during the invitation song a nonbeliever is in effect making a public declaration of faith and agreement with the doctrines preached.
The invitation song has been particularly effective in revivals and serves as a longstanding tradition. D. B. Towner demonstrates how little revival methods have changed by summarizing the move from sermon to invitation song in his instruction for revivalists of the early twentieth century:

A suitable solo or duet or even chorus often serves to clinch the message and bring people to immediate decision…Music can also be used very effectively while all the Christians are standing, by asking all those who wish to be saved to come forward while we sing, “Just as I Am,” or some similar hymn of invitation. (Towner 196-197)

Present-day revivalists conduct their invitation almost exactly as Towner suggests. Like Towner, they believe the presence of music makes it easier for nonbelievers to decide to convert to Christianity. While the text of the invitation song continues with the themes presented in the sermon, the music contributes an emotional element that translates into a spiritual experience. A century later Greg Laurie, a pastor whose evangelistic “Crusades”, attract thousands of attendees each year, demonstrates the enduring lack of change: “We just celebrated 25 years of ministry for our church, and I started [preaching] a couple of years before that. My invitations haven’t changed dramatically. If anything, as the years pass I rediscover the importance of keeping things simple” (Laurie). In other words, an individual may be influenced by the sermon, but effective music could make the decision to convert to Christianity clear and easy for him.

For revivalists, the invitation song is much more than an effective tool. They commonly attribute its influence to the workings of the Holy Spirit. Reverend Joshua Stansfield wrote, “Success is not primarily nor principally by either intellectual, numerical or organized advantage, but by the spirit of God in the workers” (Stansfield 248). Laurie states: “It’s important to realize this is a work only the Sprit can accomplish” (Laurie). That the revival’s structure has barely...
changed is not coincidental; revivalists have historically and consistently seen results from this method and consequently see no need to change it.

This short part of a revival service is binary in structure and function; the congregation invites people to accept salvation and the nonbeliever decides to accept that salvation. Christians believe that the Holy Spirit works through the music to move a nonbeliever to decision. In this way the music moves beyond a convenient time for the nonbeliever to move forward and becomes an integral part of the salvation experience.

IV. THE PRESENTATION OF THEOLOGY IN THE INVITATION SONG

An intrinsic quality of the invitation song is that it is the last venue to present salvation theology before the window to accept salvation closes (at least during the revival service). Thus the song leader chooses this particular hymn with care. Though the methods have not changed, findings from this research study suggest that revivalists have replaced once commonly used invitation songs with hymns that better reflect new doctrines. For example, the revival I attended used the hymn suggested for the invitation by Towner in 1901, “Just As I Am.” While this hymn has survived since its original publication in 1836, this representative revival did not place it in its typical invitation song position. Revivalists consider “Just As I Am” important enough to be used in the service, but they no longer see the hymn as an entirely accurate call to salvation.

Towner recommended “Just As I Am” in 1901 because the hymn placed special emphasis on Christ’s role in a person’s acceptance of salvation. Susan Vanjanten Gallagher discusses domesticity in hymns: “‘Just as I am’ affirms the fact that Elliott’s [the composer] salvation rests… on the shed blood of Jesus Christ…This hymn is not a simple sentimental effusion but rather a sound theological declaration about the inability of domestic good works to provide salvation” (Gallagher 246). The hymn asserts that only through Christ’s death can one be saved and refutes any belief that works contribute to salvation. This clear theological statement made “Just As I Am” an appropriate invitation song, and the continued agreement with this idea has kept it a staple in hymn repertoire.

Though “Just As I Am” appeared in the revivals I attended, the revivalists chose to use the hymn “All to Jesus I Surrender” as its invitation song. It is hypothesized that this replacement is significant because it demonstrates a shift in salvation theology (Figures 3 and 4, respectively). The following textual analysis illustrates the slight, yet vital, difference between the two hymns.
Figure 3. “Just As I Am”
While both hymns are sung from the viewpoint of one who wants to give his life over to God, the verses of “Just As I Am” end with “O Lamb of God, I come! I come!” signifying the role of the singer. However, the majority of the text addresses God’s willingness to accept any person, with such lines as “Just as I am, poor, wretched, blind” and His active role in leading the singer to salvation - “Because Thy promise I believe” and “Thy love unknown / Hath broken ev’ry barrier down.” The text gives greater prominence to the active role of God in receiving the sinner: “Just
as I am, Thou wilt receive, / Wilt welcome, pardon, cleanse, relieve.” The singer relinquishes to God in every verse, yet it is God who takes the active role by creating the pathways to acceptance.

“All to Jesus I Surrender,” though still about accepting salvation, takes a slightly different approach. Van de Venter’s text does not address God’s willingness to accept the sinner; rather it is a declaration of a worshipper’s personal decision to accept salvation, as stated in the first verse and chorus:

All to Jesus I surrender,
All to Him I freely give;
I will ever love and trust Him,
In His presence daily live.
I surrender all, I surrender all.
All to Thee, my blessed Savior,
I surrender all (Van de Venter)

Unlike “Just As I Am,” this text gives the singer the active role in his salvation. In this song, the person’s choice is the most important part of the salvation process.

The difference between the two songs reflects the theological beliefs of the times during which they were given prominence. The beliefs of early 20th century revivals are documented by the Southern Baptist Convention, the governing body of Southern Baptist churches, in “Baptist Faith and Message.” This creed, first published in 1925, has been revised twice, in 1963 and again in 2000. The first version (1925) appeared closest in time to the publication of Torrey’s book, which recommends the use of “Just As I Am”. This early creed states the following concerning Christian salvation: “This blessing [God’s acquittal of sins] is bestowed, not in consideration of any works of righteousness which we have done, but through the redemption that is in and through Jesus Christ” (Comparison). The text of “Just As I Am” directly supports this assertion, in that it suggests that salvation is not attained by works but through God’s acceptance of all people just as they are.

In 2000, the creed was again revised; this version continues to be used today. The sentence quoted above from the 1925 version is deleted, and one sentence is altered. Originally the sentence was written “It brings us into a state of most blessed peace and favor with God, and secures every other needed blessing,” but was then revised as follows: “Justification brings the believer unto a relationship of peace and favor with God.” This change from a “state” to a “relationship” stresses the importance of the believer’s active role in his or her salvation. The text of the modern “All to Jesus I Surrender” thus reflects the change within the theological underpinnings of the revival movement.

The shift in theological thinking is further supported by the following Southern Baptist Convention Position Statement:

We affirm soul competency, the accountability of each person before God. Your family cannot save you. Neither can your church. It comes down to you and God. Authorities can't force belief or unbelief. They shouldn't try. Against this backdrop of religious freedom, it's important for us Baptists to set forth our convictions. By stating them in a forthright manner, we provide nonbelievers with a clear choice. (“Soul Competency”) Particularly important is the last phrase, providing “nonbelievers with a clear choice.” This philosophy is stressed in “All to Jesus I Surrender” – the narrator chooses to surrender his life to God and to enter into a relationship with him. The entirety of the revival service up to this point - the opening songs, prayers, and the sermon - are all ways for the revivalists to state their
convictions, only then to leave the choice to the nonbeliever during the invitation song. By using “All to Jesus I Surrender” as the invitation song, the revivalists make it clear to the nonbeliever that with his choice comes accountability and an active decision to “surrender” everything to God.

These two hymns were originally published in the mid-1800s and have been appropriated for the respective era revivals. These songs were not written for the purpose of declaring these specific beliefs. Though various editorial changes have been made since then, the bulk of the compositions are the same as when they were originally written. A modern revival may still use “Just As I Am” in its service, because its message is relevant to modern thought. However, the revivalist no longer gives the hymn the most important place in the service, the invitation following the sermon, because it no longer depicts the core of Baptist salvation theology.

V. THE EFFECTIVE TRADITION: AN ANALYSIS OF AN INVITATION SONG

The invitation song must be theologically sound while still simple in its message since simplicity is necessary for the invitation’s purpose (Downey 121). The invitation is a time of decision and action for the nonbeliever and should not be cluttered by complex theology. The pre-sermon hymns and the sermon itself provide the necessary teachings to bring a nonbeliever to a decision. The accessible text of the invitation song plays an essential role in this respect. When accompanied by simple, repetitive music, the invitation song is designed to serve as an effective call to salvation.

While hymns used elsewhere in the service may address substantial theological views in a quick succession of texts, the invitation song is simple and straightforward. In terms of “All to Jesus I Surrender,” the song used as the invitation in the revivals under study (Figure 4), this hymn is a declaration of complete submission. The singer expresses his decision to live in “His presence daily” (Verse 1 Line 2) and forsake all “worldly pleasures,” (Verse 2 Line 2) surrendering and giving everything to the Lord “freely” (Verse 1 Line 1). The final verse reveals the expected return for this dedication; the singer requests to be “filled” with God’s “love,” “power,” and “blessings” (Verse 3 Line 2).

A simple musical structure reinforces the transparent meaning of the text. “All to Jesus I Surrender” is a relatively short hymn, consisting of three verses that are each two repetitions of a four-measure phrase and an eight-measure chorus. The verses have a lulling, cyclic melody that is almost entirely stepwise, within a range of only a fourth. The four-bar phrase in each verse contains a sequence that moves by step down to the tonic: beginning on F# (measure 1), the motivic pattern is first transposed to E (measure 2) and then to D (measure 3). The final repetition of the pattern (measure 3) enlarges the interval between the first two notes (from a second to a third) in preparation for the cadence that follows in measure 4. This sequence from scale degree 4 to 1 repeats exactly in another four-bar phrase. The repetition of the entire phrase strengthens the feeling of a cycle.

The verses do not have strong cadences; the somewhat ambiguous harmony oscillates between tonic and subdominant (the verses begin on a tonic in second inversion without the root, a vague way to use that chord). In this way a lulling effect is created by the cyclic harmonic pattern combined with the narrow melodic range. The verses are not meant to be assertive; there is no presentation of new ideas in the text, and this is reflected in the reiterative music. The three verses remind nonbelievers of what they have learned and attempt to influence their decision.
The chorus is yet more demonstrative as the melody reaches a much higher tessitura, the harmonic movement is stronger, and the texture becomes progressively thicker. The melody reaches D5, the highest note of the hymn, twice achieving a range of an octave on the chorus. The chorus’ melody also incorporates more leaps four, in all, including the leap from the end of the verse to the beginning of the chorus. While the verse had only two-part (thus ambiguous) harmony, the chorus expands into four. It begins with a call and response: two parts in the first measure (soprano and alto) and then two other parts responding (tenor and bass) in the second. Although the four parts overlap here, one does not finally hear four parts homophonically until the last four bars. This is the only phrase that is not repeated elsewhere. The chorus’ strong harmonic movement establishes the key, with a strong presence of IV and V chords and a distinct absence of any minor chords.

Without adding much complexity to the song, the chorus intensifies the hymn. As the melody gets higher and the texture thickens, the dynamic gets louder. This, combined with the greater harmonic movement, gives the hymn momentum as it approaches the end. Yet the very last phrase is a long swelling sigh; the melody moves up to a D5 and then falls by step to the octave below, encompassing the hymn’s entire range. The building intensity seems to fall away right at the very end – a musical surrender.

The uninvolved melody and harmony are designed to let the nonbeliever participate in the song without getting confused by complexities. The text is an emphatic profession of the singer’s commitment to the faith, but its real purpose, like any invitation song, is to gently persuade a nonbeliever to make the choice to go forward by reiterating the act of surrendering. The word “surrender” is used six times in one cycle of verse and chorus. The text “I surrender all” is accompanied three times in the chorus by a descending melodic line, a musical sigh to accompany a mental relinquishment.

The last sentence of the chorus is perhaps a reference to the beginning of the verses: “All to Jesus…” The verses are a witness to others, a reference to what the singer has done in faith. The last line of the chorus changes in function; now the singer speaks directly to Jesus rather than about Jesus. This shift is reflected by intensified melodic movement; the verse reaches scale degree 4 (G) at “Jesus,” but the chorus jumps to scale degree 6 (B) on “Thee.” As a consequence this last supplication is much more personal and is, perhaps, an invitation to the nonbeliever to share in this discourse with their “Savior”.

Though overtly simple, the message of this hymn is striking. The words signify a great commitment to Jesus on behalf of the singer. When considered in the context of an invitation to a nonbeliever to accept the faith, the hymn conveys solidarity and community. One must commit all to the Lord, but, hypothetically, every singer has made that same commitment as he or she invites the nonbeliever to so do as well. The final chorus, with its strong harmonic development and higher tessitura, evokes a feeling of proud proclamation. In other words, it suggests that the singer gladly makes these sacrifices in return for God’s blessings.

VI. BEYOND TRADITION: DIVING DISCOURSE AND THE INVITATION SONG

Christians’ motivation for using a song during the invitation, a tradition that has spanned over a century, is much deeper than as a vehicle to present a theological basis for the salvation a nonbeliever is being invited to accept. It is hypothesized that the collective singing of the congregation is as powerful as the words of the sermon because of the spiritual investment being made by the singers themselves. Thus the actual invitation extends beyond the initial invitation.
of the preacher into the singing itself. Through their singing Christians are inviting the divine to take a part in their persuasive discourse because of a firm belief that the divine has an ability to reach nonbelievers through their music. Believers perceive the singing itself as a vital and immutable part of the invitation experience.

Towner discusses the traditional method of “asking all those who wish to be saved to come forward while we sing” (196). He also suggests a method that is different from that traditionally used today, yet clearly demonstrates how the singing might be interpreted as a continuation of the invitation. He recommends the preacher first inform the congregation that a song will be sung and he then says, “when the song is ended I will give all who wish to accept Christ an opportunity to arise or come forward and say so in that way” (196). Perhaps Towner recommends waiting to give people the opportunity to come forward, because he realized the song was an extension of the invitation rather than punctuation separating verbal invitation from eventual physical acceptance.

Towner evidently believed that the singing was capable of performing a function beyond that of the sermon or of a spoken encouragement; he states that music “often serves to clinch the message and bring people to immediate decision” (196). The texts of invitation songs primarily deal with the following concepts essential to Christian salvation: Christ’s sacrifice on the cross, accepting the invitation before it is too late, and the power of Christ’s love and mercy to change your life. These themes make the invitation song a cajoling, persuading, and sometimes intimidating medium. Although the words are sung, they reflect the words and thoughts of the preacher, but with the added power of multiple people speaking, or really singing, them all at once. According to Towner, the effect can be quite moving, emotionally and literally, for a person wavering between going forward and not.

The words themselves, though saturated with theological teachings and spiritual significance, are only part of the entire experience. The vocal music carrying them is also key. A sermon could be followed by silence, a gap giving nonbelievers a quiet time to reflect on the preacher’s spoken offer and to consider their decision, or it could be followed by the same texts in spoken or chanted form. But instead, for more than a century, Christians have chosen to have this part of the service sung, thereby using a persuasive religious art form.

This suggests that the perceived power of the invitation extends further than the text; in other words, that perceived power is imbued in the actual act of singing. In effect, not only are the preacher and the song’s words doing the inviting, but the music itself is inviting the wayward soul to accept the salvation being offered. The notion that music can be spiritually penetrating beyond the message of the words invites a third party into the invitation experience. An invitation implies a two-part connection, that of the invited and that of the one doing the inviting. The preacher speaks the invitation first, by asking the nonbelievers to respond to his sermon during the song. The congregation sings the invitation by collectively singing the song’s words. If the music, separate and apart from the text, is extending a spiritual invitation, a third party must be extending the invitation through the music – that of a holy deity.

Spiritual discourse and connection between layman and deity is not an unfamiliar concept, though it is often studied from the direction of the believer communicating with the divine. In a recent article, Marin Marian-Balasa proposes that, “When (some) Westerners say or believe that ‘music is prayer (worship or holy offering)’ … they do not imply or think of it metaphorically. They trust in a most tangible, physical, physiological, psychological, emotional, and intellectual way that such art forms do function as religious gestures and experiences, as direct means or agencies putting the humans and the transcendental in direct contact” (129). Through the
invitation song, believers trust that their music is a divine discourse with God, and He in turn communicates with them and with the nonbelievers to whom they petition.

In support of Marian-Balasa’s words, most Protestant denominations find their musical roots in disciplines that believe singing and music to be a commanded and required part of church service. Yet many now see their role in music-making as a functional and tangible form of discourse with God. However, this discourse is not one-sided; they also firmly believe that God is, in turn, communicating with them through the medium of music. Thus the invitation song remains a critical part of every revival and church service because of the belief that God can and does speak to nonbelievers through music.

During the music, specifically during the invitation song, the entire church body has the opportunity to share their convictions with non-believers through congregational singing. It is the only part of the service in which the congregation actively participates. This communal acceptance of what they know to be real is what makes the presence of God tangible for all of those assembled, or as Marian-Balasa puts it, “music is the medium through which people make the presence of God real, actual, powerful, and through which they share and partake in the holy” (131). Through collective singing, the faithful are expressing their common beliefs, both in the gospel being shared and in their belief that God has a powerful presence in the assembly.

VII. LOST TO POSTERITY: CHRISTIAN INVESTMENT AND THE INVITATION SONG REPETOIRE

Christians take part in the invitation song for the purpose of making the “presence of God” real for the nonbeliever. They believe the song can serve as the deciding point in a nonbeliever’s decision to accept salvation. Christians exhibit this belief by adamantly utilizing a small and uniform repertoire of invitation songs, even though hundreds of new songs have been written and published over the last century. Christians disregard these new songs in favor of those they know well and feel comfortable investing in emotionally. This disuse ultimately forces newer songs out of hymnals, even though many of the songs Christians regularly sing are more than a century old (Eskew). Furthermore, the repertoire of invitation songs is not large. In one popular hymnal with over 1000 hymns, only 50 of these are “songs of invitation calling people to respond to the gospel of Jesus” (Howard). Christians maintain this small canon, most of which was written 50-100 years ago, because of a need to be familiar enough with what they are singing to allow for emotional investment.

This tendency to disregard the majority of new compositions is illustrated in a piece from Hudgins, who seemed especially fond of writing to women, who are often the wives of composers or preachers who had died. One such letter resulted in a response from Mrs. Dick St. John, who told Hudgins about a composer who had recently died. Consequently what Mrs. St. John says about his works and what has happened to them is very intriguing:

Luther Cummings, who died this past winter at the age of 92, composed gospel and sacred music all of his long and illustrious life… I have just talked with his daughter, Mrs. Ralph Edwards, 1213 Hickory, Mena, and have explained what you are looking for. She says that many of the father’s songs were printed in the Stamp-Baxter hymnals used for the “singings.” Unfortunately literally hundreds of the songs he composed are lost to posterity. Mr. Cummings had a great gift, really. Something that is now lost. (St. John, Mrs. Dick Letter to Mary Hudgins, 30 April 1969)
Mrs. St. John might have written that last sentence referring to the death of a great composer, but on a deeper level she is also referring to the many hymns Mr. Cummings wrote that fell to the wayside.

Present-day Christians’ practice of eschewing new compositions in favor of traditional songs is further confirmed by Cara Stevens, the music minister of Southern Heights Baptist Church. Ms. Stevens explains a practical reason why her congregation, like many others, consistently sings older songs, though they might occasionally branch out into newer music. In the following quote she speaks about ensuring congregational involvement in a revival by choosing familiar music.

I think that part of that is picking music that they do like. Picking music that is familiar to them as well as incorporating new. If you’re constantly doing those new songs it’s hard to learn and sing songs that are familiar to you. (Stevens, C. Personal Interview. 12 Nov. 2010)

She confirms and maintains the practice of spurning new songs for older songs by encouraging the use of hymns that people already know and like.

While many churches see a practical reason not to introduce new music, one reason for their continued reliance on older hymns may go beyond this practicality. While religiously and spiritually it makes sense, particularly when referring to songs used for the invitation, believers avoid new music for the simple reason that it is unfamiliar. They invest, intellectually, mentally, and spiritually, in the words they sing, in how they sing them, and what specifically they are hoping to achieve when the invitation is sung. Thus they cling to their established repertoire to ensure that the music will carry the full weight of their intentions.

Christians view singing as a viable method of helping the nonbeliever feel the presence of God, or as Marian-Balasa writes, while singing they find “the mind focused on the ultimate reality that takes place while singing: the presence of God. The presence is no longer imaginary, because music/singing makes it psychologically and sensorially experiential” (139). When experiencing music that is unknown to them, or when struggling to find the pitches or follow the words, Christians often feel that they are not infusing the music with the power that they know and believe can be present. Ultimately they believe the presence of God must be felt emotionally to change the hearts of the unsaved.

The invitation song is not just a tradition, nor a convenient device to ease the transition out of the sermon. The invitation song is a vital part of encouraging lost souls to come to the “other side.” Christians feel its importance on the following levels: their role in personally inviting a nonbeliever; their perception of a divine presence that is felt through the power of music; and their belief that music can be a powerful instrument of change.

VIII. CONCLUDING THOUGHTS

Revivals have long been a part of southern religion and society. Their presence through the decades has established a long-standing yet effective tradition of music. Though theology has been modified and new songs are continually replaced, the methods have not changed, nor has the mission. Through revivals, evangelical Christians facilitate an integral part of their faith by actively seeking and converting nonbelievers. Music allows the faithful to take an active role in this process. Yet even beyond the role of the believer, the music itself is designed to contribute its own persuasive power, evoking a divine discourse and adding its metaphysical voice to the call.
New believers, in turn, identify music as a significant factor in their conversion, and the revival in its entirety becomes a collective gesture of Christian faith.

Yet music’s role does not end here. Evangelical Christians are influenced by their religion and by the stigmas attached to them, making their position in society a complex one (Temperley). Revival music serves as a snapshot of evangelical Christian faith, contextualizing evangelicals within their society by epitomizing many of the things central to their beliefs. By using their music to reflect as a voice of faith, scholars can better understand how evangelical Christians connect theology with worship and conviction with society. Although this research study suggests that revivals play a deeply historical and spiritual role in the lives of southern, evangelical Christians, it does not exhaust the many other possible variables, including but not limited to denomination, location, ethnicity, and economic background. Further analysis could help expand the understanding of revival music as an expression of faith, culture, and society.
HISTORY: Chelsea Hodge

Works Cited


Elliot, C. “Just As I Am”, 1835. Print.


Stevens, Cara. Personal interview. 12 Nov. 2010.


Van de Venter, Judson W. “All to Jesus I Surrender.” 1896. Print.
Dear Mary,

I am going to be lazy and ask you to call Inez Cline and thank her for the delightful talk that she gave us. Tell her, please, that we are all inspired by her and are starting to get to work.

It was so nice to meet you and we all felt that you added so much to our meeting. I have the address of Mrs. Claude Willifred who was the one I told you wrote a song about Arkansas and who tried (unsuccessfully) to have it adopted as the State's song.

Mrs. Claude Williford, 2226 Terwilliger, Tulsa, Okla. Her first name is "Opal".

I also came up with another name for you. Luther Cummings, who died this past winter at the age of 92, composed gospel and sacred music all of his long and illustrious life. He also conducted "singlyings" and he was one of the Star's oldest regular contributors with his inspirational sayings, etc.

I have just talked with his daughter, Mrs. Ralph Edwards, 1213 Hickory, Mena, and have explained what you are looking for. She says that many of her father's songs were printed in the Stamp-Baxter hymnals and used for the "singlyings". Unfortunately literally hundreds of the songs he composed are lost to posterity. Mr. Cummings had a great gift, really. Something that is now lost.

I hope that this will be helpful to you. Probably if you were to come to Polk County and "dig" you would find many more who composed songs.

Sincerely,

Margaret St. John
Mrs. Dick St. John
Box 5
Mena, Arkansas
DERACIALIZED LEADERSHIP AND PROMOTION OF AFRICAN AMERICAN POLITICAL ENGAGEMENT: CORY BOOKER’S USE OF TWITTER

By Marisol McNair
Political Science

Faculty Mentor: Dr. Pearl K. Ford Dowe
Political Science

Abstract

Cory Booker was elected mayor of Newark, New Jersey in 2006, after two rancorous and racially charged campaign cycles; he used a deracialized political style that challenged traditional thinking about Black leadership for many in Newark. Booker uses the social networking tool, Twitter, to establish a cohesive group identity and to legitimize his leadership with African Americans in Newark. We use a social media “engagement infrastructure” framework developed by Leighninger and Mann (2011) to review Booker’s postings on Twitter over a 31-day period. The goal of this review was to analyze the ways in which Booker utilizes social media to promote African American political engagement, and himself, in Newark. Findings suggest that, although Booker successfully uses Twitter to map networks, build coalitions, connect with and attract constituents, a more politically engaged population has not materialized. Booker’s ability to create an improved infrastructure that promotes his political agenda and that solidifies Black group support may be essential for his long-term success as a deracialized Black leader.

Introduction

Cory Booker is an unlikely political leader for Newark. He is a young Ivy League educated African American, raised in an affluent suburban New Jersey town, who has studied both Judaism and the non-violent philosophy of Gandhi (Boy, 2008). Newark is the largest city in New Jersey, with African Americans comprising more than half of the population; Newark has a median income nearly half that of New Jersey state and a slowly rebounding crime rate that has historically crippled the city (U.S. Census, 2011). In the wake of deeply stratifying race riots in 1967, Newark became the first major northeastern city to elect a Black mayor (Gibson, 1974). The hopes that ushering in Black leadership would alleviate the immense urban problems the city faced did not materialize; instead, Newark entered 40 years of a racialized, political regime whereby political insiders were promoted, all to the detriment of the city at large (Sullivan, 1986).

Despite this history, Booker forged a relationship with Newark using a deracialized leadership style characterized by McCormick and Jones (1993, p. 76) as an approach that “defuses the polarizing effects of race by avoiding explicit reference to race-specific issues, while at the same time emphasizing those issues that are perceived as racially transcendent, thus mobilizing a broad segment of the electorate for purposes of capturing or maintaining public office”. Booker attempted to engage Newark in the political and social struggle to overcome the fate of the once named “worst city in America” (Dolan, n.d.). He believed that Social Networking Sites (SNS) could promote a growing and more vibrant economy that could both benefit all of its citizens while addressing the deep and painful social issues focused around race.
that were key to Newark’s future success and past disappointments. Through SNS, in particular Twitter, Booker engaged in an ongoing conversation with his constituents in an effort to notify them of his intent and his actions to change the fate of a city besieged by racism, violence, lack of economic opportunity, and a legacy of bad press.

**Literature Review**

**Newark – A Study in Black Leadership Style**  
**Racialized Leadership in Newark – Kenneth Gibson and Sharpe James**

The riots in the summer of 1967 fueled by racism and a “pervasive feeling of corruption,” ushered in a new era for Newark (Barbanel, 1981). For African Americans living in Newark, a wave of hope that a new foundation of Black leadership could be forged in this post-industrial city led to the election of the nation’s first Black mayor of a major northeastern city in 1970 (Gibson 1974). Mayor Kenneth Gibson was seen as a calming influence in the wake of the riots and a contrast to the corrupt regime of former Mayor Hugh J. Addonzio (Gibson, 1974; Barbanel, 1981). Gibson, raised in Newark, legitimized his political leadership through his involvement in the Civil Rights Movement and via his endorsement by Black organizations (Gibson, 1974; Gillespie, 2010). Although he was described as “square” and “bland” when elected, he took on a national presence bolstered by his status as the northeast’s first Black mayor (Gibson, 1974). However, two unsuccessful campaigns for New Jersey Governor in 1981 and 1985 (Perlez, 1985) led many Newark citizens to resent his political ambitions and to believe the attention and campaigns “removed” him from Newark’s local problems (Narvaez, 1987). Gibson served four terms before being unseated by Sharpe James in 1986. Nineteen years after the 1967 riots, James promised to alleviate high unemployment, crime, a failing school system, and a lack of recreational facilities that continued to plague Newark despite Gibson’s failed efforts (Sullivan, 1986).

Sharpe James, a peer of Gibson’s who was also active in the Civil Rights Movement and had legitimized his political leadership after serving several terms on the Newark City Council, came into office as a second-generation Black mayor. Marschall and Ruhill (2007) suggest that second-generation Black leaders must produce tangible success beyond symbolic efforts to maintain the support of a majority-minority electorate. Thus, in order to maintain a politically engaged constituency that viewed his leadership as effective and trustworthy, James had to shift the agenda in Newark from political inclusion to an expansion of economic and political resources to Newark’s citizens (Bobo & Gilliam, 1990). The end of his first term, however, only brought symbolic changes such as inspirational banners along the city’s main thoroughfare, an increase in mounted police, newly planted trees, and a city ordinance requiring that businesses only hang mesh security gates to dispel Newark’s image as a city mired in crime (DePalma, 1990).

By his second term, James moved away from his local “established presence” that helped him defeat Gibson in 1986 (Narvaez, 1987). James had positioned himself as a national leader and speaker on urban issues, similar to Gibson previously, was elected president of the National League of Cities and was named advisor of urban problems by President Clinton (Gray, 1994). This national spotlight, however, did not overshadow his failed agenda and corruption in his administration. The indictment of three city council members, education policy failures culminating in the state takeover of the Newark school system in 1994, and consistent high crime rates became defining characteristics of James’ second term (Gray, 1994).

Serious patterns of corruption and mismanagement were also revealed in the Newark Police Department. In 1993, 26 officers were accused of raping, robbing, and beating prostitutes,

INQUIRY, Volume 14
however the department did not investigate the allegations or pursue disciplinary action. In 1995 four officers were arrested for selling recovered stolen cars to friends. And 1996 brought the realization that the Police Director, citing department tradition endorsed by James, had used the investigation account for personal funds, impeding the department’s ability to conduct drug and other investigations (Kocieniewski & Sullivan, 1995; Sullivan, 1996). During this period, Newark experienced a seven percent increase in crime at the same time that similar cities experienced a one percent decline; in addition, the FBI ranked Newark as the most violent city in the United States in 1995 (Kocieniewski & Sullivan, 1995; Stout, 1995). Moving beyond mere access to Black leadership, African American mayors are judged by their constituents based on performance above race (Howell & Perry, 2004). The efficacy and conduct of a city’s police department is a significant factor in how Black citizens in majority-minority cities view Black mayoral leadership (Howell & Perry, 2004). According to Bobo and Gilliam (1990), a reduction in Black constituency participation and engagement resulted when the police department was perceived as irresponsible and ineffective by Black voters in Newark. Indeed, by the time of the 1998 election, overall voter turnout dropped by 8 percent to 34 percent of registered voters; this was decreased from 42 percent in 1994 (Table 1).

Table 1. Election Turnout Data for Newark, New Jersey Mayoral Elections (1986-2010)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Election Year</th>
<th>Registered Voters</th>
<th>Total Votes</th>
<th>Kenneth Gibson</th>
<th>Sharpe James</th>
<th>Cory Booker</th>
<th>Ronald Rice</th>
<th>Clifford A. Minor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>116,250</td>
<td>56,980</td>
<td>22,682</td>
<td>30,739</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>101,260</td>
<td>34,929</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>24,798</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>93,842</td>
<td>39,314</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>23,248</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>129,467</td>
<td>44,004</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>23,608</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>125,164</td>
<td>54,996</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>24,847</td>
<td>25,881</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>120,810</td>
<td>46,724</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>33,850</td>
<td>10,777</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>135,380</td>
<td>38,480</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>22,745</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>13,570</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Election data from the Office of the City Clerk, Newark, New Jersey (2012)

In addition to implications of corruption and mismanagement, James was unable to increase municipal services or create an environment where low-income residents of Newark could find employment and affordable housing. For example, unemployment remained approximately twice the state average throughout James’ administration (Jacobs, 2002), while James’ policy to revitalize Newark centered on large downtown development such as the New Jersey Performing Arts Center and the New Jersey Devil’s hockey stadium; these initiatives did not benefit the majority of Newark’s citizens (Ogasio, 2001). In addition, James’ development plan did not provide new contributions to an affordable housing fund; further he allowed high-rise public housing to be demolished without developing contingent plans to meet the housing needs for most of the displaced within Newark (DePalma, 1988). Consequently, by 1999, the Newark Housing Department had over 9,000 people on a waiting list for public housing, prompting a federal court to order Newark to advance new construction and renovations (Smothers, 1999).

The housing problems also had a negative effect on voter satisfaction. Marschall and Ruhill (2007) found that African Americans living in neighborhoods with older housing and in central city areas showed higher dissatisfaction with local government. For James, this
dissatisfaction materialized in lower political engagement and a continuing decrease in Newark’s population. A lower turnout of registered voters could also characterize James’ inability to engage Newark (Table 1). Despite a spike in turnout for the heated contest between James and his eventual successor, Cory Booker, turnout decreased throughout James’ tenure, bottoming out in 1998 with only 34 percent of registered voters coming to the polls, a decrease from the 49 percent turnout when James won the office over Kenneth Gibson, a four-term incumbent, in 1986 (Table 1).

Persons (1993) describes the evolution of Black leadership styles from insurgency, to new Black politics, and finally to Black crossover politics. Newark’s mayoral history since 1970 demonstrates Persons’ characterizations of Black political styles. The insurgency style of first generation Black mayors, characterized by challenging and criticizing the established political order, leadership, and institutions to promote Black mobilization through a social reform agenda, often resulting in racial polarization is clearly represented by Gibson’s tenure. Gibson began as an insurgent and throughout his 20-year administration institutionalized his leadership, resulting in “machine-style politics” supported through patronage in employment and city contracts and control over other municipal political posts. Gibson’s defeat by James in 1986 signaled the transition from insurgency politics to new Black politics based on racial appeals to a majority Black population and substantive agenda promises that went beyond the descriptive representation that characterized Gibson’s tenure (Persons, 1993).

According to Gillespie (2010), James’ inability to produce the institutional changes that would lead to substantive increases in the quality of life for the majority-minority population with predominantly low socioeconomic characteristics, coupled with his continuation of machine-style political leadership, alienated voters and opened the door for a new Ivy league upstart who would significantly alter the nature of political engagement and leadership in Newark. Cory Booker’s election in 2006 marked the transition from Persons’ new Black politics to Black crossover politics in Newark. In other words, Booker de-emphasized traditional Black issues and focused instead on an agenda of partisan, non-racial themes that are characteristic of crossover, deracialized Black leadership (Persons, 1993).

Cory Booker and Newark

Cory Booker was raised in affluent Harrington Park, New Jersey by Cary and Carolyn Booker, two IBM executives who were raised in the South, participated in the Civil Rights Movement, and attended traditionally Black colleges. Guided by his parents’ high standards for their sons, Booker went on to study at Stanford, became a Rhodes Scholar at Oxford, and later attended Yale Law School, developing a universalized approach to philosophy and politics. In 1995, while still attending Yale Law, Booker moved to Newark and took residence in Brick Towers, a massive public housing complex, remaining a tenant until the building was condemned in 2006 (Boyer, 2008).

Brick Towers became Booker’s Newark political center. This location allowed him to learn the political atmosphere of the city through his work on the tenant’s board and by giving legal assistance to his neighbors; it also helped to legitimize him as a political force in Newark and to establish a supportive base (Boyer, 2008). Booker’s “professors” – his neighbors and other Newark residents with whom he cultivated relationships and who educated him on the issues in Newark also served to spread the word of his political efforts throughout the city (Boyer, 2008). These constituent supports would help elect him to the city council in 1998 and, later, to mayor in 2006 (Cave, 2006).
Booker’s public reference to this group, however, occasionally highlighted his problematic deracialized political stance. In a speech in predominantly White Summit, New Jersey, shortly after his election as mayor in 2006, Booker described Judith Diggs, one of his “professors”, as a “huge, sort of portly woman without many teeth in her mouth” (Boyer, 2008). This speech instigated a recall effort by previous mayor Sharpe James loyalists and projected a feeling to some in Newark that Booker’s deracialized leadership style may be masking an agenda that is not focused on the needs of African American and low-income non-African American constituents, revealing him to be the “wolf in sheep’s clothing” Jesse Jackson had warned against his 2006 campaign. With this warning, Jackson described the generational difference in leadership style and favored conciliation over confrontation (Boyer, 2008).

**Newark Comes to Cory Booker**

Cory Booker fought his way to the mayor’s office after two difficult election cycles. The first cycle took place in 2002 when Booker ran against 16-year incumbent Sharpe James; many viewed this race as one distinctly based on African American racial identity that pitted a well-known Civil Rights era leader against a young Ivy League upstart (Gillespie, 2010). James ran a powerful and entrenched political regime in Newark, seated in a communal racial identity that placed Cory Booker as a decided outsider. During the often vicious 2002 mayoral campaign, James solidified Booker’s outsider status and questioned his Black identity by publically claiming he was from a mixed race Jewish and Republican family (Boyer, 2008). James’ political “machine” was able to assert considerable power to mobilize city workers to defeat Booker. According to Jacobs (2002), municipal staff were paid to remove Booker’s campaign signs, block Booker’s canvassers from entering public housing projects, offer residents payment for removing Booker campaign posters in public housing, and allegedly attacked a Booker supporter wearing campaign regalia. Jacobs further asserts that absolute loyalty was required by James, who would freely wield his powerful position in New Jersey politics against opponents and non-supporters.

Booker lost the 2002 campaign but continued working to legitimize his political presence and ambitions in Newark. He utilized his network of Brick Towers supporters and pursued the “local wisdom” of Carl Sharif to increase his legitimacy in Newark (Boyer, 2008; Gillespie, 2010). Sharif was a local political figure who had remained separate from the racially charged machine politics of Sharpe James. His advice to Booker – knock on every door in the poorest and Blackest Central Ward in Newark – would help bolster Booker’s racial authenticity (Gillespie, 2010). His political authenticity was still questioned, however, by traditional Black leaders like Jesse Jackson and Al Sharpton, highlighting the increasingly apparent “generational cleft” between Civil Rights Era leadership and Booker’s deracialized and cooperative crossover style (Boyer, 2008; Gillespie, 2010).

According to Gillespie (2010), the evolution of Black leadership styles since the Civil Rights Era reflects the evolution of policy from political institutional access to substantive policy change. For example, many younger Black leaders, who are not directly connected to the Civil Rights Movement, adopt a deracialized campaign and leadership style that may or may not lead to successful electoral and policy outcomes. Gillespie presents a model of leadership focused around three key characteristics: crossover appeal, perceived career trajectory, and connections to the Black establishment. Black leaders with high crossover appeal may frame issues in a way that minimizes or removes racial elements of a problem to maintain a wider audience. The second key characteristic, perceived career trajectory, reflects whether a young Black leader wants to pursue higher office, gauges how much positive media attention they receive, and...
examines the structural and political implications created by the probability that a young Black leader of a majority-minority city may have to confront campaigning for higher offices in majority White districts and states. The final criteria, connections to Black leadership, can benefit or detract from a young Black leader. Connections to Civil Rights Era leadership can increase support for a young Black politician, but her political socialization and close ties to the old style leadership may result in a leadership style that does not lead to innovation or advancement for Black constituents because of her perceived need to respect elders and pursue their goals (Gillespie, 2010, 25).

Booker overcame the divide between old and new Black leadership with his winning bid in 2006 (Boyer, 2008) after James backed out of the election due to accusations of fraud and his defeat of Ronald Rice (Martin, 2008). Booker had rallied forces within and outside of Newark in the intervening four years and had won the hope of Newarkers, winning by the widest margin of victory ever in Newark’s history (Cave, 2006). Booker’s leadership style, with high crossover appeal, extreme ambition, and weak ties to the Civil Rights Movement, created a significant amount of media attention around his campaigns in Newark and has characterized his leadership style since taking office in 2006 (Gillespie, 2010).

Mired in racial, political and social upheaval since the 1960’s, Newark had become a city needing new political leadership; Booker’s promise of change was welcomed by many residents. Fifty-four percent of Newark’s residents are African American and 24 percent live below the poverty line (U.S. Census Bureau, 2011); these demographics have been evolving since the riots that drove middle class Whites and Blacks to the surrounding New Jersey suburbs, and with them tax revenue, business growth, and support for neighborhood community resources that helped sustain a Black group identity (Gay, 2004). The low socioeconomic status of many Newark citizens created an atmosphere where Booker had more opportunity to attract low-income constituents ready for a change in leadership after decades of marginalization by two Black political regimes that were unable create the structural and institutional changes Black Newarkers needed to thrive (Gillespie, 2010). However, he would also have to assert his Black identity to maintain the trust of higher-income Black residents and local leaders (Gay, 2004).

The dearth of cohesive Black community networks due to extensive urban poverty conditions created an obstacle for Booker’s mobilization efforts in Newark and challenged his ability to develop a message that enhanced the Black group consciousness in order to effectively lead and mobilize Newark while simultaneously maintaining a universalized, deracialized leadership style (Gay, 2004). During a 2002 campaign stop, Booker was confronted by a voter leery of his deracialized style and “outsider” status who asked, “What I don’t understand is where you are from? Where do you live? And what are you doing here?” Further commenting, the voter echoed many of James’ charges against Booker with the statement, “I just don’t see how someone who’s not from around here could understand what’s going on in Newark” (Tepperman, 2002). This widespread attitude contributed to Booker’s defeat in 2002 and highlighted his need to meaningfully engage Newark residents. In response, Booker tapped into emerging technological engagement platforms, like SNS and Twitter, to create communal mobilization and trust. Some suggest that increased technological engagement methods contributed to his election in 2006, and reelection in 2010, while allowing him to maintain a deracialized leadership style (Gillespie, 2010).

Cory Booker’s Deracialized Leadership

Booker’s deracialized leadership style is unique in the recent history of Newark itself, but his methods of marketing Newark to a wider regional audience while promoting economic
growth support a deracialized style that universalizes Newark’s issues to a larger stage. This approach creates a more racially competitive jurisdiction that encourages Booker’s de-emphasis on Black issues and promotes more universalized issues (Orey & Ricks, 2007). Newark, however, demands leadership that can confront the important urban issues of crime, poverty, and a history of government corruption requiring a close examination of the effects of race in Newark. Therefore, Booker had to occupy the political middle ground and espouse a leadership style that embraced a deracialized message to engage a wider racial audience while confronting the distinctly racial issues prevalent in Newark (Canon, Schousen, & Sellers, 1996).

Realizing this, Booker placed crime at the top of his agenda during his campaigns; a focus on crime has remained throughout his tenure (Boyer, 2008; Gillespie, 2012). However, his appointment of Garry McCarthy as the Newark Chief of Police, a White non-Newark resident, was widely criticized by African American leaders in Newark. Poet, activist, and Newark resident, Amiri Baraka, criticized Booker’s decision in his book *How to Recover from the Addiction to White Supremacy* (Boyer, 2008). Councilman Charles Bell echoed the poet’s criticism and referred to hiring the White, non-Newarker McCarthy as a “major misstep” (Gillespie, 2012). Booker’s decision to go outside Newark for police leadership was essential to his goal of regime reform and culture change in the Newark Police Department, which was entrenched with James supporters who had used the force to harass Booker during his earlier campaigns (Boyer, 2008).

McCarthy introduced several changes that put more police on the streets at crucial times of day, instituted the COMPSTAT system that statistically tracks crimes as they occur, and utilized a much criticized strategy of quality of life arrests that focus on minor infractions with the hopes of discovering more serious violations (Boyer, 2008). The success of Booker and McCarthy’s policies to reduce crime in Newark was essential to the overall success and approval of Booker’s leadership. Marschall and Ruhill (2007) found that substantive, responsive police policy that placed more African American police on the force directly affected Black residents’ evaluation of a police force. Further, the effectiveness of Booker’s leadership is related to his ability to reduce crime in Newark (Marschall & Ruhill, 2007). Uniform Crime Statistics, however, do not indicate marked success for Booker and McCarthy’s strategies (Dow, Fuentes, Bice, & Nally, 2011), showing only modest changes between 2006 and 2010. For example, while the total number of murders fell from 107 in 2006 to 91 in 2010, the violent crime rate per 1,000 people remained consistent (Dow et al., 2011).

Ending government corruption, another prevalent issue in Newark politics, has been central to Booker’s drive to build trust with his constituents following the fraud indictments of both Sharpe James and Kenneth Gibson (Malanga, 2007). Booker inherited a city ingrained for the last 40 years in a political culture based on patronage; he was confronted immediately with the byproducts of James’ corrupt system. For example, upon taking office, Booker’s team realized the city budget created by James had an over $44 million deficit (Boyer, 2008; Malanga, 2007). Realizing that many of the staff held over from James’ administration still worked throughout the municipal structure, Booker hired an outside firm to audit the budget (Boyer, 2008). According to Malanga (2007), Booker also responded by slashing many of the municipal jobs that had been occupied by James sympathizers – primarily African American Newarkers. The inevitable criticism faced by the new deracialized mayor was difficult for the young administration, however Booker dismissed the backlash by stating, “[I’m] tired of racial politics” (Malanga, 2007).
Despite efforts to end corruption, Booker’s administration has not been free of corruption itself. In October 2011, Ronald Salahuddin, Booker’s former deputy Mayor, was convicted of conspiring to commit extortion by diverting city demolition contracts to his business partner (Giambusso, 2011). His defense centered on city policy to ensure that minorities participate in city contracts and included testimony from Booker denying knowledge of Salahuddin’s involvement (DeMarco, 2011). Booker’s inability to achieve lower crime rates or to end government corruption is echoed by his critics’ evaluation of him as “Giuliani without the bite”, alluding to the Rudolph Giuliani’s forceful and successful reduction of crime in New York City (Boyer, 2008).

Indeed, Booker has seen only moderate success in bringing Newark voters to the polls. In addition, enthusiasm for him seems to follow a pattern similar to previous mayor James. For example, both mayors peaked with approximately 70 percent of registered voters during their second campaigns, followed by a more than 10 percent decrease in vote shares by their third campaigns. More disturbing for Booker is the overall voter turnout. In 2010, only 28 percent of registered constituency members turned out to vote, the lowest rates from 1986 to 2010 (Table 1). The corresponding reduction in support for Booker may be signaling a trend that could make him vulnerable in future elections and does not support the efficacy of his political engagement tactics.

Building Trust in Newark

Booker must address both the obstacles his deracialized leadership style and the history of corruption in Newark created to promote the racial community identity required to produce the necessary changes for Newark and to legitimize his leadership in a majority-minority city. Marschall and Ruhill (2007) examined the effect of Black leadership on constituents’ satisfaction and level of incorporation, and the official’s ability to improve local services in majority-minority cities. They found that racial group identification is significant in all three of these areas and that Black representation must move beyond symbolic influence to improve local services like police in a very real and substantive way.

In the context of a city like Newark, with a 54 percent African American population, the number of Black voters positively affects political participation, making an individual more likely to become involved in local city politics, essential to the “Black politics” approach to political action that incorporates competition for resources in majority-minority cities as a motivation for action (Spence, McClerking, & Brown, 2009). However, the tradition of corruption inherited from the James and Gibson administrations and the mounting issues of crime pose a challenge for Booker to overcome longstanding political disengagement and mistrust in Newark. Gay (2004) found that racial group identity is weaker in higher income neighborhoods because access to resources and economic opportunities remove the social markers that would otherwise reinforce the feeling that anti-Black discrimination was a significant, controlling factor in life. In keeping with this paradigm, Newark’s high African American population and 24 percent poverty rate (Dow et al., 2011) should contribute to a rich environment for Black group identity and political engagement. Thus, Booker’s deracialized approach must also incorporate methods to enhance and encourage Black group identity to mobilize Newark’s population, and to gain continued support and participation for Booker’s economic and social agenda.

Traditional Black leadership models growing out of the Civil Rights Era includes a focus on Black empowerment, mobilization, and immediate social change (Walters, 2007). However, because Booker did not come into politics through experience in or connection to the Civil
Rights Movement, his commitment to Black issues and legitimization as a Black leader have not been approved by Black community leaders in the traditional way; instead, Booker was often criticized by traditional Black leaders like Jesse Jackson and Al Sharpton (Boyer, 2008; Walters, 2007). Booker attempts to overcome the deficits his non-traditional and deracialized leadership style creates in a majority-minority city through government transparency using several forms of communication, including an ongoing conversation with his constituents, and the world, using Twitter.

**Promoting African American Civic Engagement with Twitter**

**The Government’s Use of the Internet to Encourage Civic Engagement**

Kang and Gearhart (2010) define civic engagement as “membership in collective activities for establishment and nourishment of the community through active citizenry” (p 444). They examine the promotion of civic engagement by government websites through the lens of representative, pluralist, and direct democracy and conclude that websites promote civic engagement by providing access to services, monitoring representatives, and providing direct democracy functions (Kang & Gearhart, 2010). They suggest that government websites can also increase the likelihood of civic engagement by helping citizens easily and inexpensively evaluate and communicate with city government without the constraints of time and space. Further, they promote support for policies and programs through debate and comment, connecting constituents with officials and instilling trust and a sense of ownership of the policies.

The Pew Internet and American Life Project reviewed the effects that the Internet has on political engagement in many contexts. Their 2011 report concluded that constituents’ perceptions that local government provide information increased the likelihood they would be satisfied with other civic services (Rainie, Purcell, Siesfeld, & Patel). Further, they found the degree of public transparency in government positively affects constituent views of their ability to impact government.

A report from the National League of Cities echoed the Pew Institute’s research and also identified ways to build stronger community engagement and local democracy (Leighninger & Mann, 2011). Findings from the report identified the following three categories of government interactions that promote civic engagement: creating spaces for citizens, building leadership skills and capacity, and improving public decision-making and problem solving. The authors also examined the following types of political engagement that can be achieved through online government interaction: circulating information, discussing and connecting, gathering initial input, deliberating and recommending, and deciding and acting (Leighninger & Mann, 2011).

**The Problem of Individuation on Social Networking Sites**

Social Networking Sites (SNS) can inflate the value of the individual participant by creating an open avenue of communication between a group and the individual member networks, producing a self-centered version of political participation that does not promote group identity and participation (Fenton & Barassi, 2011). Instead, political participation through SNS can create a platform for the individual to promote their own message over that of the group. If online organizational participation through social networking sites promotes individual self-realization, then use by government groups hoping to engage and mobilize constituents may actually impede collective political action, and instead, create a series of disjointed, fragmented acts that can further isolate individuals from public action and political incorporation.

Additionally, individual use of social media for political participation can give the often incorrect impression that participants achieve a “mediated center,” however collective political action and group supported values do not result and the group becomes stratified (Fenton &
Yet this view does not take into account the role of traditionally strong group identity in African American communities, like Newark, and the transformative possibilities a deinstitutionalized and egalitarian form of political participation through social networking may have on this group that has traditionally been marginalized in broader political movements (Johnson, 2002). The success of group political participation and mobilization through SNS relies on the policymaker’s ability to integrate and respond to the demands of the online group in the offline world (Kes-Erkul & Erkul, 2009). These factors indicate a government entity must be able to quickly respond and integrate individual as well as group comments and views into offline policy formulation and action. Thus Twitter’s instant communication and response format could serve as a powerful platform for a well organized political entity to promote both their policies and offline actions while mitigating the effects of individuation.

**Creating a Political Empowerment Infrastructure through Social Networking Sites**

The problem of individuation and fragmented political engagement can be counteracted if governments create an “engagement infrastructure” that reinforces social media relationships with offline, face-to-face relationships. This infrastructure can be a potent tool to empower and mobilize groups, solidify an individual’s commitment to the group, and encourage political engagement; it is also more easily sustainable than traditional mobilizing efforts (Leighninger, 2011). The Pew Internet and American Life Project recognized three dimensions of a successful engagement infrastructure system: a robust, diverse supply of information, a sophisticated communications infrastructure for delivering information, and a cache of residents with the skills needed to access that information and to use it in effective ways to address community needs (Rainie et al., 2011). Further, governments and officials using online tools to promote political engagement must include democratic practices, value participatory decision making, and create government structures to allow engagement to flow (Leighninger, 2011).

While online interaction with government agencies and officials is becoming increasingly common and accepted, offline interactions are still valued and necessary, especially in the context of group mobilization. A recent Pew report noted that more than half of online users also contacted government using offline means as a supplement to online information gathering (Smith, 2010). The conjunction of online and offline communication strategies can also help to mitigate possible digital inequality factors; it also requires different sets of skills and resources to use online sources effectively.

One advantage to online government communication is the reduced amount of time a constituent must commit to effectively interact with an agency or official (Best & Krueger, 2005). The Internet also may serve as a gateway for disengaged constituents to access political information and to learn the civic skills needed to participate politically. Best and Krueger (2005) found that 30.4 percent of constituents without strong civic skills did have at least two Internet skills, thereby creating access for low-income constituents and developing the opportunity to learn new civic skills as a way to circumvent a pattern of unequal participation.

Online constituents are also more likely to contact public officials. Since online mobilization efforts have been shown to reach non-Whites at the same rate as Whites, online participation may be an effective arena to mobilize Black groups (Best & Krueger, 2005). However, 20 percent of African American and Latino households cite cost as a barrier to home broadband subscriptions (Mossberger, 2009), “digital inequality” is a barrier that leaders need to address.

Looking closely at Internet access and use, however, provides a more positive outlook for the use of online government and access to officials to engage Black groups in urban areas.
African Americans tend to have a positive view of the Internet as a vehicle for economic opportunity and as a source of new skills; in fact, when controlling for socioeconomic factors, there is no statistical difference between Black and White Internet usage (Best & Krueger, 2005). This finding suggests that increased municipal access and training could quickly close the digital inequality gap in low-income, high African American populated urban areas, such as Newark. The Pew Internet and American Life Project reviewed three cities to gauge the impact of government communication on citizen level of engagement and satisfaction; findings suggest that home Internet access had a significant civic effect and made it much more likely that individuals would email or use social media to interact with municipal agencies and leaders (Rainie et al., 2011).

The Pew study also found that social media is being used by residents to learn about their community, share information, and stay in touch on community matters. Indeed, cell phones are being used with greater frequency and many more people report using Twitter to access their news and to post related material (Rainie et al., 2011). Zickuhr and Smith (2012) found that Blacks are as likely as Whites to own a smart phone and are more likely to use them for a range of online activities. In addition, while gaps in home broadband access still exist, when controlling for primary language, education, and income, the gaps disappear between minority and White populations. The increased use of cell phones is a promising engagement tool for cities like Newark that are struggling with low socioeconomic status populations. Thus, an investment in municipal Internet infrastructure could also positively affect access and use for residents in Newark.

**Engagement and Mobilization Using Twitter**

The use of Twitter to access news and to communicate with public officials has grown significantly across all groups, especially among African Americans. Studies on the emerging use of Twitter found that nine percent of heavy online government users are African American (Smith, 2010), 25 percent of African American Internet users use Twitter, 54 percent of cell phone owning Twitter users access the site using their phones (Smith, 2011), and two percent of Internet users (or 7% of Twitter users) follow a government agency or official on Twitter (Smith, 2010).

A closer examination of Twitter, the Internet, and the political engagement of African American groups show a promising trend for Black civic incorporation and an effect on public policy. The Pew Center reports that Twitter and other social networking sites (SNS) are becoming a key part of political interaction with 34 percent of Black SNS users accessing sites for political purposes (Smith, 2011; Zickuhr & Smith, 2012). Thirty-six percent of Twitter users who followed individual public officials did so primarily because it helps them feel more personally connected to the candidates or groups; an additional 35 percent cited this as a “minor” reason for following officials (Smith, 2011). When African American attitudes about online access to government were examined, Smith (2010) found that 41 percent of African Americans agreed that engagement using online tools makes government more accessible, while 53 percent agreed that online engagement helps people be more informed about what the government is doing. Blacks are also much more likely than Whites to report that it is “very important” for government agencies to use sites such as Twitter (Smith, 2010). Importantly, two-thirds of people who follow public officials online report that they pay attention to most (26%) or some (40%) of the material posted (Smith, 2011). Smith (2010) opined that these attitudes and the availability of online tools may offer government agencies and officials the ability to communicate with and mobilize underserved populations in a way that is not currently occurring.
with other online offerings. Byrne (2008), however, found that political action and engagement was not the predictable outcome for African American SNS users, however the presence of an accepted community leader may facilitate offline action through online networking.

**Methods**

**Research Question**

Cory Booker uses Social Networking Sites (SNS) as a powerful engagement tool to support and promote a deracialized leadership style in Newark; this approach may be highlighted as an important technological engagement model for majority-minority cities in the United States. SNS, particularly Twitter, allows Booker to (a) engage constituents who have been detached from Newark civic and political life, despite a history of Black leadership, (b) overcome the challenges a deracialized Black leader faces in a community where the majority of residents is comprised of minorities and in a majority-minority city deeply damaged by a legacy of racism and political regime politics, (c) battle the long-term and demoralizing problems such as violent crime and poverty, and (d) promote the city to a larger national audience.

Using a civic engagement framework created by Leighninger and Mann (2011), the primary purpose of this project was to explore the primary themes of Booker’s Twitter messages over a 31-day period. A secondary goal of this project was to conduct a cursory exploration of whether Booker’s Twitter communications and policies increased voter turnout and decreased crime over time.

An examination of election return data from 1986 through 2010 was conducted to discover whether Booker’s leadership style has contributed to a more participatory electorate when compared to his predecessor, Sharp James. Additionally, data from the New Jersey state Uniform Crime Statistics were used to determine whether changes in Booker’s crime policy have impacted the historically dominant problem in Newark.

**Twitter Analyses**

**Twitter and Engagement Infrastructure Framework**

In the context of a high-density urban area, like Newark, evolving attitudes towards online engagement and communication through Twitter, coupled with lower cost cell phone access, may serve to mitigate digital inequality and to create a substantive means of mobilizing and engaging lower socioeconomic African American group support for Booker’s administration, policies, and future candidacies. Rainie and colleagues (2011) found that constituents who believed they received good information from their government and who believed that their engagement impacted their community are more likely to be satisfied with their government and to engage in civic activities.

A review of Booker’s Twitter communications over a 31-day sample period demonstrates his use of diverse political engagement methods including mapping networks, coalition building, and connecting with and attracting constituents in an effort to create a cohesive online and offline engagement network (Leighninger, 2011). Booker’s Twitter communications were categorized using Leighninger & Mann’s (2011) four designations:

1. **Mapping Networks**: These communications include circulating information, educating citizens, discussing issues, and connecting with constituents. Some examples of Booker’s use of mapping networks with citizens on Twitter include posting information about non-political events in Newark and transmitting almost daily inspirational messages.

2. **Coalition Building**: These communications focus on dispensing information to build a stronger sense of community. Booker’s Twitter communications accomplish this through
recognition of his or an agency’s performance. He also frequently notes his support of his “Let’s Move” challenge, which encourages Newarkers to exercise in support of First Lady Michelle Obama’s “Let’s Move” initiative (General Mills, 2011).

3. **Reaching Out to Constituents**: Deliberating and recommending information to develop smarter, more widely supported policies and to create an environment for marginalized voices to be heard. Booker responds to direct service requests, and shares information about public engagement, involvement opportunities, and political events.

4. **Attracting Constituents**: Deciding and acting on issues with constituent support for specific programs and policies. Examples of Booker’s ability to attract constituents by using Twitter are signified by his support for political and social programs and civic movements.

As illustrated in Table 2, findings from this review indicate that Booker most often engaged in two identified designations, Mapping Networks and Reaching Out, in the 31-day period under examination, with 111 and 120 postings respectively. He also posted 90 Coalition Building messages and 77 Attracting Constituent messages. This is consistent with Marschall and Ruhill’s (2007) suggestion that Black leadership in majority-minority cities must move beyond symbolic influence to improve local services, like police, in substantive ways. Booker often sent Twitter messages that support police initiatives and responded to constituent criticism and support. An example of Booker’s goal of “attracting constituents” and defending quality of life initiatives, while also promoting government transparency, occurred on November 4, 2011 with this exchange:

@tweet2zone: Police raised the amount of guns found along with the amount of innocent people harassed in their game of “let’s get lucky”!
@CoryBooker: If u know that 2 b true PLEASE file a complaint. If u don’t trust us PLEASE go 2 the Dept of Justice who is investigating dept (Booker, 2011)

Twitter is a valuable tool for Booker to promote the feeling among African American and non-African American lower socioeconomic groups that he responds to constituent needs for services and resources, counteracting the belief that resources are less available to them in a competitive socio-political atmosphere (Spence et al., 2009). A common theme in many of Booker’s “reaching out” Twitter interactions is the call from citizens for action for a specific service followed by Booker’s individualized response. During a surprise snow storm and power outage on October 29, 2011 Booker fielded many requests for service needs, exemplified by this exchange:

@CoryBooker: I’ve got police heading out there RT @ossycocotasso: No lights r working on McCarter highway from 3rd ave to bridge st. It’s really dangerous (Booker, 2011)

Booker also uses Twitter to mobilize constituents to offline political engagement as a way to neutralize the threat of individuation and fragmented political action that Fenton and Barassi (2011) cite as a possible outcome of online political participation. In these exchanges from November 8, 2011 Booker exhibits traditional “get out the vote” mobilization techniques and “coalition building”:

INQUIRY, Volume 14
@CoryBooker: I just voted . . . please don’t forget to vote. Democracy is not a spectator sport.
@CoryBooker: Less than one hour left to vote . . . This election will shape many of the critical issues facing our community. Step up and have your say.
@CoryBooker: 2 lose faith in democracy is 2 pave the way for extremism RT @kathykattenburg I don’t have ur faith in power of elections to change anything (Booker, 2011)

Another common use of Twitter communications are Booker’s almost daily inspirational messages. He uses these as a “network mapping” technique to connect with and inform constituents, promote hope and trust in his leadership, and address wider constituent groups (Canon et al., 1996). A sample of Booker’s inspirational messages includes the following:

@CoryBooker: “History, despite its wrenching pain, cannot be unlived, but if faced with courage, need not be lived again.” Maya Angelou
Tweeted November 5, 2011
@CoryBooker: “Once you choose hope, anything’s possible.” Christopher Reeve
Tweeted on November 4, 2011
@CoryBooker: “It is not because things are difficult that we do not dare, it is because we do not dare that things are difficult.” Seneca
Tweeted on November 1, 2011
@CoryBooker: “On the other side of frustration, exhaustion & discouragement is breakthrough, accomplishment & triumph. Don’t give up!”
Tweeted on October 27, 2011

INQUIRY, Volume 14
Table 2. Analysis of Twitter Messages Posted by Mayor Cory Booker (10/25/11 – 11/25/11) [N= 398]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of Posted Message</th>
<th>Mapping Networks</th>
<th>Coalition Building</th>
<th>Reaching Out</th>
<th>Attracting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10/25/11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/26/11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/27/11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/28/11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/29/11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/30/11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10/31/11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/1/11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/2/11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/3/11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/4/11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/5/11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/6/11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/8/11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/9/11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/10/11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/12/11</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/13/11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/14/11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/15/11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/16/11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/17/11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/18/11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/19/11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/20/11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/21/11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/22/11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/23/11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/24/11</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/25/11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

Cory Booker arrived in Newark in 1995 as a young outsider with a universalized view of the world and of political leadership. Utilizing a deracialized campaign and leadership style, he challenged Sharpe James’ long-term Black political machine and was eventually successful in becoming mayor of Newark. During his tenure as mayor, Booker has confronted the same racial tensions, neglect, corruption and excessive crime rates that have kept Newark in an economic and social vacuum; this outcome is despite the otherwise significant advantages of being in close
proximity to New York City, which has a strong transportation infrastructure that could attract many opportunities for Newark.

Realizing the need to reach all of Newark’s citizens to help reclaim Newark as a relevant municipal force, Booker uses Twitter as a tool to spread his political message, provide needed information and services, and promote group identity within Newark. In doing so, he practices a deracialized leadership style that markets Newark, while maintaining a focus on issues relevant to the majority African American community, and Newark at large.

Within Newark, however, his success is less apparent. While Booker is able to utilize Twitter to successfully communicate with his constituents in a way that addresses many of the historically difficult issues within Newark, he has not been able to translate this form of communication into the direct citizen engagement that is required to bring significant change to Newark. This suggests that while Twitter and other SNS outlets may have the power to reach constituents in majority-minority cities, they cannot be the only avenues that a deracialized Black leader utilizes to promote trust and engagement.
POLITICAL SCIENCE: Marisol McNair

References


INQUIRY, Volume 14


ANTHROPOLOGY: Lindsay Newby

REPRESENTATIONS OF ARGENTINE NATIONAL IDENTITY VIA EL MUSEO NACIONAL DE BELLAS ARTES

By Lindsay Newby
Department of Anthropology

Faculty Mentor: Dr. Kirstin Erickson
Department of Anthropology

Abstract

National identity is a concept that every nation constructs and celebrates through the remembrance of important events or persons, the projection of literary works, and the erection of monuments. Yet, in order to truly understand a nation’s self-imagery, one must examine and chart all of its different periods through time. This allows one to avoid narrow, static definitions by viewing a nation in a more holistic sense. In this study, it is hypothesized that museums function to preserve, assert, and disseminate a sense of heritage and, in the case of the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes, a sense of what being Argentinean has historically meant and currently signifies during a time of change and uncertainty. Museums accomplish this through schematically grouping their works by time period, artist, and subject material. This arrangement conveys an impression of Argentinean history, the attitudes and values of its citizenry, and its cultural traditions.

Introduction

Most study-abroad programs are specifically designed so that students have ample time to travel and acclimate to a new environment. As a study abroad student in Argentina, I took advantage of this freedom, spending much of my time exploring the city of Buenos Aires. My lodging was centrally located in La Recoleta, a wealthy neighborhood that is also the home of many cultural centers, ferias (outdoor markets), plazas, cafes, and museums. La Recoleta is also in close proximity to what is known as the Milla de Museos (the mile of museums). Stretching along one of the city’s busiest highways, and ironically the city’s most frequented running and biking trail, this mile contained more than ten museums dedicated to transportation, fashion, indigenous art, modern art, and national art. Many foreigners are intrigued by all that is defined as “Argentinean”; one way to absorb the culture is to spend time perusing its museums, learning Argentine history and myth, identifying its famous figures and reliving its historic events.

The museum that will be described in this paper, El Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes (The National Museum of Fine Arts), is shown in Figure 1. This is Argentina’s first art museum, inaugurated on December 25, 1896. It has been relocated twice since then to its current location in a plaza on the edge of La Recoleta and Palermo, another wealthy neighborhood, which together comprise the area of the city known as Barrio Norte. There are three permanent exhibits at the museum. On the main floor there is an exhibit dedicated to European art from the Middle Ages to the 20th century that is considered to be the most important collection of European art in South America. The other two permanent exhibits are dedicated to 19th and 20th century Argentine art; they include works by foreign painters who visited Argentina during this era. At the time of my visit, there was also a temporary exhibition space that housed a collection for the nation’s bicentennial.

INQUIRY, Volume 14
Interestingly, the façade of El Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes is pink; this is worth noting since, in Buenos Aires, the only neighborhoods where bright colors are common are the southernmost areas of La Boca and San Telmo; in the microcenter and Barrio Norte (including La Recoleta), colors are much more subdued.

La Casa Rosada (The Pink House), shown in Figure 2, is the first site to which tourists are directed upon their arrival in Buenos Aires. It is the seat of the Argentine government located in the center of the city, overlooking the port that gave the nation its wealth. The entire city radiates out from this landmark site. It does not appear to be a coincidence that the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes mimics this design as an affiliation with the symbol of the nation. The concept of national identity is a matter that every nation must actively construct. Whether through holidays in remembrance of important events or persons, the projection of certain literary works, or the erection of monuments, every nation consciously lays down a framework through which its citizens envision themselves as part of something larger (Ben-Amos & Weissberg, 1999).

**Background**

Throughout this paper, we examine the following four sections of the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes: 19th and 20th century Argentine Art, Arte Rioplatense, Arte Europeo, and the temporary exhibit Bicentenario: Imagenes Paraleles (Bicentennial: Parallel Images). This exploration investigates the ways in which the pieces in the museum, and the coinciding descriptions of those pieces, attempt to create an “official” or “authentic” history of the nation. In an attempt to describe how nations share their history, Dan Ben-Amos and Liliane Weissberg state:

Since the late eighteenth century, the political demands on memory have been particularly strong. The invention of nation-states called for a common past as well as a common future. Monuments urged the individual to remember, but to remember and define each individual as a member of a larger group. Museums were constructed as national museums and opened to the public as institutions representative of a shared past (1999, p. 12-13).
Museums are crucial to the understanding of national identity in that they contain material culture that represents the past for those living in the present. However, as Pierre Nora (1989) asserts, there are many differences between memory and history. History is a reconstruction and reconstructions are always problematic and incomplete. In other words, history is an attempt to conceive the relative, to find patterns, to make connections, to analyze and criticize. Throughout the detailed case study of the history of France, Pierre Nora explains that “each historian was convinced that his task consisted in establishing a more positive, all encompassing, and explicative memory” (p. 10). This memory then needs to be presented and dispersed, hence “sites of memory”, or “the embodiment of memory in certain sites” (p. 7). The fact is that because we no longer live in “real environments of memory,” according to Nora, we must invent them. Hence monuments and museums are constructed. “Lieux de memoire originate with the sense that there is no spontaneous memory, that we must deliberately create archives, maintain anniversaries, organize celebrations, pronounce eulogies, and notarize bills because such activities no longer occur naturally” (p. 12). National museums fit neatly into this schema because “Memory attaches itself to sites, whereas history attaches itself to events” (p. 22). The Museo Nacional is just such a site of memory. So while museums function to preserve, assert, and disseminate a sense of heritage and, in the case of the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes, a sense of what being Argentinean has meant throughout the years and what it currently means, we must always remember the necessary flaws that are inherent in this type of facility.

Another case study regarding this problematic dichotomy comes from anthropologist Richard Flores (2002), who explores how the Alamo’s transformation into an American cultural icon helped to shape social, economic, and political relations between Anglo and Mexican Texans from the late 19th to the mid-20th centuries. Transformations of this sort that involve the “remembrance” of events, time periods, and persons also involve the active process of erasure of certain truths. Representations, especially those within various genres of public and popular culture, are always “entangled with official historical discourses” (p. 8). This transformative process, in the case of the Alamo, signified “a radical difference between ‘Anglos’ and ‘Mexicans’ so as to cognize and codify the social relations circulating at the beginning of the twentieth century” (p. 10). Throughout this paper I will demonstrate how the representational practices at El Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes participate in a similar transformation and constitution of Argentinean national identity.

However, first we must determine why museums should be studied as a reflection of national identity. James Clifford (1997), academic historian and critic, suggests that “museums express the interests of nation-states. Wherever local custom, tradition, art (elite or popular), history, science, and technology are collected and displayed -- for purposes of prestige, political mobilization, commemoration, tourism, or education -- museums and museum-like institutions can be expected to emerge” (p. 216). So what caused the emergence of the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes in 1896, and why has it continued to be a prominent museum for the last 106 years? In 1896 Argentina still held its status as one of the ten wealthiest nations in the world. Economically, the nation’s peers were Switzerland, Belgium, Britain, and four former English colonies including the United States (Glaeser, 2009). Buenos Aires came to be known affectionately as “the Paris of the Americas” and the population reveled in that image. City planners fostered that image through broad avenues, public architecture, and by encouraging the developing café culture. They also looked to their European peers for cultural trends.

In 1753 the first national public museum, the British Museum, was founded in London. France followed suit several years later with the Louvre and other European nations joined in as
ANTHROPOLOGY: Lindsay Newby

well. Argentina embraced this practice and built its own national museum, not to mention several theatres and opera houses that also stemmed from European tradition. The museum’s original home was on The Bon Marché on the Calle Florida. Built in the style of its namesake in Paris, it was situated in the elite neighborhoods of the city. In 1910, the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes relocated to the Plaza San Martin, in the center of town, and was housed within a palace made of iron and glass that had served as the Argentine Pavilion at the 1889 Universal Exhibition in Paris and which had been shipped back to Buenos Aires after the Exhibition’s conclusion.

International exhibitions were precursors for museum exhibitions beginning in the mid-1800’s. Stemming from a history of trade fairs and industrial exhibits, world’s fairs were an extension and exaggeration of this concept. Barbara Kirshenblatt-Gimblett explains the importance of world’s fairs as follows:

> In spectacular exhibition halls, the nations of the world compared themselves, competed for preeminence, and projected a utopian future built on the machine, international trade, and world peace. Whole cities were built to accommodate these fairs, and millions of people attended them. Coming as they did with the growing military and economic power of modern nation-states, the consolidation of large colonial empires, the mass migration of populations, and the rapid rise of industrialization, world’s fairs offer for analysis a virtual phantasmagoria of ‘imagined communities’ and invented traditions. (1998, p. 79)

The fact that the national museum was moved from its original location into the same exhibition structure used to represent Argentina at the 1889 Universal Exhibition in Paris is not a coincidence. Argentina was actively constructing the idea of the “national” for not only the world, but for itself as well. From the origination of the museum’s concept to its physical relocation within Argentina’s capital city, the “national” museum proved to be strongly influenced by European traditions.

Yet while this museum actively seeks to define the contours of Argentina’s identity, the first exhibit consists of a European Art collection. This seems somewhat remarkable, particularly considering that Argentina had fought a war for independence from Spain and European influence beginning in 1810. Thus, it begs the question as to why the museum curators have chosen to display the pieces of European art ahead of the pieces chosen to represent Argentinean art. As one response, it is important to note that Buenos Aires, from its foundation, has been tied inextricably to Europe; while it enjoys autonomy from its European colonial rulers, the city still defines itself as “European.” Travel writers, tourists, and citizens alike still make reference to the “European feel” that the city’s planners originally cultivated. Indeed, current population demographics indicate that more than 86% of the immigrant descendants self-identify as having European descent; in addition, approximately 60% of Argentineans declare some degree of Italian descent (Simon, 2011).

In terms of immigration, Article 25 of Argentina’s 1853 Constitution indicates that the “Federal government will encourage European immigration” (Georgetown University, 2008). Aline Helg (1990) argues that Argentina’s immigration policy was a result of the scientific racism of the period that disregarded the racial heterogeneity that characterized the society in favor of closer connections to Europe. For Argentina, this was amplified by indigenous genocide campaigns of the 1870’s and 1880’s and the pre-existing racial blending of the black community with Spaniards during the colonial period; as a result, today the population defines itself as overwhelmingly white.
A policy whereby Argentina explicitly and intentionally ‘whitened’ their society and whereby city planners created a ‘European’ layout was encouraged and upheld by Juan Bautista Alberdi (1886) and Domingo Faustino Sarmiento, two prominent Argentine writers of the day who agreed that for economic and cultural reasons, Europe was the ‘ideal’. Alberdi (1886) supports his racist ideas when he writes, “even if one makes the “gauchito and the chola, fundamental share of our popular masses, go through the transformation of the best education system; not even in a hundred years will you get an English worker” (p. 128). In regard to the Argentine populace, Sarmiento (1884) noted: “how many years, if not centuries, will it take to lift up those degraded spirits to the level of cultivated men?” (p. 76). Using the example of the United States, Sarmiento (1845) asserted that not only was European immigration necessary but Northern Anglo-Saxon Europe immigration was required (p. 64). While immigration exclusively from Northern Europe was not the result, as demonstrated by the demographic statistics of the percentage of Spanish and Italian descendants from Southern Europe, it is important to realize that the general European preference promoted by these key literary figures prevails even today. For instance, many Argentinians are fascinated by light skin and hair and utilize any method necessary to achieve this look. In addition to the people themselves, one of the main reasons why Argentina has a European ambience is because the city plan was originally and purposefully constructed to lend that ambience.

Thus, the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes’ affiliation with Europe as the first projected concept of the ‘national’ Argentine identity is supported by the history of its racist policies and practices. Yet, why then was the museums’ temporary exhibition devoted to images of the Bicentenario, the 200-year anniversary of the country’s declaration of independence from Spain? Homi Bhabha offers an explanation for this: “More valuable by far than common customs posts and frontiers conforming to strategic ideas is the fact of sharing, in the past, a glorious heritage and regrets, and of having, in the future, a [shared] programme to put into effect, or the fact of having suffered, enjoyed, and hoped together” (1990, p. 19). Therefore, proclaiming the importance of the Bicentenario and the event that it commemorates is not contradictory to the nation’s European heritage; rather, it is a reminder of the time since that event by which the nation has alternately thrived and survived.

The Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes is arranged so that visitors progress sequentially through Argentine history. In reference to the founding of Buenos Aires by European colonists in 1536 and then again, permanently in 1580, the main floor consists of the works on European art and the temporary exhibition space. The second floor consists of 19th and 20th century Argentine art and the uppermost third floor is dedicated to modern art. The process of creating a sequential passage through space is an attempt to place objects within a narrative of the historical formation of Argentina and its cultural identity. The pieces contained within those sections are a representation of the national heritage concept and demonstrate how it has evolved over time. In order to comprehend Argentine national identity, it is necessary to first realize that this narrative has already been created for the museum visitor and that the visitor is experiencing the representation of this constructed history. As James Clifford (1997) asserts:

…from their emergence as public institutions in nineteenth-century Europe, museums have been useful for polities gathering and valuing an ‘us.’ This articulation…collects, celebrates, memorializes, values, and sells (directly and indirectly) a way of life. In the process of maintaining an imagined community, it also confronts ‘others’ and excludes the ‘inauthentic.’ (p. 218)
The visitor, therefore, must not accept everything presented as absolute truth or fact. The history presented within a museum has been subjectively chosen by its curators and community to assert its specific interpretation of events. For the purpose of this discussion, pieces from each section that are representative of the major themes are examined and evaluated for their contribution to the construction of Argentina’s national identity.

19th and 20th Century Argentine Art

In order to reach the collections of Argentinean art one must ascend several flights of stairs to the second and third floors. The dim atmosphere that serves to preserve the works, as well as the guards stationed every 20 or so feet, foster a heightened sense of awareness and anticipation. Upon entering, the first images consist of battle scenes from Argentina’s war with Paraguay and the subsequent war for independence from Spain - soldiers dressed in uniform, horses poised to charge, and flags raised high in the air – are represented. Other images that emerge include churches in the traditional European style, scenes from the Buenos Aires port (key to the level of trade that allowed Argentina to flourish economically into the twentieth century), an overview of the layout of the city, and several landscape paintings.

The first overarching theme that emerges from these rooms is that nearly every work displayed was created by a European painter who immigrated to Buenos Aires from Italy, France, Brazil, and Scotland. Why is this important? Native citizens of foreign countries who immigrate to a new land arrive with a sense of identity already in place and consequently, they see new lands within the context of what they already know. Immigrants inherently view their new location differently than natives. Hence, their ideas regarding the culture or specific events must be viewed in light of their unique perspectives.

In order to clearly understand this distinction, I have selected the painting Sin Pan y Sin Trabajo by Ernesto de la Cárcova as representative of the works displayed by immigrant artists which paints an image of dismay. The scene depicted in this work is a result of the conditions endured by immigrants. They arrived expecting an immediate increase in their standard of living; however, they were directed upon arrival to shanty-town immigrant communities just outside the port area. They then had to compete with the other thousands of new immigrants for the job opportunities that existed; the positions that they found included scant pay and long working hours (Simon, 2011). While the economic situation was certainly not hopeless, it was a disillusioning time for many immigrants. With an influx of immigrants also came profound changes in Argentina’s economic and social situation.

The colors, shadows, postures, and subject material of Sin Pan y Sin Trabajo (FADU-UBA, 2010a) appear in many of the other pieces completed by immigrant artists during this period. As you will see, while immigrant artists may have had the cultural capital necessary to join the elite class, they also conveyed a sense of solidarity with others from their home countries who were not as fortunate in their new land.

There are only three paintings completed by native Argentinean artists within the section on 19th century art. All three reflect some aspect of the gaucho (cattle herder) tradition which was so prominent at this time. Gauchos originally hunted the large herds of escaped cattle and horses that roamed freely, bred prodigiously, and remained free from predators on the extensive pampa plains when Dutch, French, Portuguese, and British traders cultivated a profitable contraband business for hides and tallow. The contraband business proved to be less profitable than selling the beef legitimately; as a result, private owners bought the land, built estancias (estates), and then hired the gauchos to drive the cattle onto their property. Through their efforts gauchos became known not only for their skills at animal handling but also for their more
impressive knife skills. In the epic Argentine poem *Martin Fierro* suggests that disputes were typically settled by a knife fight to the death (Hernandez, 1872). Due to their skills and renowned rough nature of the gauchos, when the government needed soldiers to fight in wars, such as the War of Independence from Spain (1810-1816) or the War of the Triple Alliance against Paraguay (1864-1870), it insisted upon recruiting gauchos. Through this service, most gauchos were killed, leaving behind only the stories of their skills that have earned them the image of folk-heroes. Today, ranch-hands continue to dress in the traditional style of the gauchos and play the guitar for visitors while performing the doggerel verses that the gauchos once sang about their prowess at hunting, fighting, and lovemaking.

The painting *Un Alto en el Campo* (A Stop in the Countryside) by Prilidiano Pueyrredón (1861), is representative of the main themes of these three gaucho pieces. This painting transports the viewer into the *pampa* region, where vast *estancias* (ranches) that account for the renowned Argentinean beef can be found. In the foreground the gauchos (in their traditional dress and wearing the knives for which they were so well known) appear on horseback. They are seen standing by women and drinking *mate* outside of a *pulpería* (outlying saloon or bar). Along the horizon are tiny specks, which represent the cattle. The colors of the painting are bright and vibrant, the culture of the gauchos clearly displayed through their dress and physical presence; their homeland is romantically depicted by the vast open sky and fields.

It is important to consider why representations of the 19th century between immigrant artists and Argentine artists lie in such stark contrast. James Clifford explains this phenomenon in his assertion that “when a community displays itself through spectacular collections and ceremonies, it constitutes an ‘inside’ and an ‘outside’” (1997, p. 218). For the purposes of 19th century art, Europeans and those descended from European bloodlines, also known as the *criollo* class, were considered the ‘inside’ of Argentine society. *Mestizos*, or persons of mixed European-Indigenous blood, were considered ‘outside’ Argentine society. These differences were also reflected in the spatial distribution of Buenos Aires at the time. For example, the inner part of the city and the northern sections belonged to the wealthy classes. Even today, households of modest means have been relegated to the southernmost sections of the city where poor immigrants previously resided. The ‘outside’ or ‘other’ during this time period consisted of the Argentineans themselves. Thus, the paintings completed by the immigrants artists depicted life within the city and the paintings completed by the native Argentinean artists depicted life in *el campo*, the region surrounding the city or *la pampa*, the region delegated to the gauchos.

**Arte Rioplatense**

Before discussing the section on *Arte Rioplatense*, it is important to understand the background of this title. In colonial times, Spain divided its territorial claims in South America into four viceregalities to gain more efficient control of transported materials and information. The modern nation of Argentina belonged to the Vice Royalty of Rio de la Plata; it also includes areas that today belong to Uruguay and Bolivia. During the war for independence, San Martin, the war hero from Argentina, joined Simon Bolivar, for whom Bolivia is now named, in driving out the Spanish. While there are some vast differences between these countries (for instance the high percentage of Bolivia’s population that claims indigenous heritage), some cultural aspects, especially those between Uruguay and Argentina, are very similar. *Rioplatense* refers to the conjecture of similar cultural traditions that resulted from the interconnectedness of this region. For instance, within this section, painters from Montevideo depicted the tango, Buenos Aires boulevards, wine, and *mate* (an herbal tea that is shared in social settings). This Argentine art is much more diverse than the 19th and 20th century Argentine art. While there are many images of
the tango, of café patrons drinking wine and *mate*, and of the city itself, there are also images of churches, crowds in the streets protesting, men fighting outside bars, interactions between neighbors, and daily consumptions like cigarettes and food. This artwork depicts the activities of the everyday person and the cadence of life as it was lived throughout the last two centuries of Argentina. The formality that characterized the artwork from 19th and 20th Century Argentina disappears and gives way to a casual, observational quality. Viewers feel as though they are looking at a snapshot of a moment in time without the fanfare that previously existed in the depictions of war scenes and in the portraits of city leaders.

These qualities are best represented through the following piece of artwork, *Fiesta de Disfraz* (The Masquerade Party), completed in 1913 by Rafael Barradas. The fashion, the outdoor atmosphere, and the wine in the hands of the revelers are characteristic of middle and upper-class Argentineans then and now. Fashion is important to Argentineans as they like to be well dressed at all times. What is commonly referred to as ‘business casual’ in the United States is the everyday norm in Argentina. The Center for Cross Cultural Studies provides the following dress code advice to study abroad students:

You’ll find that most Argentine people tend to dress up a little more than what you might be used to back home. You will see young men wearing jeans and t-shirts or soccer jerseys, but you’ll also see a lot of people in nice pants and dressy shoes. Women tend to wear very feminine clothing, even if they’re wearing jeans, and they don’t tend to wear sneakers. Most people get very dressed up to go out at night, and you will probably want to, as well. If you want to fit in a little better with your Argentine peers, don’t wear athletic-looking sweat suits or your pajamas. Nice, fitted clothing is what most people wear, and that is a sure way to blend in as best you can. (Center for Cross-Cultural Studies, 2012)

The prominent café culture of the city is the most obvious feature of the *Fiesta de Disfraz* painting. It is presumed that the persons in the foreground know one another; in the background there are throngs of people mingling alongside one another. This socialization is representative of Argentina; even runners, bikers, and roller bladers participate in group activities or as part of a club. As depicted in the bottle of wine on the center figures’ lap, the wine in Buenos Aires is plentiful; in fact, Argentina enjoys a reputation as one of the world’s top wine producing countries.

The contrasts in the style and origin of artists and artwork beg us to consider the question of authenticity. Who determines what is authentic? Can what is considered ‘authentic’ change over time? The sponsors and curators of the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes in some sense determine what ‘authentically’ represents the nation of Argentina. When examining the works they have selected to display, their notions of what is and what should be representative of Argentina become clear. First, they believe that the European influence within their nation is unavoidable and deeply ingrained. Hence, one begins the museum experience with European artwork, before proceeding to formal compositions and battle scenes in the European tradition, and then onto art that is representative of the daily atmosphere of Buenos Aires today. For an outsider with little knowledge of historical events, the habitual activities and mannerisms of the nation’s people, included in the 20th century Argentine art and Arte Rioplatense, are more applicable for understanding the Argentine sense of culture and heritage than are the representations of historical events. According to the specific sections of artwork, Argentinean culture includes large, boisterously loud families and friends, meals complemented with wine and *mate*, the sharing of a smoke break, the tradition of attending mass, and an obsession with...
the tango. Persons riding on the city’s *colectivos* (city buses) often make the sign of the cross when passing a church, wine is had with every meal, and the plazas around the city are constantly brimming with groups of people sharing *mate* or preparing for a *milonga* (gathering of tango dancers). While these traditions are representative of daily life in the 21st century, the formal portraits and battle scenes from 19th century Argentine art were accurate representations of life at that time.

When examining the construction of ‘authenticity’, it is first necessary to recognize that cultures and nations change and develop over time. In order to truly understand a nation, its history, heritage, culture, and people, one must examine all of its different periods through time. Take for instance the Argentina of the 1800s, before the period of mass immigration that occurred at the end of that century. Nineteenth-century Argentina was home to a predominantly Spanish population, and it did not have the reputation as a world economic power that it acquired through the arrival of the immigrants. This influx of immigrants also provided the Italian influence that is apparent in Argentina’s contemporary cultural life. Immigration is a part of Argentina’s history; it transformed the country’s heritage, culture and demographic composition. Just as immigration is a factor of change, so are changing technology, ideals, leadership, and international exchange. Nations are not static and therefore neither is authenticity. Authentic representations in one period may not be considered authentic representations of the next period; however it is important to note that this does not negate their importance. Thus, one cannot definitively assert “the culture of Argentina can be analyzed through x, y, and z”; rather, one should avoid narrow, static definitions and view a nation in a more holistic sense. After all, it is the combination of different experiences and responses throughout life that are used to determine our identities. *El Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes* has embraced this concept by showing the different aspects and attitudes of the nation through the different stages of Argentina’s history.

**Bicentenario: Parallel images (1810-2010)**

In 2010 the entire country of Argentina joined in celebrating the nation’s Bicentenario, the 200 year anniversary of the beginning of Argentina’s independence from Spain. As part of the Bicentenario many museums and cultural centers around the city of Buenos Aires featured exhibits that highlight the last 200 years of the nation’s history. The image that the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes chose to project during the Bicentennial celebration was an untitled photograph of blonde sisters, presumably twins (FADU-UBA, 2010b). The women are dressed in sky-blue bikinis and are seated underneath a broad, aged, yellow and white umbrella. One of the women is pregnant and the other is extremely physically fit; both gaze directly into the camera as though challenging the opinion of those observing them.

This photograph embodies the Bicentenario by depicting the birth of a new nation (the pregnant woman) and the nation that exists 200 years later (her sister), a nation that still shares many of the same features at its foundation, much in the same way that twins share distinctive features. It is an image that leaves little room for ambiguity. This particular photographic image representing the Bicentenario is representative of the overall theme of the exhibit. When Argentina officially declared independence from Spain in 1810, the fledgling nation was in a state of uncertainty. Who would assume power? How would the government be structured? What would become of Argentina’s status internationally for trade and politics? While the questions today may be different, the uncertainty that the nation was experiencing in that period is the same uncertainty that the nation is experiencing today. For after a major economic crisis and the fall of political dictatorships, the nation experiences uncertainty once more.
This uncertainty is the predominant feature on the pregnant twin’s face. Her forehead is wrinkled, her lips pursed, her eyebrows pushed together, with a gaze that is hard and questioning. What will come of this next stage of life? Her sister, while clearly more relaxed, has a softer version of those questioning features on her face as well. The umbrella is faded and stained while the women’s bathing suits, still brilliantly colorful, are clearly new. This is a reference to the potential that the nation holds. Despite its messy political history and economic downturn, Argentina still has hope that it will re-emerge as a major team member on the international scale.

Other images are not as easy to interpret. For instance, the image of naked sunbathers on a rooftop pool, an abstract representation of men going off to various forms of work, a tree that is encircled by a ring of flames, the transformation of a naked man into a cactus, a tango quartet composed of patients from the city’s mental hospital, or a futbol player shown in the foreground of a landscape that includes a Trojan horse and the Eye of London are much more open to interpretation.

Conclusion

Museums contextualize their pieces through classification or schematic arrangement. The Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes uses both of these methods to create the concept of the ‘national’. Its curators provide a logical historical timeline progression beginning with the colonizer in the form of European art. It moved from colony to country as displayed in the 19th and 20th century Argentine Art and Arte Rioplatense. The curators conclude the timeline with an overview of the last 200 years of Argentina as a nation, including the changes that have occurred and the challenges that remain. In doing this they also schematically grouped the paintings by time period, artist, and subject material. The journey through time that is created through the pieces of art conveys an impression of the history of Argentina, the attitudes and values of the country’s immigrants and citizens, and the cultural traditions that it values and upholds. The destination of this journey is defined as “collective self-understanding. The museum engaged in the task of imagining the nation must define its location, a responsibility that has repercussions beyond the journey within its walls” (Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, 1998, p. 139). This task of creating a site of memory (Nora, 1989) with which the Argentine people can affiliate makes the viewpoint of El Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes more ‘real’ to the visitor and more of an ‘experience’ rather than simply a physical visit, culminating in the transmission of an actual ‘felt understanding’ of Argentine citizenship.

To an Argentinean it is understood that not everything about the nation or its history can be included in the small space allocated for a museum. Yet for a foreign visitor, the images conveyed by the museum may shape a lasting impression of the nation. What is lacking in the Museo Nacional de Bellas Artes is also important to the identity of Argentina as a nation. The indigenous genocide campaign in the 1880’s by Julio Roca and the political dictatorships of the 1900’s are merely two examples of nation-defining moments that do not appear in the national museum. It hence becomes the responsibility of the museum visitor to contextualize the images presented within the larger context of the nation’s history, one that contains more than simply representative pieces within a designated space.
References


Abstract

Divergent thinking is a 21st century skill that allows individuals to create innovative ways to alleviate societal burdens by finding new solutions to old problems. However, creativity is often overlooked or ignored in the classroom environment because the rigid atmosphere of authority does not allow for the simultaneous use of multiple cognitive abilities. What can teachers do, or are they doing, to ensure that divergent thinking is fostered in their classrooms? Three surveys were administered to 32 elementary school teachers to determine if there is a disconnect between what teachers believe fosters creativity with actual practices within the classroom. Survey responses indicate that teachers' personal beliefs, knowledge of creativity, and teaching practices do not indicate that they are fostering creativity in their classes. While teachers would like to provide more lessons that promote divergent thinking and foster creativity, mandatory standardized testing limits their ability to implement these activities.

Introduction

The United States Department of Education consistently re-evaluates the educational standards that are expected of schools across the country (Fletcher, 2011). Zarillo (2012) suggests that trying to “keep up” in the world market requires highly intelligent individuals with enhanced divergent thinking skills. He further notes that creativity is a 21st century skill that needs to be taught and cultivated in public schools.

Divergent thinking skills are used to make sense of the things in our world that do not have simple explanations (Newton & Newton, 2010). All children are born with a yearning for knowledge through exploration and an evaluation of the world around them. Infants constantly use their senses to discover information about the objects in their surroundings (Woolfolk, 2009). This practice continues in elementary school as children gain information about their expanding environment; they use divergent thinking skills to make sense of the things in their community that do not have straightforward simple explanations (Newton & Newton, 2010). One way in which divergent thinking skills are developed is by having children create stories to explain phenomena that do not make sense to them.

Newton and Newton (2010) indicate while the enhancement of the creative process is ideally suited for elementary school children, some teachers (a) do not foster this kind of exploration for various reasons, or (b) do not have adequate time to engage in divergent thinking lessons. These researchers suggest that teachers who foster an appreciation for creativity and innovation and who receive administrative support for these activities can provide students with the cutting edge opportunities to enhance their future endeavors.
Definition of Terms

Creativity. Creativity is comprised of small or large successful steps into a new thought process or area of knowledge (Torrance, 1977). It is important to note that creativity is not equivalent to academic giftedness. Giftedness is an inborn quality or talent while creativity requires multiple innate cognitive abilities and personal characteristics, as well as the appropriate motivation and an enriching environment (Fletcher, 2011). Creativity leads to new ideas that solve problems in innovative ways to ease the demands of society and to help people take steps forward in any given knowledge area. A creative contribution is a decision that one makes when they have an idea that they believe will make a difference and be accepted by others (Newton & Newton, 2010). Divergent thinking is a skill needed for the development of creativity; the two terms are often used synonymously throughout this study because of this close relationship.

Teacher Perceptions. Teacher perceptions are defined as a professional educator’s view on an issue. Perceptions are also the difference between teachers’ beliefs about a topic and their actions in response to those beliefs. For example, teachers may believe that all questions are important, however they may not have time throughout the day to answer all of their students questions. This difference will demonstrate their perception, or understanding, of what is happening within their classroom (Newton & Newton, 2010).

Master of Arts in Teaching (M.A.T.) Liaison. University professors that work specifically within a local school to accompany and assist interns within that school are identified as M.A.T. Liaisons. They help interns and teachers connect what is being taught in the elementary schools with the curriculum at the University. In addition, M.A.T. Liaisons observe interns as they teach in the public schools.

21st Century Skills. The 21st century is a time of great technological growth; the skills needed to succeed are different than those needed in previous centuries. Today’s student needs a specific set of skills, including creativity, to be successful in the future career market (Fletcher, 2011). In other words, the world is rapidly changing and the educational system needs to be able to “keep up” with the changing demands in order to ensure success for students, their communities and for the nation. Twenty-first century skills include divergent thinking and problem solving, collaboration, adaptability, initiative, effective communication, accessing and analyzing information, and curiosity and imagination. These skills emphasize how students are learning, thinking, and working, not how well they can pass a content-based test (Zarillo, 2012).

Divergent Thinking. Divergent thinking is not a synonym for creativity; however divergent thinking is a thought process that lends itself to creative thought. This process allows people to think outside the norm and to create new solutions (Robinson, 2005). Divergent thinking is the process by which students arrive at unique and innovative ideas that do not necessarily correlate with the traditional teachings within the classroom. As a result, each individual student arrives at the correct answer or a new answer using an approach nonconforming to his or her peers (Robinson, 2005).

Google© Docs. Two out of three of the surveys in this study were administered through Google© Docs. Google provides a complimentary service to their customers that allows them to create forms and documents online and to share them with anyone who has access to the Internet. Google© Docs can be used to create and administer surveys for research via email.

Purpose of the Study

According to Newton and Newton (2010), today’s world requires more divergent thinking skills than have been needed in the past due to ever increasing technology, yet many educators do not alter their teaching plans to address the need to foster divergent thinking. In
addition, teachers do not always define creativity in the same manner as researchers; for example, teachers often view creativity in terms of writing and art, they do not perceive it as a process of thinking and processing information (Bolden, Harries, & Newton, 2010). Divergent thinking skills can be fostered in all content areas and in various ways throughout the school day, especially during the elementary years. Teachers often believe they foster creativity by allowing students to draw pictures and create projects on their own; in reality, creativity is a process that requires a great deal of attention to develop to its full potential (Newton & Newton, 2010).

The purpose of this research project was to examine (a) the ways in which teachers define creativity in the classroom, (b) teachers’ beliefs about the importance of creativity in the classroom, and (c) the ways in which activities in the classroom environment promote divergent thinking skills. Findings from this research project may help lead to an understanding of how these skills can be incorporated into classroom lesson plans.

**Review of Literature**

Creative thinking skills are important for success; for example, it is often creative people who make large advances toward the betterment of society such as Thomas Edison or the Wright Brothers (Newton & Newton, 2010). Learning tends to happen best in situational contexts; memorization of rote facts provide minimal achievement in a constantly advancing world (Woolfolk, 2009). Not establishing innovative skills at the elementary level can damage a child’s creative potential and hinder their success in future endeavors (Robinson, 2006). As a result, it is important for educators to ensure that divergent thinking skills are included in the curriculum.

Sternberg (2006) suggests that creative thinking is a combination of many skill sets that people can be creative in a wide variety of ways. According to Torrance (1977), creative thinking involves sensitivity to problems, fluency, flexibility, originality, elaboration, and redefinition abilities. All of these skills work together to create the creative thinking process in which a person finds a problem, produces a method to solve the problem, tests the possible solutions and redefines the situation with a new solution to the problem. This process follows a very natural pattern of tension reduction. In other words, the anxiety we feel when something is wrong drives a motivation, through tension, to find a solution. Ghysels (2009) suggests that while content knowledge is important in education and in life, it is not the only element required for success; people also need critical thinking and problem solving skills to reduce tension and to find success.

**Student Characteristics**

All children are born with a creative capacity and have the ability to use creative thinking skills long before they enter the traditional school system (Torrance, 1977). Children mature over time just as other physical and intellectual abilities develop throughout childhood; they are constantly finding new ways to accomplish tasks in their everyday life, as well as create stories and play environments to entertain themselves and others. Research has shown that the creative, imaginative abilities in childhood tend to achieve their peak when a child reaches approximately four years of age (Torrance, 1977). Thus, by the time children enter preschool a drastic drop in creativity is typically observed (Lau & Cheung, 2010). It was originally thought that the decrease had biological roots (Torrance, 1977); however contemporary research findings suggest that a cultural cause, such as pressure to conform, creates this decrease (Lau & Cheung, 2010). In other words, the school system may teach children to hide their creative abilities since these skills are often indirectly suppressed within or outside the classroom environment through monotonous routines and strict guidelines (Robinson, 2006). Westby (1995) suggests that educators often emphasize learning through direct instruction and acceptance of information as
fact in lieu of questioning. As a result, children’s ideas may be stifled either by a teacher’s direct or indirect disapproval or avoidance.

Learning preferences also favor creative thinking abilities. Creative learning methods include experimenting, questioning, testing, manipulating, and exploring (Torrance, 1977). Findings from the literature (Beghetto & Kaufman, 2013; Kim & VanTassel-Baska, 2010; Torrance, 1977) suggest that learning creatively through these and other strategies may increase academic achievement. In addition, educational progress can be hindered when students are forced to learn by authoritarian methods, rather than using creative methods that promote choice (Fletcher, 2011). Creative learning activities may also help educators diversify instruction and meet the needs of all students. In other words, allowing students to learn through exploration can lead to a much more meaningful educational experience (Fletcher, 2011).

Teacher Perceptions

A series of studies completed by Westby and Dawson (1995) examined the correlations between teachers’ opinions of students and student personality traits associated with creativity. Two studies were conducted in the series. In the first study a statistically significant positive correlation was found between the teachers’ identified least favorite student and the creative prototype; however there was no significant correlation between the teachers’ most favorite student and the creative prototype. Previous research by Feldhusen and Treffinger (1977) suggests that 95% of teachers agreed that class time should be spent on encouraging creativity. This paradox prompted the second stage of research in which teachers were asked to identify creative personality traits. The list compiled by the teachers as those characteristics considered creative drastically differed from previous scientific research conducted on creative traits and the creative prototype in the first study (Westby & Dawson, 1995). For example, when the teacher ratings of the most favorite and least favorite students were compared with the teacher’s own prototype, no correlation was found between the least favorite or most favorite student and the revised creative prototype (Westby & Dawson, 1995). Thus, it was concluded that creative traits do not influence a teacher’s opinions or beliefs about a student.

Researchers have found a disconnect between what teachers say they believe about creative thinking and what they do to promote creative thinking. In other words, teachers could be discouraging creativity because they find creative characteristics in children to be distracting and/or hard to manage (Fletcher, 2011). In addition, some researchers suggest that teachers may also limit creativity by developing a rigid classroom environment (Westby & Dawson, 1995).

Methods

Participants and Setting

The purpose of this study was to determine whether teacher perceptions of creativity match their practices within the classroom. A convenience sample of 32 elementary school teachers in Northwest Arkansas was included in this study. The five schools were chosen based on convenience and on the availability of a M.A.T. liaison to deliver the first round of surveys to the specific schools. To acquire an appropriate sample of 32 volunteers, at least 60 teachers were invited to participate in this study. The teachers who completed a survey were from various grade levels, and included teachers in the gifted, special education, and English as a Second Language (ESL) programs.

Variables

The survey instruments used for this study included questions about the daily practices and procedures in the classroom, teacher expectations and grading methods. Classroom practices and procedures included the location of materials in the classroom, student choices, and...
instructional methods. Grading and teacher expectations focused on what the teacher seeks in terms of student work and their participation in the classroom environment. The surveys were created by this researcher based on the review of the literature; the reliability and validity of the instruments is unknown.

**Data Collection Procedures**

Written permission was obtained from the gifted and talented coordinator for the public school system prior to the beginning of this project. To maintain confidentiality of the participants in the study, the letter of approval has not been included in this document. However, Appendix A provides an example of the letter that was signed to grant permission to initiate this research study. In addition, the University of Arkansas Institutional Review Board granted approval to conduct the research project (See Appendix B).

Participation in this survey series was voluntary, and informed consent (see Appendix C) was gained through the completion of the first survey. Each survey included approximately 20 items and was expected to take less than 15 minutes to complete. Respondents were informed that their individual responses would be aggregated with other responses to insure confidentiality; therefore, the results do not specifically identify any individual. M.A.T. liaisons were included in this study as a direct connection to respondents and as a way to distribute the first survey to a convenience sample of participants. The second and third surveys were sent to the teachers via electronic mail and administered on the teachers’ own time through the use of an online program called Google™ Docs. Each individual response was gathered and recorded into a set of aggregated data. The information gained from these surveys was used to analyze teacher perceptions of the teaching practices they use to foster creativity in their students.

**Instrument**

The research instrument used in this study included an integration of three surveys that were completed by participants in a consecutive manner. In other words, each survey was given to the participants upon completion of the previous survey. The researcher created each survey after conducting an extensive review of the research literature related to the activities and qualities that promote creative thinking. Surveys 1 and 2 each consisted of 22 activities/ideas in the areas of grading, classroom practices and procedures, and teacher expectations. The reliability and validity of the surveys is unknown. Each question was rated on a Likert-scale from 0-10. The respondents were asked to mark their degree of agreement with each statement by selecting a number between 0 (Never) and 10 (Always).

The first survey was designed to measure how often various activities occur within the classroom. There was an approximate even number of activities that helped and hindered creative thought included in the survey. The second survey was designed to measure which activities teachers perceived as fostering creativity. Survey 3 was designed to measure individual teacher beliefs about creativity in general, as well as with children present in the classroom. It used a combination of Likert-scale questions and short answer spaces to leave comments and notes.

**Procedure**

Survey 1 provided a list of classroom activities that promote and hinder creativity; teachers were instructed to rate the activities on a scale of 1-10 based on how often they perform the activities in their classroom. To gather participant email addresses for future surveys the M.A.T. liaisons distributed the first paper-based survey directly to the classroom teachers. The first survey was analyzed and results were drawn based on the ratings given to the creativity-promoting activities.
Surveys 2 and 3 were then delivered electronically through Google Docs to the email addresses provided by the respondents. It was decided that Google Docs would be used for the convenience of both the respondent and the researcher as technology plays an integral role in both positions. The surveys were sent in a timely manner and reminder emails were sent several days after the delivery of the surveys. Survey 2 used the same activities as the first survey however this time it instructed teachers to rate the activities based on their belief in its potential to foster creativity. The results from Survey 2 were compared to the results from Survey 1 to examine the relationship between the teacher’s beliefs about creative thinking and the amount of class time spent promoting creative thoughts and behaviors with their students.

Survey 3 incorporated items asking teachers to give their opinions and their beliefs on promoting creativity in their own classroom environments. This final survey provided feedback describing each respondent’s perception of creativity for their classroom based on the teacher’s beliefs and classroom practices.

**Results**

**Demographics**

All respondents were female; teachers were evenly distributed among kindergarten through 5th grades. However, the distribution of participants from each of the five schools was not evenly distributed, with the majority of the respondents employed at only two of the five identified schools. Figures 1 and 2 display demographic data for the sample.

![Figure 1](http://scholarworks.uark.edu/inquiry/vol14/iss1/1)

**Figure 1.** The percentage of respondents from each participating grade level.

![Figure 2](http://scholarworks.uark.edu/inquiry/vol14/iss1/1)

**Figure 2.** The percentage of respondents from each participating school.
Participation
Survey 1 was paper-based and delivered to the respondents by the M.A.T. liaisons. Thirty-two teachers responded to the first survey regarding how often various activities occur in their classroom (as seen in Figure 3). Survey 2 and 3 were delivered electronically through Google Docs; there was a 50% decrease in survey completion between Survey 1 and 2, with 16 completed responses in total. An additional 25% decrease was seen from Survey 2 to Survey 3, with 12 completed responses in total.

Figure 3. Frequency of participation for each survey administered.

Data Analysis
For data analysis purposes, the questions presented in Surveys 1 and 2 were divided into the following two dichotomous categories: (a) teaching activities that foster creativity and (b) teaching activities that do not foster creativity. The participants did not know which questions fell into each category and the questions were in a random order on the survey in an effort to minimize bias. The responses from all three surveys were separated into the following five categories: strongly disagree (0-1), disagree (2-3), neutral (4-6), agree (7-8), and strongly agree (9-10).

The results from the first survey are displayed in Tables 1 and 2. This survey examines whether or not each of the stated activities is occurring in the teachers’ classrooms on a regular basis. The frequency and percentage of responses that fell into each category are recorded as well as the mean response for each question. Table 1 examines the questions that foster creativity and Table 2 addresses the questions that do not foster creativity.
Table 1. Frequency and mean of activities that foster creativity in the classroom.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Q</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>6.71875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>8.21875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.0625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.46875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>5.84375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q10</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>8.71875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>6.96875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>9.91785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q16</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>6.8125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q17</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>7.9375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q18</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>8.21875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q20</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>6.90625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q21</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td>6.875</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: SA= Strongly Agree, A= Agree, N= Neutral, D= Disagree, SD= Strongly Disagree

1. I involve multiple senses in my lessons.
2. I relate the content material in my class to real-world experiences.
3. Grades in my class are mostly based on the student having the correct answer not the correct process.
5. Friendly competition takes place in my classroom.
7. I allow children to choose their own projects for demonstrating their knowledge.
10. My students are comfortable asking questions and making mistakes.
12. I use activities that require my students to create a solution or idea.
14. I respect the ideas of all the children present in my classroom.
16. I use ungraded assignments to allow my students to practice new material.
17. I use visualization as a technique in my classroom.
18. I encourage independent learning.
20. I provide activities that allow my students to think backwards to solve a problem.
21. I use brain teasers, word problems, and puzzles in my classroom.
Table 2. Frequency and mean of activities that do not foster creativity in the classroom.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0.84375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.21875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.15625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.6875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q13</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5.4375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q15</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5.375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q19</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8.4375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q22</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.03125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: SA= Strongly Agree, A= Agree, N= Neutral, D= Disagree, SD= Strongly Disagree

4. I keep my art materials (markers, glue, crayons, scissors, etc.) locked up and not available to the children.
6. I involve my students in a brainstorming process before starting a new project or concept.
8. I focus on topics in my classroom that the children already understand.
9. When grading student work I provide ample feedback along with the grade.
11. My students spend the majority of the day seated at their desks.
13. When I ask questions I am looking for the correct answer.
15. I show examples of someone else’s work before beginning a new project.
19. I teach multiple ways of finding a solution to a problem.
22. I praise neatness and consistency.

As highlighted in Table 1, of the 13 questions that examined classroom activities that foster creativity only five (38%) of the activities were frequently occurring in respondent classrooms. Questions 2, 10, 14, 17, and 18 had a mean score of 7 or higher (see Figure 4), demonstrating that the majority of teachers ranked this activity as agree or strongly agree. These five questions all involved instruction and teacher views of the student and their creative ideas.
Nine questions in this survey suggest activities that do not foster creative thinking; of these, four (44%) occurred often within the respondents’ classrooms. Questions 6, 9, 19, and 22 all received an average rating of 7 or higher as shown in Figure 5. A greater percentage of questions that provide examples of ways to not foster creativity received an average rating of 7 or higher, indicating that activities that do not foster creativity are just as prevalent, if not more prevalent, in the respondent classrooms.

Survey 2 asked teachers to rate the same statements as Survey 1 based on whether they believe the activities foster creativity in the classroom. The same categories for analyzing responses in Survey 1 were used for Survey 2. The results from Survey 2 are displayed in Tables 3 and 4. The frequency and percentage of responses that fell into each category are recorded as well as the mean score for each question. Table 3 examines the questions that do foster creativity and Table 4 addresses the questions that do not foster creativity.
Table 3. Frequency and mean of perceptions of activities that foster creativity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1 Percentage</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.4375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2 Percentage</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3 Percentage</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4 Percentage</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5 Percentage</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q7 Percentage</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.9375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q10 Percentage</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q12 Percentage</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.5625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q14 Percentage</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8.9375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q16 Percentage</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q17 Percentage</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q18 Percentage</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.5625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q20 Percentage</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6.8125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q21 Percentage</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: SA= Strongly Agree, A= Agree, N= Neutral, D= Disagree, SD= Strongly Disagree

1. Use of multiple senses in a lesson
2. Relating content material to real-world experiences
3. Basing grades on the correct answer not the correct process
4. Keeping art materials available at the student’s level throughout the day
5. Friendly competition
7. Providing multiple options for students to demonstrate their understanding of the material
10. Asking questions and making mistakes
12. Creating new ideas and solutions to problems
14. Respecting and rewarding the ideas of others, including children
16. Providing ungraded practice problems
17. Using a visualization technique
18. Encouraging independent learning
20. Using activities that make children think backwards to find the solution
21. Using brainteasers, word problems, and puzzles
Table 4. Frequency and mean of perceptions of activities that do not foster creativity.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.6875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.8125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.6875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q15</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5.6875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q19</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.9375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q22</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5.1875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: SA= Strongly Agree, A= Agree, N= Neutral, D= Disagree, SD= Strongly Disagree

6. Brainstorming before beginning a new project
8. Focusing on topics the children have previously learned or understand
9. Providing ample feedback along with a grade
11. Spending time doing seatwork
13. Asking questions with one specific answer in mind
15. Showing examples of previous work before starting a project
19. Teaching multiple ways to solve a problem
22. Praising neatness and consistency

Of the 14 questions that examine classroom activities that foster creativity, respondents believed that 11 of them (79%) did in fact foster creativity. Only questions 3, 5, and 20 had a mean score of less than 7 (see Figure 6), suggesting that the majority of teachers have accurate perceptions of creative activities. The three questions that did not have a high mean score all involved the instructional process and activities within the classroom such as friendly competition and thinking backwards.

Figure 6. Mean response for perceptions toward activities that foster creativity.

INQUIRY, Volume 14
Eight questions suggested activities that do not foster creative thinking; respondents rated three (38%) of them as fostering creativity with a mean score of 7 or higher. In other words, teachers believed that these three questions foster instead of hinder creativity. These included questions 6, 9, and 19 as shown in Figure 7.

![Figure 7](image.png)

*Figure 7.* Mean responses for perceptions of activities that do not foster creativity.

Survey 3 examined teacher perceptions of their own classrooms and their own teaching practices. The frequency and percentage of responses are shown in Table 5; the mean response is presented in Table 5 and in Figure 8. Questions 1 and 2 had a mean response of 7.167 and Questions 5 and 6 had a mean response above 8. A total of four out of the 6 questions (67%) resulted in average ratings of 7 or higher, demonstrating that teachers agree that they are fostering creativity in their own classrooms.

**Table 5.** Frequency and mean of teacher perceptions of their own classroom.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>SA</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q1 Percentage</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.166666667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q2 Percentage</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7.166666667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q3 Percentage</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6.416666667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q4 Percentage</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5.916666667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q5 Percentage</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8.833333333</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q6 Percentage</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8.416666667</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: SA= Strongly Agree, A= Agree, N= Neutral, D= Disagree, SD= Strongly Disagree

1. My classroom environment is one that fosters creativity
2. I provide opportunities for creative behavior
3. I plan activities for the purpose of fostering creativity
4. I consider myself creative
5. I reward ideas as well as answers
6. I believe that every one of my students is creative
Each question on Survey 3 provided space for teacher comments to enhance the researcher’s understanding of participant beliefs. Question 1 focused on the classroom environment being one that fosters creativity. As shown in Figure 9, half of the responses fell into the agree category on question 1. The comments for question 1 frequently mentioned creativity in writing and providing opportunities for choice.

Question 2 displayed a very similar distribution as question 1. For example, 50% of respondents agreed that they provided opportunities for creative behavior within their classroom activities (as seen in Figure 10). Respondents also indicated through their qualitative comments that writing was the easiest content area in which to integrate creative activities while science and social studies tend to have fewer opportunities due to the required curriculum.
Question 3, which asked teachers to reflect on whether they plan activities for the purpose of fostering creativity, received significantly more negative responses. The ratings given were neutral or below in 58% of the responses (as shown in Figure 11). Two out of five of the comments revealed that activities were planned for the purpose of teaching content and assessing knowledge. It was also mentioned by one respondent that many activities are required and that there is no choice in the planning process.

**Figure 11.** Percentage of respondents who believe they plan for the purpose of fostering creativity.

Two-thirds of respondents rated question 4 as neutral or below as shown in Figure 12, suggesting that 34% of respondents believe that they are creative. One of the respondent’s comments referred to hobbies that foster creativity while another comment referred to spontaneity and flexibility as creative traits.

**Figure 12.** Percentage of respondents who believe they are creative.

One-hundred percent of respondents agreed or strongly agreed with question 5 as seen in Figure 13. Thus, participants believe they value all ideas and processes as well as the final learning product. Comments on this question suggest that sometimes teachers simply seek ideas (or ideas that can be considered answers) even if they are not the correct responses.

**Figure 13.** Percentage of respondents who believe they reward ideas as well as answers.

INQUIRY, Volume 14
Question 6 also received very high ratings as shown in Figure 14; this suggests that 92% of the respondents believe that every one of their students is creative. Three comments revealed that teachers believe students are all creative but that each student displays their creativity in different ways.

![Figure 14. Percentage of respondents who believe all of their students are creative.](image)

In summary, the results indicate that while teachers are able to recognize creative activities, 79% of the time they are only putting 38% of creative activities into practice in their classrooms. Despite the low occurrence of creative activities in the classroom, 67% of respondents believe that their classroom is one that fosters creativity.

**Discussion**

Research findings from this project suggest that teachers in Northwest Arkansas perceive that creativity is important in the classroom; however, findings also suggest that teacher perceptions regarding creativity and classroom lesson plans/actions do not always align. In Survey 1 the responses indicate that creative teaching practices do not occur frequently in the classroom. In fact, activities that hinder creativity seem to occur more often than those that foster divergent thinking. Teachers identified many elements that hinder the amount of time that can be spent on creative thinking. For example, standardized testing, statewide curriculums, and school administrator mandates were identified as factors that play a role in how teachers can structure their instructional time. Based on the literature, teachers need to be able to integrate lessons involving divergent thinking into content learning goals in order to provide children with the 21st century skills they will need for future success (Newton & Newton, 2010; Zarillo, 2012).

Findings from Survey 2 suggest that teachers have a strong understanding of what activities foster creativity. Respondents were able to correctly identify creative activities on the survey 79% of the time. Turning to activities that do not foster creativity, respondents were in agreement 62% of the time. This research project aimed to examine whether a disconnect between knowledge and practice exists in the classroom. Findings indicate that while teachers do have knowledge about creativity and value its importance in the classroom, creative activities are not always applied in their classroom practices due to the previously identified barriers. Thus, there seems to be little instructional time spent intentionally pursuing divergent thinking in daily classroom lessons and routines.

Question 14 displayed the highest mean scores in both Surveys 1 and 2, demonstrating that teachers (a) respect the ideas of children, and (b) believe that ideas help foster their creativity. In other words, respondents seem to be aware that their attitude towards children’s thinking and their responses in the classroom have an impact on the way children will think in the future. Thus, fostering a positive relationship with students and keeping the level of respect high may make students more comfortable with exploring their thoughts and ideas within the classroom.
Question 3 received the lowest mean rating in both Surveys 1 and 2, displaying a misconception that teachers may hold. This question addresses the grading method whereby teachers grade only the correct answer and do not grade the process. The emphasis on correct answers could be from pressure from administrators (due to standardized testing) or simply due to traditional methods of teaching. Despite the reason, teachers seem to feel the need to grade for the correct answer. Teachers can rectify their usual grading method by using an analytic scoring tool, similar to a rubric, that allows them to grade student understanding of the task, the method the student used to complete the task, as well as the accuracy of the answer.

Question 22 also displayed interesting results. This question addressed whether teachers praise neatness and consistency, two concepts that do not generally foster creative thinking. The mean score regarding this question was 7 for Survey 1 and 5.2 for Survey 2. This finding indicates that teachers appear to be neutral toward the ability of neatness and consistency to foster creativity but often engage in praising neatness and consistency in the classroom. The respondents are correct in that neatness and consistency do not always lend themselves to creativity. Thinking creatively involves taking risks and experimenting with new tasks without being concerned with the outcomes or consistency of the results. Yet teachers tend to praise students who are neat because it makes grading and classroom management much easier. This can hinder the actions of the divergent thinker because their work often is more disorganized and chaotic as their thinking develops.

The responses to Survey 3 demonstrate that the majority (67%) of teachers believe they foster creativity in their classrooms; they also indicate that teachers see room for improvement. Question 4 asked teachers to report on their own level of creativity; the majority of teachers did not consider themselves to be creative. This question had a mean response of 5.9, which is much lower than the other questions on this survey. Results suggest that if teachers do not think that they are creative, it will likely be increasingly more difficult for them to create lessons to foster creative thinking and to teach the skills necessary for innovative thought.

There were also multiple comments by respondents regarding (a) the need to teach required activities and (b) being able to explore creativity only in writing and math. Because of the mandatory curriculum standards and the set activities for each grade level to teach to these standards, it is likely that teachers are not able to plan activities that will foster divergent thinking. One teacher noted that creativity never happens in her science and social studies curriculum; these subject areas could offer a wide variety of inquiry activities that require students to think innovatively and use their resources to arrive at an answer. Thus, it may be that due to individual and structural barriers, children are missing out on opportunities to develop their divergent thinking skills if they are not allowed to explore their beliefs about social issues, scientific findings, and current events.

Conclusion

In general, respondents understand that creativity is an important skill in today’s society and want to foster its growth in the classroom. However, they do not feel that they are doing everything they can in the classroom to foster these skills. Based on their responses, teachers generally foster creativity by respecting student ideas but not via planned activities in their classrooms. In addition, the strong focus on standardized testing and ensuring mastery of grade level content may create a barrier for students to create innovative solutions to problems within their own lives and within the classroom.
Limitations of this Research

Many factors need to be considered as the data from this research are interpreted. The first limitation is the sample size for this study, particularly for Survey 1 and 2. A larger sample size would create a more even distribution of demographics and responses, to gain more confidence in the results, and to provide for generalizability. Some barriers to obtaining a larger sample size included difficulty reaching administrators at various schools to obtain permission to contact their instructors to participate in the study. Changes were made to include an initial paper-based survey as one way to collect teacher emails. The level of involvement by specific M.A.T. liaisons may also have led to the majority of respondents being from particular schools.

Another limitation is the attrition rate in between surveys; when switching to electronic surveys 50% of all respondents dropped out of the research project. Thus, collecting data in three separate waves may have caused the convenience sample to be smaller than originally expected.

There have been no tests to ensure that the surveys used to administer this research are valid and reliable. Participation in the survey series was voluntary and based on self-reflection from each individual teacher within the school system. Thus, generalizations cannot be drawn to make conclusions about any one school or school district. Since no other data were collected outside of the survey measures we must consider possible bias when interpreting the results due to self-reports.

Implications

Results suggest that teachers have a strong understanding of creativity and its importance within the classroom; however it appears that some of the participants in this study may either hold misconceptions on the practices that foster creativity or experience structural barriers to implementing creative activities. Findings from this research study suggest that the emphasis on standardized testing and high scores may have redirected the focus from creative thinking skills to mastery of content. Teachers may benefit from practice and instruction on how to integrate both the content standards and creative thinking skills to ensure the most potential for the future success of their students. While this research demonstrates that respondents believe that creativity is an important skill for the future, they are unsure how to incorporate creativity into their classrooms, especially while maintaining success with the content standards and required activities provided by the curriculum.

Recommendations for Future Research

In future research studies on this topic, a larger more representative sample should be collected. Data should be collected from multiple schools, grade levels, and districts in a geographical area that might be used to generalize findings to a larger population. This sample only considers teachers in Northwest Arkansas; a larger sample including multiple regions could show a difference in beliefs by region or a more general consensus of creativity in the classroom.

Based on this data, there is no significant positive correlation between what teachers believe is creative and what creative activities they practice in their classrooms. It would be interesting to involve the use of case studies within particular classrooms or other observational data to supplement these findings. The responses to the surveys were based on self-reflection, therefore adding an observational element would provide an external perspective of what is happening in the classroom. Data could also be collected before and after teaching a lesson that fostered divergent thinking to examine how practicing this process may or may not increase student success.
If this same study were repeated, it may be advisable to include fewer questions in the individual surveys and/or to collect data at one point in time. The large amount of items on the survey may have caused the respondents to cease participation in the subsequent surveys due to completion time. Many respondents to Survey 3 did not provide any comments; perhaps fewer questions on the survey would have allowed more time to include detailed comments.

It would be interesting to gather data from administrators to examine their perceptions on creativity and to determine if they encourage their teachers to foster these skills. These surveys might also examine the amount of teacher training that is provided regarding creative practices and the unique ways to approach content instruction. The educational background of both the teachers and the administrators could also have a large impact on the data collected based on whether or not they have had any specific training for fostering creativity in the classroom.
References


Abstract

This pilot study created a comprehensive orientation module to help Midwives for Haiti prepare volunteers to serve in the organization’s midwifery school in Haiti. The module was evaluated to assess its perceived effectiveness and revise it to better fit volunteer needs. The volunteers completed the module prior to their trip to Haiti and then completed an evaluation survey upon return; only three volunteers completed the entire pilot study process. Two out of three responded that the orientation fully prepared them for their time abroad. Other comments included the need for (a) additional emphasis on basic math and drip rate calculations, (b) information on how to be a good preceptor for students, and (c) a follow-up test after orientation that identifies gaps in knowledge learned. The revised module will be used to prepare future volunteers; the organization plans to continue to improve the module as they receive more feedback.

Orientation for Increased Volunteer Effectiveness with Midwives for Haiti

Complications during pregnancy, childbirth, and early infancy claim the lives of millions of mothers and newborn infants across the globe each year (United Nations Children’s Fund, 2009). The primary causes of complications include a lack of access to maternal education, medical check-ups, and skilled birth attendants. The unfortunate fact is that death from these complications is largely preventable; even more disturbing is that maternal infant mortality is increasing over time. In a country with the highest maternal infant mortality rate in the world, one organization strives to create change from within. Functioning on the premise that “change can occur one person at a time, and through the efforts of small groups of people who believe it can”, the non-profit organization called Midwives for Haiti utilizes education as one tool to create lasting change. Midwives for Haiti is designed to empower the Haitian people through “genuine partnership with those who desire change”. The vision is simple: to increase the number of skilled birth attendants and, subsequently, to decrease maternal infant mortality rates in Haiti. This vision is accomplished through the education and certification of Haitian skilled birth attendants.

Midwives for Haiti operates not only through donations (as other non-profits most often do), but more significantly with the help of its volunteers. American and European health professionals trained in midwifery work alongside Haitian students as mentors and teachers, thereby greatly improving Haitian student education and training opportunities and making the vision of Midwives for Haiti a reality. Their greatest impact on the students arises not only from their instruction but also from modeling the attributes of a good caregiver.

An organization that depends so greatly upon volunteers requires a thorough orientation process. The comprehensive Midwives for Haiti volunteer orientation program provides vital
information to help volunteers overcome obstacles such as limited resources, cultural differences in patient care, substandard medical facilities, and lack of knowledge regarding volunteer roles.

The goal of this research study was to develop an online orientation module to aid Midwives for Haiti in preparing volunteers to be fully effective teachers, mentors, and participants in the vision of hope for the mothers and infants of Haiti. The results of the study have been and will continue to be used to modify the created module as a continuous quality improvement effort. The orientation module continues to be used by Midwives for Haiti to prepare subsequent teams of volunteers as they prepare for their work abroad with the organization.

**Literature Review**

**Introduction to Maternal and Infant Mortality**

Maternal infant mortality is a global health issue that has gained increased attention in recent years. Despite the increasing focus of world health initiatives on maternal newborn child health, the maternal infant mortality rates continue to increase. According to the World Health Organization (2005), more than 10 million children and 500,000 mothers die every year, mostly from preventable causes. Maternal deaths between ages 15-49 tend to be underreported in developing countries, thus the number of deaths may be much higher than estimated. Between 2000 and 2007, it was estimated that over 70 million mothers and their newborn infants died due to a lack of basic care related to maternal, newborn, and child health (Songane, 2007). The World Health Organization (WHO) notes that “Seventy million mothers and their newborn babies, as well as countless children, are excluded from the health care to which they are entitled [each year]” (Van Lerberghe, Manuel, Matthews, & Wolfheim, 2005).

The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), created in 2000 by 189 countries within the United Nations, emphasize the universal desire to improve the health of mothers and children across the world by the year 2015. The director-general of the World Health Organization, Lee Jong-Wook, articulated the importance of improving maternal and newborn child health across the globe when he stated: “Mothers, the newborn and children represent the well-being of a society and its potential for the future. Their health needs cannot be left unmet without harming the whole of society” (Van Lerberghe et al., 2005, p. 3). WHO Director-General Lee Jong-Wook emphasizes public responsibility for creating public health programs all over the world that work together to provide continuous care and universal access to care from pregnancy to childhood in order to meet the MCGs. In response, many countries have increased initiatives to provide adequate maternal and newborn child healthcare; however, for countries that have experienced economic, political, or natural disaster, progress is moving slowly or not at all. In response to the disparity between the initiatives of different countries, Van Lerbergh and colleagues note: “[...] placing maternal and newborn child health at the core of the drive for universal access provides a platform for building sustainable health systems where existing structures are weak or fragile. Even where the MDGs will not be fully achieved by 2015, moving towards universal access has the potential to transform the lives of millions for decades to come” (2005, p. 4).

One of the major problems in maternal and newborn child health globally and one of the leading factors of maternal and infant mortality stems from a lack of appropriate care at the time of birth. Of the 136 million births in the world annually, only a small percentage is attended by a trained healthcare provider. The problem is likely to increase in the near future as many nations’ populations, especially where childbirth is most dangerous, consist mostly of teenagers who will soon be entering their reproductive years (UNICEF, 1997; Pan American Health Organization,
Researchers (Van Lerberghe et al., 2005) with The World Health Organization recommend that “for optimum safety, every woman, without exception, needs professional skilled care when giving birth, in an appropriate environment that is close to where she lives and respects her birthing culture” (p. 6). The appropriate skilled professionals include midwives or other healthcare workers trained in midwifery, which the World Health Organization has termed skilled birth attendants. In order to reach this goal worldwide, an additional 334,000 midwives and skilled birth attendants need to be trained in the next 10 years.

Maternal and infant mortality in Haiti

The problems of maternal and newborn child health demonstrated by the global community as a whole are especially prevalent in Haiti, where the third leading cause of death among adults aged 20-59 is maternal mortality (Pan American Health Organization, 2009). Haiti is a country plagued by political, economic and social problems as well as natural disasters; these issues greatly affect the health of the country’s citizens. Politically, Haiti has been in a cycle of instability since an invasion by the Spaniards and French in 1492 and 1697, respectively. In 1804, almost one million slaves revolted to become the first black republic to declare independence. In 2004 an armed rebellion forced the resignation and exile of President Jean-Bertrand Aristide; since then an interim government under the United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti has been in place, and Haiti finally democratically elected a president and parliament in 2006 (Central Intelligence Agency, 2010). However, the instability of the political climate has spread to healthcare, leading to a currently weak system that is incapable of handling the strains of the Haitian community’s poor health.

One of the main social issues affecting Haitians is poverty. According to the Central Intelligence Agency (2010) and the Pan American Health Organization (2009), Haiti is the poorest country in the Western Hemisphere. For example, over 80% of the population has household incomes under the poverty line with 54% of individuals living in abject poverty. Most Haitians depend on agriculture as the primary source of income; this makes the country vulnerable to damage from natural disasters that occur frequently due to the country’s extensive deforestation. In addition, the 7.0 earthquake in January 2010 caused extreme difficulties not only economically, but also placed an intense strain on the already weak healthcare system. Difficulties finding clean water and a cholera outbreak provide just a few examples of the serious health issues brought about by the earthquake (Center for Disease Control and Prevention, 2010).

Haiti has the highest death rate in the world with 32.31 deaths (per 1,000) annually and an average life expectancy of 54.4 years (52.8 for men and 56 years for women). Primary causes of death for Haitian women include infectious diseases, cardiovascular illness, external causes such as accidents and injuries, and maternal causes respectively (Pan American Health Organization, 2009). Maternal mortality increased by 15% from 1995 to 2000 and is currently at a rate of 680 per 100,000 live births. The increase in maternal infant mortality in recent years may be the result of a myriad of social issues including low socioeconomic status, lack of access to medical health care prenatally and at the time of birth, limited resources for family planning, unavailability of clean water, and high rates of malnutrition (Prins, Kone, Nolan, & Thatte, 2008).

The infant mortality rate in Haiti is extremely high, with 77.26 deaths per 1,000 live births. Infant mortality rates are often used to demonstrate the health of a country; as such it places Haiti at the 18th highest infant mortality rate in the world (Central Intelligence Agency, 2010). It is important to note that since certification of deaths has not historically been a cultural norm in Haiti, these statistics represent only 10% of all deaths in this country. In fact, it was not
until 1997 that the Ministry of Public Health and Population and the Pan American Health Organization began promoting the certification of deaths for data collection purposes (Pan American Health Organization, 2009).

The number of pregnant women receiving care in Haiti is astonishing, with 79% receiving antenatal care only once before childbirth and 42% receiving antenatal care four or more times before childbirth. Teenage pregnancies account for over eight percent of the total births in Haiti; the number of teenage mother births per 1,000 in 2000 was 68.3, which is 31 percent above the regional average (Justesen & Verner, 2007, p. 26). Many Haitians (40%) are under 15 years old and will soon be entering their reproductive years, thereby increasing the need for midwives to attend births (Van Lerberghe et al., 2005; Pan American Health Organization, 2009).

Researchers at WHO suggest that in order to “achieve the full life-saving potential that [antenatal care] promises for women and babies, four visits providing essential evidence based interventions […] are required” (Lincetto, Mothenbesane-Ahoh, Gomez, & Munjanja, 2006, p. 51). Key aspects of antenatal care visits include the identification and management of complications or infections and education and encouragement regarding healthy practices such as breastfeeding and the need for a skilled birth attendant at birth. Yet only 29% of births are attended by skilled professionals in Haiti and only 18% of births occur in hospital facilities. The fact that 64% of the Haitian population lives in rural areas with limited access to healthcare plays a significant role in the number of births occurring in healthcare facilities.

**Midwives for Haiti – Organization**

Midwives for Haiti is a non-profit organization dedicated to increasing the number of skilled birth attendants in order to provide life-saving support, education, and care during pregnancy and childbirth. The mission, which is to educate Haitian midwives who will “provide prenatal care and skilled birth assistance to their fellow Haitian sisters”, embodies hope and change in a nation plagued by the highest infant and maternal mortality rate in the western hemisphere (Midwives for Haiti, 2010).

Midwives for Haiti was founded on the belief that “every woman in this world deserves the knowledge and care to have a safe pregnancy and birth”. The founding certified nurse-midwives emphasize that “even women who cannot read and write are teachable”. Instruction occurs in Creole, and currently there are only two full time instructors; fortunately students who have graduated from the Midwives for Haiti program are now becoming the program’s instructors and primary preceptors. In order to operate, the organization relies on monetary contributions, donations of medical supplies and medicines, and volunteer support. The volunteers, American and European health professionals trained in the skills of midwifery, work as mentors and teachers to the Haitian students for several weeks at a time. During their stay, the volunteers not only teach in the classroom setting but they also provide extra clinical teaching time in the hospitals. Other volunteer opportunities include serving as midwives with Haitian medical teams that perform deliveries, primary care, education, and prenatal care in local hospitals and mobile clinics (Midwives for Haiti, 2010).

Increasing the number of skilled birth attendants in Haiti is not achieved through education and mentorship alone. The Midwives for Haiti organization pays the salaries of most of their graduates since the non-profit organizations and local hospitals most desperate for their services cannot afford to hire them (Midwives for Haiti, 2010). Through donations and the efforts of volunteers who travel to Haiti in hopes of improving healthcare services in the country, Midwives for Haiti is paving the way to a sustainable improvement in the number of skilled
Haitian birth attendants; it is hoped that this will ultimately decrease the maternal infant mortality of a country plagued by preventable deaths.

**Volunteer Models**

The success of Midwives for Haiti depends upon the American and European health professional volunteers to aid in the advancement of Haitian midwifery student education. Since the organization relies so heavily upon volunteers, it is imperative to understand the cycle of the volunteer process. There are many volunteer models that have been examined over the years and that provide a framework for the entire volunteer process. The basic framework includes recruitment, selection, orientation, support, debriefing, and evaluation (Korngold, Voudouris & Griffiths, 2006; Sachdev et al., 2007). This research project focuses particularly on evaluating the orientation of volunteers, although each step of the volunteer process is important.

**Methodology**

The purpose of this study was to create, pilot, and evaluate the effectiveness of an orientation module for volunteers with Midwives for Haiti. The evaluation of the orientation and the orientation module itself is being utilized by Midwives for Haiti to improve their volunteer program and to equip their future volunteers for work with the organization in Haiti.

**Research Questions**

This project uses a mixed-method research design to ask the following quantitative and qualitative questions:

1. What is the perceived effectiveness of the Midwives 4 Haiti volunteer orientation module?
2. What information is currently lacking in the orientation materials the organization currently uses?
3. What areas of orientation were most important or significant to the participants after traveling to Haiti?

We created a module that would serve as an orientation for volunteers preparing to work abroad with Midwives for Haiti. To create the module, input was gathered from the Board of Executives of the organization and from Dr. Cara Osborne, an executive board member of the organization and an assistant professor at the University of Arkansas. The need for an orientation module was inspired and guided by the research of Barbara Floyd, doctoral candidate at Portland University, whose volunteer work with Midwives for Haiti in 2010 inspired her to remodel their volunteer program. The module was created with the explicit goal of adequately preparing volunteers for their experiences with patients in Haiti.

We developed our online orientation module by first reviewing current research about responsible volunteerism and volunteer models. We wanted to identify the most important items to include in an orientation, stress the importance of the orientation process within a volunteer program, including the necessary components of adequately orienting volunteers, and identify the best method of presenting the orientation to the volunteers. Information specific to the volunteer role with Midwives for Haiti was also gathered; this included logistics of travel, working with translators, developing the daily schedule, explaining the volunteer role, and understanding living and working conditions. There was much discussion about the volunteer role because the organization had grown in many ways, thereby creating a shift in volunteer duties and expectations. The orientation was completed by incorporating as much of the information available into an easily navigable online module.
After the module was completed, it was piloted with two groups of Midwives for Haiti volunteers. All of the volunteers traveled to Haiti during February and March of 2012. They were offered the opportunity to participate in the orientation module with the expectation that they would complete an evaluation of the module upon return from the trip. Participation in the study was voluntary. Those volunteers willing to participate in the study completed the module before their departure and upon return completed a survey evaluating its perceived effectiveness and other aspects of the module. To protect the privacy of the participants, names of volunteers were not recorded and evaluations were completed anonymously.

Data Analyses

Responses to the quantitative data were evaluated using descriptive analyses such as percentage and frequency distributions. Thematic analysis was used for the qualitative data to (a) depict themes found throughout participant responses, (b) identify participant suggestions, (c) note situations in which the volunteers participated that were aided by the orientation, (d) assess the perceived importance of the module, (e) gauge the most important sections of the module, (f) estimate the time necessary to complete the module, and (g) determine the general opinion of the module. The results are reported in the following section and have been utilized to assess the module for its effectiveness, strengths and areas needing improvement, and to make necessary revisions.

The survey is part of a continuous quality improvement effort by Midwives for Haiti to continue revising the module as the needs of their organization continue to grow and change. The survey will be submitted electronically to all volunteers from this point onward, and Midwives for Haiti will update and revise the module based on volunteer feedback and the specific needs of the organization.

Results

Due to the low volunteer volume in spring 2012, there were only three participants in this evaluation project. However, the Midwives for Haiti organization will continue to distribute the evaluation and process the results as part of a continuous quality improvement effort. The pilot study was still beneficial to the research because the participants provided insight into the strengths of and initial alterations needed in the module.

One of the primary goals of the survey was to determine the perceived effectiveness of the module. Two out of three of the participants responded that the module fully prepared them for their trip overseas with Midwives for Haiti. The participants ranked the effectiveness of the module in preparing them for their midwife volunteer activities at a 3, 4, and 5 on a scale of 1-5.

Another goal was to determine which sections of the module were perceived as most important or significant by the volunteers. The packing list, introduction to the mission of the Midwives for Haiti organization, and an explanation of the volunteer role sections of the module were ranked as the most helpful by the three participants. Information about the Haitian culture, what to expect in terms of accommodations, communication, and money, and differences in maternal and childbirth care sections were determined to be less helpful by the participants.

Another primary goal was to determine what the volunteers thought was lacking in the orientation module. Two out of three participants responded that the module took too long to complete. One respondent stated, “It is difficult to move through the sections, and this makes [the module] time consuming.” To navigate between sections, one must navigate back to the front page of the module each time, which could be perceived as an unnecessarily difficult transition. One participant stated they would like to see some sort of test or review at the end of the module to highlight key aspects of the orientation. One participant commented that the
volunteers were expected to be preceptors for the Haitian students, yet the module had led her to believe that they would only be acting as supporters for student learning. She suggested discussing the title and role of being a preceptor in the volunteer role section of the module. Another participant commented that the module should warn volunteers of the need to review basic medical mathematics before their volunteer experience. She commented, “prepare [health care professionals] for TOTAL inability to rely on modern technology, such as review of drip rates, sizes of tubing that calculate drip rates, etc.”

**Discussion**

Based on the results of the evaluation, the possibility of adding a test or a review of the most important aspects of the orientation is under consideration by the organization. The layout of the module is also under construction in order to make it easier to navigate from section to section without having to return to the front page each time. The sections that the participants determined were less helpful will be assessed for modifications and possible ways to make them more significant to the participants. For example, a description of the role of preceptor will be added to the section that discusses volunteer role. While the length of the module will be assessed, it is important to note that the informational detail of the module is deemed more important by researchers than its length. Finally, an emphasis on the unavailability of modern technology to calculate IV drip rates, medication administration, and other medical mathematics in addition to a review of these calculations will be added to the ‘what to expect’ section.

Midwives for Haiti will continue to distribute the module and evaluation to its volunteers as a continuous quality improvement project. The module will continue to be modified as the organization grows and changes. More research and evaluation are needed to determine the ultimate effectiveness of the module and to determine ways in which the module should be altered to better serve the volunteer population.

**Limitations**

The study is limited by the number of participants that responded to the survey. The purpose of this project was to create a comprehensive module and to administer a pilot study to examine its effectiveness. Therefore, collecting data from a larger number of participants would be suggested in the future in order to make generalizations about the effectiveness of the module.

**Conclusion**

The project was successful in creating and implementing an orientation module for Midwives for Haiti. The organization will benefit from more evaluations from future volunteers, and the module will continue to change as the needs of the organization change. The basic framework and information for the module was brought together, and the teamwork utilized in the process of creating the module has created a joint-ownership of the project that will benefit the organization as time progresses.
ELEANOR MANN SCHOOL OF NURSING: Kelly Toner

References


Appendix A

Midwives for Haiti Online Orientation Module

Volunteer Orientation Module

Welcome! You will soon know all that you need to know about your upcoming trip to Haiti with Midwives for Haiti.

This orientation module is split into three goals:
1. Defining your role as a volunteer including what is expected of you, what activities you will be performing abroad, and a quick look at what your role is not.
2. Providing you with information on the logistics of your upcoming trip to Haiti
3. Presenting an overview of Haitian culture to prepare you for interactions with the Haitian people, medical system, and other aspects of your trip.

This whole orientation should take no more than 2 hours and is worth your undivided attention. Let's get started!

Directions:
Please start at the beginning and move through the module in order. You should avoid clicking on “Resources” along the top navigation, but instead choose “Welcome” to access the module topic listing.

You will be asked to fill out a brief response at the end of each section. These responses will serve to verify that you have reviewed the information included in each section.

If you have any questions, please email Sarah Burt.

Part 1: Midwives For Haiti Program Summary

The following background will give you a summary of Midwives For Haiti’s work:

Program Overview
Who’s Who
At least a basic understanding of Haitian history and culture is essential to competent care in the country. Review Haitian Culture, and verify your completion of this portion of the module by responding to the Haitian Culture Journal.

7 Part 7: Resources
- Midwives For Haiti News
- Midwife Contact List
- Luggage Insert
- Supplies Always Needed
- Fundraising Ideas
- University of Kansas Haitian Creole Resources
- Haitian Creole language course

8 Program Overview
- Who’s Who
- Training Program
- Our Graduates
- Mobile Clinic Program
- Future Vision
- Midwives For Haiti’s YouTube Channel
- Program Overview Response

9 Trip Preparation Checklist
- Important Documents Timeline
- Trip Preparation Response

Reference:
Appendix B

Evaluation Questions

1. On a scale of 1-5, rate how prepared you were for your volunteer experience abroad with Midwives for Haiti after completing the orientation module.
   (1- not prepared at all; 5-fully prepared)

2. On a scale of 1-5, rate how effective you think the orientation module was in preparing you for your experience with Midwives for Haiti.
   (1-not effective at all; 5-extremely effective)

3. Rank the effectiveness of the individual sections of the module using numbers from 1-“most helpful section in the module” to 6- “least helpful section in the module”.
   ___ Introduction to Midwives for Haiti
   ___ Your job as a volunteer
   ___ Haitian culture
   ___ Differences in maternal and childbirth care
   ___ Packing list
   ___ What to expect

4. What did you think of the time necessary to complete the module? (Circle one)
   a. the module took far too much time to complete
   b. the module took an appropriate amount of time to complete
   c. the module took a short amount of time, and I wished there had been more material

5. Is there anything you think should be added to the orientation module in order to more fully prepare volunteers for their experiences in Haiti?

6. Is there anything that you think was unnecessarily included in the module that should be omitted in future versions of the module?

7. Any other comments or suggestions?